Urban Resettlement Policies in Cairo: A Case Study of Manshaiat Nasser and Asmarat City

Roshan Abouzied
roshan@aucegypt.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://fount.aucegypt.edu/etds

Part of the Social and Behavioral Sciences Commons

Recommended Citation

APA Citation

MLA Citation

This Master's Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Student Research at AUC Knowledge Fountain. It has been accepted for inclusion in Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of AUC Knowledge Fountain. For more information, please contact thesisadmin@aucegypt.edu.
The American University in Cairo

School of Global Affairs and Public Policy

Urban resettlement policies in Cairo: A Case study of Manshia Natser and Asmarat City

A Thesis Submitted to

The Public Policy and Administration Department

in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Public Policy

By

Roshan Hassanin Abouzied

Under the supervision of Dr. Noura Wahby

Assistant Professor of Public Administration

Fall 2022
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

With my deep sense of gratitude, I would like to express my sincere thanks to GOD for his blessings and for granting me the chance to pursue my post-graduate studies in such a highly ranked learning institution. GOD showers me continuously with his gifts, guides me always, blesses me through this journey, and provides me with faith and strength till I complete my studies.

I would like to thank my parents and family for their everlasting support and care provided during my academic years. I would like to thank my mum for constantly enriching me with care, love, and support, and providing me with insightful ideas, despite her feeling of sorrow and despair after my dad's and her mother's departure early in 2021.

I would also like to thank my dad (may his soul rest in peace) for everything he made in his life journey to make me feel safe and secure and for always being my backbone and life supporter. I will never forget when you drove me to the university and waited until I finished my classes. I promise I will never let you down; I will never forget you in my prayers and for the rest of my life.

My deep gratitude and appreciation are dedicated to my professors, who have assisted and provided me with plenty of analytical and conceptual skills. They inspired me how to feel, think, and have a positive vision of life. They became my role models and gave me a push to have the extra mile in my academic studies.

I want to take this opportunity to thank Dr. Laila el Baradei; her persistent guidance has played a key role in making my studies a success. I would like to thank Dr. Shahjahan Bhuiyan, for providing me with insightful ideas that gave me the opportunity to undertake this research study. I feel honored to be one of your students and proud to have you on my defense committee.

Special thanks to Dr. Noura Wahby for her flexibility, continuous support, and care. She has provided me with all the support any professor can give to her student during the thesis preparation. She accepted my numerous drafts, late submissions, and personal problems that I have faced since my dad's departure. She never felt upset about my numerous excuses and late replies. Yet, this research might have been a nightmare without her tenderness, kindness, and professionalism. May God provides her with all good deeds in her professional and personal endeavors.
ABSTRACT

Egypt has a long history of urban development efforts. These efforts have provided substantial solutions in providing the urban population with adequate housing opportunities, especially those living in slum areas. However, these policies have not offered optimal solutions for all residents of informal areas, and recently governments have resorted to evictions and resettlement as one of the main strategies for removing unsafe informal areas. These strategies have had a diversity of consequences on the urban planning of cities like Cairo and repercussions on community dynamics and community social fabric. Accordingly, this thesis demonstrates the impact and reflects the consequences of resettlement and relocation policies both internationally and in the case of Egypt.

This thesis adopts a qualitative approach and focuses on Cairo as a case study, particularly the policy of relocating Manshaiat Naser dwellers to the Asmarat new housing project. Qualitative interviews were conducted among government officials and experts on informality, representatives working in international organizations, and community members. The findings of the thesis analyze the visions of urban policy makers toward slums, which consider relocation as one of the main drivers of the urban development of new communities. The study also reports on the effectiveness of relocation policies, the adaptability of communities to their new homes, in addition to the perspectives of residents who have been left behind in their old neighborhoods. Thus, this study highlights the degree of sustainability in dealing with the slum challenges, specifically when creating a new urban community. Finally, policy recommendations are suggested to provide a sustainable outcome for relocation projects for the dwellers and the urban environment.

Key words: informality, Cairo, slum eradication, forced eviction, resettlement, displacement Manshaiat Nasser, Asmarat
# Table of Contents

Acknowledgments ii  
Abstract iii  
List of Acronyms vi  
List of Figures viii  

1. Chapter One: Introduction 1  
   1.1. Urban Policies for Informal Areas in Egypt 2  
   1.2. Problem Statement 5  
   1.3. Research Question and Objectives 6  
   1.4. Thesis Outline 7  

2. Chapter Two: Literature Review 8  
   2.1. Overview of Slum Development 8  
      2.1.1. The Challenge of Defining Slums 8  
      2.1.2. Causes for slum formulation 12  
      2.1.3. Policies addressing the ‘Slum’ Problem 14  
   2.2. Urban strategic planning and Resettlement Policies 18  
      2.2.1. Evaluating Urban Intervention Policies 20  
   2.3. International experiences of Slum Relocation and Upgrading 23  
      2.3.1. The Chennai Experience of Relocation and Clearance 24  
      2.3.2. Favelas and Pacification in Brazil 26  
   2.4. Informal Areas in Egypt 30  
      2.5. Literature Gap 33  

3. Chapter Three- Research Design 34  
   3.1. Conceptual Framework 34  
   3.2. Research Methodology rationale 36  
   3.3. Research design and Sampling 37  
   3.4. Data analysis 40  
   3.5. Ethical considerations and Limitations 40  

4. Chapter Four- Contextual Background on Informality in Egypt 43  
   4.1. The historical evolution of informal settlements in Egypt 43  
   4.2. Types of Informal Settlements in Greater Cairo 48  
   4.3. Agencies involved in dealing with informal settlements 49  
   4.4. Overview of Egyptian initiatives addressing Informality 52  

(IV)
4.5. Contextual Background of Case Study Sites: Manshaiat Nasser and El Asmarat 55
4.5.1. Background to Manshaiat Nasser 55
4.5.2. Background to El Asmarat City 57

5. Chapter Five: Findings and Analysis 58
5.1. Policymakers’ Perspectives of Urban Planning in Egypt 59
5.1.1. National Urban Planning 59
5.1.2. Designing the Housing Strategy 63
5.1.3. Implementing Upgrading and Relocation Policies 66
5.2. Case Study Results: Relocating Manshaiat Nasser to Asmarat 75
5.2.1. Manshaiat Nasser: Residents Remaining on Site 75
5.2.2. El Asmarat City: Relocated Residents’ Lived Experiences 87

6. Chapter Six: Conclusion and Policy Recommendations 104
6.1. Concluding Remarks 104
6.2. Policy Recommendations 105
6.2.1. Institutional dimension 106
6.2.2. Regulatory dimension 107
6.2.3. Financial dimension 108
6.2.4. Participatory dimension 109

References 111

Appendices 127
Appendix 1: Interview Guides for Participants 127
Appendix 2: State Approach to develop Mansheyet Nasser 130
Appendix 3: Fieldwork Material 131
Appendix 4: community perspectives on Relocation 132
Appendix 5: comparison between Manshaiat Nasser and the Asmarat project in achieving sustainability: 133
# List of Acronyms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BSUP</td>
<td>Basic services provision program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAPMAS</td>
<td>Egypt's Central Agency for Public Mobilization and Statistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COHRE</td>
<td>Centre for Housing Rights and Evictions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC</td>
<td>Greater Cairo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GIZ</td>
<td>German corporation for international cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GOPP</td>
<td>General authority of urban planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GSDR</td>
<td>Global Sustainable Development Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IRB</td>
<td>Institutional review board approval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISDF</td>
<td>Informal Settlement Development Fund/facility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LAC</td>
<td>Latin America and the Caribbean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LMICs</td>
<td>Low and medium-income countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOHUUC</td>
<td>Ministry of Housing, Utilities and Urban Communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MURIS</td>
<td>Ministry of urban renewal and informal settlements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCW</td>
<td>National Council for Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-governmental organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NUCA</td>
<td>New Urban Communities Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PNA</td>
<td>Participatory needs assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QOL</td>
<td>Quality of life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDGs</td>
<td>Sustainable Development Goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDS</td>
<td>Sustainable Development Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TNSCB</td>
<td>Tamil Nadu Slum Clearance Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UGB</td>
<td>Enforcing urban growth boundaries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN MDG</td>
<td>Millennium development goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations development program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN-Habitat</td>
<td>United Nations of Human Settlement Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WB</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: phases and stages of the urban strategic planning process. Volume 1. An introduction to urban strategic planning. published December 2007.................................................................20

Figure 2: Developing QOL index for resettlement projects of unsafe areas. urban forum 32, 349-371 published on the 14th of April 2021.................................................................21

Figure 3: QOL dimensions ranked according to Maslow’s hierarchy of needs Article in sustainability and environment. May, 2017” .................................................................23

Figure 4: Mapping Informal Areas in Egypt Between the Past Interventions and Next Urban Revolution Faculty of Urban and Regional Planning, Cairo University Journal of Urban Research, V l. 21, Jun2021.................................................................35.

Figure 5: Conceptual Framework .................................................................46
1. **Chapter One: Introduction**

The policy agenda regarding informal settlements is a challenging problem with an accelerated incidence worldwide. The former UN -Secretary-General Kofi A Annan \(^1\) once announced that managing informal areas is considered a controversial issue. Their manifestation requires greater attention, where the need for coherent and effective policies is crucial to find a more secure and sustainable development path. The expansion of informal settlements signifies a universal phenomenon that is correlated with the physical proliferation of spontaneous urbanization and the migration of marginalized communities to urban centers. In recent years, informal settlements have become a global policy issue that has been addressed extensively. The global magnitude of the slum settlements has been an enduring concern for urban practitioners, policy makers, and social, political, and economic researchers.

Global South \(^2\) governments have adopted several ad hoc slum-related strategies over the last 50 years, but efforts have not been sufficient to prevent slum proliferation and create sustainable urban patterns (UN-Habitat,2014). Policy approaches such as complete eradication aimed at removing these areas, but instead of the effacement attempts, the existence of the informal settlements has had an unabated momentum (Marx et al., 2013). According to the United Nations of Human Settlement Program (UN-Habitat), the proportion of the population living in slums in the year 2000 has increased, reaching 24% of the global population (UN-Habitat, 2021). However, 213 million informal settlements residents have been added to the global population since 1990 (UN-Habitat, 2013). This figure has escalated during the past ten consecutive years, reaching 32% of the global population in 2010 (UN-Habitat, 2014). According to the Global Sustainable Development Report (GSDR, 2015), it was announced that "every seventh person worldwide lives in an informal urban settlement, summing up to more than one billion people globally" (Sticzay

---

1 Kofi Annan was a Ghanaian diplomat, served as the seventh secretary general of the United Nations (UN) served from 1997 to 2006.

2 The global south refers to the less developed countries of the world, and in our context are the countries with high incidence of slum formulation. Global south includes, countries in Africa, Latin America, developing parts of Asia, and the Middle East.
and Koch, 2015, p.1). Moreover, the number of individuals living in slum areas has reached 889 million in the year 2020, with an increase by six million each year, and it is expected to surge, reaching two billion in 2030 and three billion in the year 2050 (UN-Habitat, 2014), with a significant concentration in the least developed nations and emerging economies (Barthel, 2017).

Throughout studies of urban informality, the phenomenon of vast urbanization and the existence of informal areas have been an area of concern due to its prevalence in most developing countries and the lack of sound implications of advanced approaches. From Brazil's Favelas, India's prominent Dharavi settlement, and Egypt's Ashwaeyat (Wahby, 2013), these settlements have been attributed to several socio-economic dimensions, whereby poverty, income inequality, and the shortage of adequate housing supply were considered the root causes, which contributed to further informality (Habib, 2017). In addition, it is expected that without the concerted actions of the international communities, national governments, municipal authorities, and civil society, the figures of the informal city dwellers will surge, with increased percentages of urban vulnerability (Sticzay and Koch, 2015, p.16). However, in specific contexts, the expansion of informal settlements has been viewed as a solution devised by the urban poor to face the limited economic resources and bureaucratic control rather than being a predicament that encompasses ambiguous levels of risk. Accordingly, certain international experiences succeeded in strategically addressing the unforeseen causes of slums and mitigating their risks, while other countries are still far beyond finding a suitable course of action to improve the livelihoods of lower-income families (Habib, 2017). To this end, this thesis aims to study these international experiences and discuss the Egyptian attempt to provide better urban conditions for the country’s poor urban dwellers.

1.1. **Urban Policies for Informal Areas in Egypt**

As long as the expansion of insecure housing is a prevailing worldwide phenomenon, Egypt is in no way an exception. It has been tracing the incidence of housing problems preceding the urban tragedy that occurred late in 1992 and still with an ongoing momentum. Over the last century, 

---

3 The least developing countries are a list of developing countries that exhibits the lowest indicators of the socio-economic development. They vary according to different rating systems by World Bank or United Nations institutions.

4 The urban tragedy occurred on October 12\textsuperscript{th} 1992, when high force earth quake occurred casing the collapse of 5,000 building and more than 10,000 families were left homeless. Source: Yehia shawkat: Egypt's housing crisis. The shaping of urban space.
there was a shift from the existence of adequate housing to the spreading of informal areas, which was reflected in the official disclosure defining the situation as a housing crisis rather than a housing problem (Shawkat, 2020, p.2). In Egypt, the informal settlements agenda received much political concern, security, and media attention, especially in the past few years (Diab et al., 2020). In today’s Egypt, the existence of informal areas has intensified, forming a solid urban, social, and economic weave.

Urban growth in Egypt's cities primarily occurs in informal areas, and informal expansion has become integral to Egypt's urban fabric (Diab et al., 2020). The most common and prevailing root causes have been associated with several interlinked dimensions, such as rural-urban migration, poorly designed housing policies, and the lack of legislation and laws dealing with land allocation. Within their extraordinary spatial heterogeneity in various territories in Greater Cairo (GC), it is considered one of the dominant forms of organic urbanization in Egypt, where it commonly exists in the urban periphery, mainly on agricultural or state-owned lands. (Khalifa, 2015). According to 2020 data, 22 million Egyptians representing a quarter of the population, live in slum areas (Reuters, 2020). This data is unsurprising given that Cairo's informal settlements were already a shelter for 7 million residents by the late 1990s (Howeidy et al., 2009, p.15), and it is expected that by 2025, approximately fifty percent of Egypt's agricultural and state-owned lands will be dominated by informal settlements (Kalifa, 2015). Within the roughly 2 percent annual increase of the Egyptian population (O’Neil, 2022), statistics revealed that despite the governmental attempt to seize informality, the urban agricultural encroachment aligned with the illegal construction of settlements has eaten up to 168,000 hectares of agrarian land in the last forty years (Hendawi, 2020). This accelerated number reveals that proper planning and managing urban development in Egypt are required to guide this rapid informal expansion (Khalifa, 2015). Accordingly, this gives a salient proliferation to the urgent need for developing an integrated urban policy that utilizes all the State’s efforts and provides a detailed framework with a clear plan that implements urgent urban priorities.

In the pursuit of achieving the housing and sustainable urban development agenda advocated by the global conference on urban development- Habitat III and the Sustainable Development Goals

---

5 Organic urbanization means the urban encroachment on Egypt's fertile agrarian land.
(SDGs), global standards have created a roadmap for countries like Egypt to facilitate the provision of adequate shelter and infrastructure to alleviate the impoverished livelihoods of slum dwellers (Abouelmagd, 2020). In 2016, the Egyptian government emphasized its responsibility to the ‘New Urban Agenda,’ whereby tailored strategies were issued with the overarching aim of eradicating slums and guaranteeing safe and adequate housing (Habitat III, 2016). Three terms have been associated with the government’s past policies: displacement, resettlement, and eviction. However, how the government has used these strategies and defined these terms has remained unclear in the case of Cairo’s slums and dealing with their inhabitants (Tadamun, 2015).

Similarly, Egyptian policies towards relocation and resettlement varied distinctively, but demolishing squatter areas and forcing community relocations have dominated recent national projects and development programs (Aboulnaga, 2016). Unlike Mubarak's era (1981-2011) during which slum areas expanded and were supplied with facilities in an official manner, the current Egyptian government recovered an assertive doctrine, and various plans are developed to gradually remove unsafe slums and achieve the SDGs (Dentice, 2020). Likewise, calls for developing squatter areas and moving the citizens of Maspiro triangle, Warak Island and Manshaiat Nasser, have proven that Egypt's relocation processes face many obstacles in providing new shelter for slum dwellers and improving communities’ social and economic fabrics. Despite efforts to improve the physical conditions of these deprived areas, current policies have still disregarded the rooted socio-economic dimensions of city dwellers and their right to the city (Boukhari, 2020).

In the same vein, this thesis attempts to analyze Egyptian policies towards dealing with informal areas where a comprehensive assessment is geared to question the adaptability of the slum resettlement policies and their effect on inhabitants. Particular attention is given to relocating Manshaiat Nasser's citizens to the Asmarat complex, a much-famed case study that has set the standard for establishing new urban communities to assist in tackling squatter settlements particularly located in life-threatening locations⁶ (Tadamun, 2020).

---

⁶ Life threatening slum areas, are slums more prone to disasters that threatens life such as slums located under or above sliding geographical location, floodplain, or under the threat from rail way accidents.
1.2. Problem Statement

Although the sustainable urban development approaches have paved the route to lessen the continuity of informal settlements, Egypt has experienced a high incidence of slum formulation. The previous neglect and the absence of proper planning to enforce sustainable urban solutions reflect Egypt’s failure to deal with this urban problem (Abdellader et al., 2022). Nevertheless, informal settlements in Egypt have become a critical urban problem; the severity of the situation was given particular attention in 2008, after the rock slide, which resulted in the death of 120 families in the Dweika—an informal area in the settlement of Manshaiat Nasser (Tadamun, 2020).

Despite the current role played by the government to eradicate what is seen as unsafe locations, the project’s execution was accompanied by a high rate of resistance among the citizens. The policy mechanisms required demolishing the neighborhood and relocating city dwellers to remote locations without considering their social bonds or the possibility of impoverishing their economic situation (Gamal El Dine, 2016). Thus, when a precise analysis was made to compare the accessibility of livelihood resources between the inhabitants relocated to new projects and the inhabitants who remained in the same territory, it was apparent that the policy implemented was solely based on the degree of urban safety rather than prioritizing the livelihoods and wellbeing of the inhabitants (Khalil, 2016).

As such, it becomes necessary to understand the factors that substantially impact residents' livelihoods during the relocation processes and the risk factors that expose slum dwellers to dangers that contribute to the loss of their livelihood capitals. As resettlement policies seem to continue to be part and parcel of the government’s urban policy interventions, it is essential to critically analyze the government’s approach to resettlement and citizens’ perspectives on the relocation program (Patel and Mandhyan, 2014).
1.3. **Research Question and Objectives**

This research aims to understand how government tactics for identifying and relocating slum dwellers are attentive to the real needs of marginalized urban dwellers. The study sheds light on the unaddressed socio-economic dimensions that go beyond the concept of safety and shelter in the existing urban strategic policies. To fulfill the aim, the proposed main research question is: How can urban resettlement policies in Egypt provide sustainable housing solutions to slum dwellers? To answer this question, the research looks at several investigative questions as follows:

- How does the Egyptian government design resettlement policies, and what are the main mechanisms of implementation?

- How have the relocation strategies affected citizens, and what are community perspectives on relocation or remaining in their original homes?

- How do the socio-economic factors of informal settlement areas impact the success or failure of relocation policies?

The research objective is to identify the dilemmas that arise from policies, practices, and interventions aimed at curbing the growth of informal settlements, particularly resettlement policies. Furthermore, it discusses the impact of these policies and programs on the livelihoods of slum residents and identifies the socio-economic dimensions that are impacted by the relocation decision. Ultimately, the research aims to analyze resettlement policies related to informal settlements, urban strategic plans, and slum development projects and to evaluate the existing implementation strategies for slum relocation to identify the pitfalls and drawbacks experienced in the current strategy. The study seeks to provide a set of policy recommendations that could enable a holistic urban strategy that fills in the gap of the previously enacted tactics and aims at improving city dwellers’ living conditions.
1.4. **THESIS OUTLINE**

In an attempt to comprehensively address the research topic, the thesis is divided into six main chapters presented as follows:

**Chapter one** has provided the introductory background to the issue, the problem statement, the research question, and the objectives.

**Chapter two** provides the literature review of the published scholarship on informal areas and slum relocation. It discusses three main themes of defining slums and traditional intervention policies; the rise of urban strategic planning and the measures of effective urban policies, as well as an overview of some of the most relevant international experiences of relocation policies.

**Chapter three** discusses the conceptual framework and the adopted research design. The chapter discusses the research methods, sampling techniques, the characteristics of the case study, data analysis, and the ethical considerations and limitations of the research.

**Chapter four** provides the necessary contextual background to the problem of slums in Egypt. I begin by providing a historical background to the problem of informal settlements in Egypt, followed by the state classification of slum typologies, an analysis of the role of different state institutions in urban development, and finally, an overview of the main slum intervention policies and previous cases of resettlement policies.

**Chapter five** presents the findings and discussion of the data gathered from fieldwork as well as secondary analysis. It is divided into two main sections. The first discusses the perspectives and vision of urban policymakers in dealing with slums in Cairo. The second section illustrates the grounded perspectives of residents in Manshaiat Nasser and those that moved to El-Asmarat complex.

Finally, **chapter six** presents the concluding remarks and the study's policy recommendations. The study suggests a holistic urban planning strategy addressing the regulatory, institutional, financial, and participatory dimensions to strategically address the slums' policy problem.
2. Chapter Two: Literature Review

This section will attempt to provide a broad context discussing the informal settlements and the mechanisms used to ensure inclusive and sustainable slum development strategies. It is divided into three main parts: the first part presents a broader overview discussing slum development. The second part will focus on evaluating urban intervention policies, and the third part will look at specific international experiences, particularly with relocating citizens living in informal areas. These three sections were enriched with various research, policies, and academic articles that previously mentioned informality in their contexts.

2.1. Overview of Slum Development

2.1.1. The Challenge of Defining Slums

The World is experiencing an aggressive level of urbanization. The United Nations (UN) world cities report 2020 announced that by the end of 2050, 68 percent of the World's population will be living in urban areas (UN-Habitat, 2020), and most of the apparent urban sprawl will occur only in the low and medium-income countries (LMICs) (Hu et al., 2017). Generally, most slums are located in and around centers in less economically developed nations experiencing a greater urbanization rate (Khalifa, 2011). Within the experienced global rapid urban growth, the urban population has been centered in the informal urban settlements, and their existence has triggered various social, economic, and environmental implications, particularly in these developing areas (Khalifa, 2011). Moreover, informal settlements have become a significant challenge as illegal informal housing poses considerable pressure in the areas where it is located (Msimang, 2017).

Globally, the concept of the slum is described as the spatial, physical manifestation of urban poverty and intensified inequality (UN-Habitat, 2010). A slum household is internationally deprived of having adequate access to sanitation facilities, sufficient living areas, dwellings' durability, and tenure security (Vahapoğlu, 2019). Likewise, residential inadequacy, exposure to environmental risks, and social isolation are all characteristics of concentrated urban poverty and deprivation, and all are indicators of the living conditions of a slum. Various policies on urban issues tend to focus on slums because of their intuitive appeal to concentrated deprivation in cities (Nolan, 2015). However, according to Robert McNamara, the World Bank's former president, announced that “if cities do not deal with the problems of the slums in a constructive way, they will deal with the cities in a destructive way” (El Fouly, 2017, p. 1). Indeed, policy-makers often
have salient perceptions of what slums mean, but slums have been rigorously defined while integrating various urban services, housing, and tenure dimensions.

Although informal settlement expansion has been associated with various descriptions, the definition of what constitutes an informal area has been interchangeably used across the literature. Since the word ‘slum’ possesses multiple connotations, the term has faced challenges in its definitions, and still, what constitutes a slum is controversial as it inhibits different characteristics in each country where it operates (Khalifa, 2011). They are also determined according to distinguished terms associated with local and regional housing standards, economic conditions, and perceptions (UN-Habitat, 2012).

The term slum refers to several informalities. It encompasses various settlements such as deteriorating inner-cities, congested tenements, squatters, informal settlements, and shantytowns, distinguished by the improvised living conditions (UN-Habitat, 2012). Each of them started, proliferated, and expanded and can range in size from those few huts to numerous permanent residences and can be found in the city or on its outskirts.

Despite their negative attributes, slums are found to be incontrovertible evidence of poor people's ability and resourcefulness to develop rationally and economically innovative shelters without state assistance (UN-Habitat, 2003). Slums also provide low-income households with opportunities to live in the city, engage in economic activities and build social networks. However, these attributes do not outweigh the nuisances and deficiencies resulting from their creation and expansion. For example, it is commonly known that urban growth infrastructural inadequacies in slums are inextricably linked to social and economic deprivations, which frequently include limited access to credit and formal job opportunities and an economic and social exclusion associated with stigmatization and geographical isolation (UN-Habitat, 2003). As a result, they are also a symptom of poverty and economic vulnerability, indicating that those in slums lack the financial resources to meet minimum housing standards (Nuissl and Heinrichs, 2013).

**Operational Definitions**

In an attempt to comprehend and monitor what accounts for slums, the UN-Habitat (2003) has developed the first operational definition and highlighted as follows: a group of households that lacked one or more of the following: (1) permanent housing that protects against extreme climate conditions; (2) insufficient living space; (3) easy access to safe water in sufficient quantities at an
affordable price; (4) adequate access to sanitation; and (5) security of tenure that protects against
forced eviction. However, this definition has been criticized as it was based on quantitative
measures representing typically occurring deprivations at the household level in various slum
typologies (Acioly, 2012). Its intrinsic weakness occurs while not considering the characteristics
specific to the settlement. It also does not examine if the settlement is in an environmentally
hazardous location, nor does it examine the legality and security of land tenure (Acioly, 2012).
Alternatively, the UN has proposed an altered definition to depict the impoverished housing
conditions in slum areas and the violation of housing rights related to the security of tenure
(Mahabir et al., 2016).

Nevertheless, the UN-Habitat (2006) definition did not recognize the experienced level of
deprivation and how it might evolve (Mahabir et al., 2016). However, it was requested to include
the regulatory assessment of whether the abided policies and the existing intervention strategies
are altering the living conditions of slum inhabitants (Mahabir et al., 2016). Furthermore, in a 2008
report, UN-Habitat proposed an enhanced way to better represent the situation of slums by
categorizing slum residents according to the level of perceived deprivation that ranges from
moderately deprived (one shelter deprivation), severely deprived (two shelter deprivations), and
extremely deprived (three or more shelter deprivations) (Khalifa, 2011). These classifications
provide a more accurate image of slum conditions and focus on targeted programs and policies for
more effective upgrading and improvement. However, the definition has been criticized for
inadequately prioritizing shelter deprivation based on the risk they pose to people, as each slum is
categorized by its unique set of associated risk factors. Additionally, there could be a significant
alleviation in the degree of deprivation that slum dwellers experience; however, no substantial
alteration in the slum status can be recognized (Khalifa, 2011).

The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) offer another way of operationalizing the concepts
of slums and the required interventions. Mainly, SDG goal number 11 focused on the proportion
of the urban population living in slums, informal areas, or inadequately formulated human
settlements: "Making cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable by
2030, while also ensuring access to adequate, safe and affordable housing, essential services and
upgrading slum" (Shulla and Kőszeghy, 2021, p.3). Yet, the SDG goals focused on the root causes
of slum formulation while guaranteeing that no one will be left behind (Abouelmagd, 2020).
Likewise, the UN included slums as part of Goal 7 in the millennium development goals (UN-
MDG), and it was assigned to monitor the achievement of target 11, titled "cities without slums," which aims to "Achieve, by 2020, a significant improvement in the lives of at least 100 million slum inhabitants, and putting urban poverty and area-level deprivation on the development agenda (Nolan, 2015). Nevertheless, according to national definitions of 2030, this global call to action emphasizes the significance of alleviating slum dwellers' living conditions (UN-Habitat, 2014) by reducing approximately half of the global population living in informal settlements (Mahabir et al., 2016).

Implementing both the SDG and MDG goals presents a two-pronged challenge. Firstly, it focuses on the necessity of upgrading slums, and the informal settlements' regularization must be prioritized in the agenda of the local and national governments and international organizations. Secondly, it focuses on the necessity of effectively applying the measures that can improve living standards and the quality of life experienced by slum inhabitants. Simultaneously, these governments and organizations must address preventive policies and initiatives to provide accessible and affordable alternatives to the existing slum areas (Acioly, 2007). However, the scope and the degree of improvement required were ambiguous in determining the requirements needed to ameliorate the significance of urban poverty. Consequently, the attempt to comprehend the deep-rooted causes that contributed to the formulation and persistence of this phenomenon is required to accomplish the new urban agenda goals that call for more sustainable and resilient settlements through designing measures and formulating policies that will prohibit their future expansion.
2.1.2. Causes for Slum Formulation

The World has witnessed a crucial milestone, as urban dwellers surpassed the rural population, with more than half of the global citizens inhabiting urban towns and cities (UN-Habitat, 2020). Since the growth of slum areas is taking place at such erratic rates, urbanization has become synonymous with slum creation. Still, this accelerated rate of urbanization and the evolution of slums have been accompanied by diversified determinants that forced the poor to thrive in better living conditions. According to the data disclosed by the UN-Habitat, it has been argued that various trends have contributed to slum formulation in developing areas (UN-Habitat, 2014). Nevertheless, several factors related to rural-urban migration, poverty, low affordability, failing policies, poor governance and corruption, ineffective regulation, and the fundamental lack of political will have contributed to the slum's formulation as a global phenomenon (Menshawy et al., 2011). Besides, the complicated interplay with many socio-economic elements influenced their growth and permanence (Menshawy et al., 2011).

Since diverse factors have forced rural inhabitants to live in urban areas, the lack of economic growth has been linked to the ongoing expansion of slum areas. The rural to urban migration, poverty, low affordability, and absence of access to official markets have been categorized as the primary reason for slum expansion (Jaitman and Brakarz, 2013). Rural unemployment and rapid urban growth have been the main themes of the apparent push and pull factors shaping the thrive of the slum dwellers to find better economic opportunities and obtain basic services such as health care and education in megacities (Mahabir et al., 2016). The rural-urban migration has contributed to the shortage of housing supply, where the governments were not able to anticipate the housing demands of the migrants who were financially unable to find a decent shelter (UN-Habitat, 2014). Nevertheless, the rural-urban migration has incurred overwhelming consequences on the urban centers of developing communities, which lack the tools to support the additional marginalized population and assist them in preserving their socio-economic status dimensions (Mahabir et al., 2016).

Similarly, poverty and low housing affordability have historically been the root of the problem. For example, the increasing demand for land, in particular, has had the unavoidable result of driving up affordable landing processes for the poor, which inevitably affects the opportunity for the poor community to find adequate options that meet their needs (UN-Habitat, 2012). The
inability to access formal markets has forced low-income households to live in dwellings associated with low-quality construction and the absence of minimal service provision. Consequently, this has left the poor citizens with two options: either to settle in territories subject to disasters or to settle in the edges of the town where the accessibility of land is linked with impoverished infrastructure networks and proximity problems in reaching employment locations (UN-Habitat, 2012)

In addition, the shortage of land supply and the limited options in the housing and land markets aligned with the cumbersome planning regulations and the weak implementation strategies have fueled informality and forced the poor to reside in areas unsuitable for housing and prone to natural risks (UN-Habitat, 2014). Moreover, spatial inequality is reflected in substandard services, and infrastructure provision has limited the experienced economic and social flexibility (Habib, 2017). Additionally, the increased demand for state land has considerably affected the land price and dried up the poor's land supply (Acioly, 2014). Consequently, unattainable land prices and the lack of affordable and subsidized housing options have led the inhabitants to be trapped in the vicious cycle of poverty and have pushed poor inhabitants to resort to informal areas (Ridlo et al., 2020).

In the same vein, poor urban governance in many less developed countries is related to the upward growth of slums due to the implementation of centralized, rigid, and outdated urban planning regulations, which do not meet dwellers' housing requirements and disregards slum inhabitants in the planning processes (Abubakar et al., 2019). Besides, the ineffective housing sector management reflects the government's inability to keep up with urbanization due to a lack of resources and corrupt regimes that prohibit them from implementing solid urban planning regulations or strategies designed to prevent slum growth (Mahabir et al., 2016).

The institutional failure in the urban and housing laws and policies has caused the slum phenomenon to exacerbate. Some governments refuse to provide urban amenities to slum inhabitants for fear of increasing the slum problem. In contrast, others frequently deny the presence of slums as they are undermined by urban planners and government officials, who fail to appreciate the importance of including slum areas in the citywide upgrading strategies (Menshawy et al., 2011). These failures add to the toll on squatter city dwellers and limit urban life's immense potential for human development, despite the efforts toward achieving the MDGs, which have alleviated the housing conditions of roughly 100 million city dwellers. Still, international figures
depict a continual increase in the number of slum dwellers (Jaitman and Brakarz, 2013). This continual growth challenges the efficacy of the internationally abided policies and mechanisms designed to provide adequate solutions for slum upgrading and seizing their expansion (UN-Habitat, 2012).

2.1.3. Policies Addressing the ‘Slum’ Problem

The slum has been viewed as a challenge requiring governmental urban planning actions. Early in the 1970s, a global emphasis on upgrading programs evolved with the World Bank's assistance (WB), highlighting a new paradigm for an urbanized world (Ndukui, 2013). Within the "cities without slums" initiatives, a plan has been focused on upgrading the most vulnerable and unserved squatter areas by endorsing targets required to improve the living conditions of vulnerable urban inhabitants that mitigates the risk of reverting to the previously abided standard strategies (Cities Alliance, 1999). Nevertheless, various approaches have been tried over several decades, and there is still no widespread consensus on what defines the need for action or the approach to the slums to be taken (Nuissl and Heinrichs, 2012). Despite the call for an objective assessment of the slum agenda, urban studies have an apparent ambivalence over how the slum phenomenon should be tackled. Therefore, it is helpful to identify the mechanisms practiced limiting the widely experienced slum expansion (Nuissl and Heinrichs, 2012).

Given the high growth estimates for most developing nations, increasing the quality of life in informal settlements is one of the most challenging tasks governments face. Thus, several governments have implemented various initiatives to address the issue of slums and informal settlements. These initiations have revolved around six main ideas that focused on improving the housing and living conditions of slums: ignoring and neglecting slum areas, demolition and forced evictions, resettlement or relocation, in situ slum upgrading, and site services provision of public housing (Patal and Killemelly, 2020).

First, slum negligence was the approach that has predominated in most developing countries. Known as the “lassiez faire approach” (UN-Habitat, 2014). At that time, slums were not detrimental to urbanity but were regarded as a slight urban threat that might ruin the urban fabric (Aboulmagd, 2019). In response, developing and emerging countries started providing low-cost housing programs to respond to the housing demands of the poor rather than enforcing policies that assist in upgrading and integrating slums (Aboulmagd, 2019). Consequently, the program
failed to meet the housing needs of the intended beneficiaries as the vast majority of slum dwellers were not able to materialize due to the public housing prohibitive costs, which were aligned with the low spam of the expected economic development for both individuals and countries (UN-Habitat, 2012).

Second, demolition, eradication, and forced eviction are other approaches adopted when it became clear that neglect will not assist in solving the problem of slum expansion (UN-Habitat, 2014). According to the Centre for Housing Rights and Evictions (COHRE), it has been estimated that between 1998 and 2008, forced evictions affected around 19 million slum dwellers worldwide (UN-Habitat, 2014). This approach was applied in areas exposed to environmental risks or suffering security problems and a high rate of criminality in which residences are deprived of the minimum necessary living conditions (UN-Habitat, 2019). However, forced eviction is available to support government efforts to face the challenges imposed by the informal settlements and slums in an urban context (Rageb and Ashmawy, 2021). Informal areas operating in these impoverished living conditions necessitate the inhabitants' immediate relocation to other residential areas or financially compensated. However, on practical experience, governmental authorities rarely negotiated with slum dwellers. Besides, citizens were not offered a feasible alternative to settle in a proximate community and were not provided adequate financial compensation (UN-Habitat, 2003). Forced evictions were backed by the urgent implementation of urban renewal programs and urban infrastructure construction. This approach did not eliminate slum problems; instead, it relocated the dwellers from the outskirts of cities to the edges of rural-urban cities where access to land was easier and planning control did not exist. The continued spatial growth of cities either caused an infinite vicious cycles of new evictions and the creation of new slums on the outskirts of cities outside of municipal boundaries or hastened this process (UN-Habitat, 2003).

Third, resettlement and relocation have been constantly associated with approaches related to the challenge of slums (UN-Habitat, 2003). It encompasses a variety of strategies based on the thoughts of relocating dwellers into new housing projects and improving the utilization of the lands where slums are housed (UN-Habitat, 2003). In general, relocation and resettlement are a form of upgrading mechanisms where environmental hazards cannot be mitigated, and thus residents are required to move into a less risky location. It involves the provision of public housing in rent or sale; however, it has been criticized mainly for inappropriate housing designs and expensive rental
fees for low-income citizens. Moreover, it has been criticized for utilizing forced eviction and dumping the inhabitants on the peripheries of the cities without considering their rights to inhabit (UN-Habitat, 2014). It was perceived that resettlement is not better than forcible eviction, disregarding the social and economic ramifications of relocating people to remote locations without access to urban infrastructure, services, or transportation. In many cases, the households request returning to their old sites, preferring their proximate location and lower house expenses (Nuissl and Heinrichs, 2013).

Recently, slum approaches have altered their commonly practiced mechanisms, such as benign neglect and forced and involuntary resettlement, to more positive policies dealing with slum upgrading and land tenure. The 1970s signaled a fundamental alteration in the housing policies and the implementation of supportive policies since it became salient that bulldozing or eradicating neighborhoods was neither practicable nor feasible (UN-Habitat, 2012). Accordingly, the World Bank, UN-Habitat, and the United Nations Development Program (UNDP) have adopted the fourth type of upgrading program and site and services schemes (Abouelmagd, 2020). These schemes have been implemented to upgrade social services and infrastructure, especially when finished housing units cannot bridge the housing deficit. Consequently, it was logical to consider improving the existing housing, leaving the substandard housing communities unchanged (UN-Habitat, 2012).

The 1980s witnessed a gradual recognition of the urgent need to introduce new slum-related approaches. Thus, for four decades, many developing countries have embarked on slum-upgrading programs to find answers to the problem of slums (Wiredu and Midheme, 2017). Slum improvement, rehabilitation, or upgrading aimed at improving the housing, services, and infrastructure of the deteriorated slum areas, besides focusing on a wide range of potential interventions that enhance social, economic, and environmental dimensions (UN-Habitat, 2014). Generally, slum upgrading was associated with in-situ development that stresses the provision of basic amenities and guarantees the security of tenure (Aboulmaged, 2019). The in situ upgrading mechanism has been utilized by governments as a much cheaper alternative compared to previous mechanisms. In addition, the in-situ approach depends on the notion that it is economically and socially beneficial to allow residents to stay in their communities and maintain their social ties (Jaitman and Brakarz, 2013). Despite the fundamental advantage of this approach in preserving the inhabitants’ social networks and community cohesion while increasing their living standards,
these mechanisms have faced several short comes pertaining to the affordability of finding the adequate resource needed for project maintenance which challenged their continuity and led to the suspension of various projects (Aboulmaged, 2019). Besides, the approach remained short for carrying out the upgrading initiatives with centralized planning and top-down execution, making it difficult to replicate successful pilot projects (Wiredu and Midheme, 2017). In the same vein, the program has not successfully prevented the expansion or reproduction of slums elsewhere. However, this approach only addressed a small number of existing slums and failed to reach the bulk of those who remained (Aboulmaged, 2019).

As the fifth set of strategies, up to the end of the 1990s, the site and services programs have been implemented in a large magnitude to restore the shortcomings associated with the previously enacted mechanisms and strategically prevent slum expansion (UN-Habitat, 2012). Using the value of natural housing in a formal context, the "Site and Services" concept was introduced as a development strategy to gradually enhance the population's living standards in unplanned areas. This strategy is largely dependent on a sincere collaboration between local authorities and residents who behave as actors rather than recipients. In this model, the function of the government is restricted to the allocation and sale of the land to the beneficiaries at rates corresponding with their income levels. The role of the government also functions to progressively equip the land with infrastructure and services (Tadamun, 2019). They were widely regarded as substantially successful in creating affordable housing for low-income families. In the early stages of the project implementation, many slum dwellers benefited from the program (UN-Habitat, 2012). However, the program has been criticized for utilizing forced eviction and relocating the citizens to remote urban fringes, which worsened the living conditions of the citizens more than they were in their original locations (Jaitman and Brakarz, 2013).

Over the past decades, various techniques and mechanisms have been enacted, but still no widespread consensus on what defines the need for a particular approach to the slums to be adopted (Nuissl and Heinrichs, 2013). Since slum existence is universally viewed as a challenge, there has been a recognition that practical approaches should deal with slums and their underlying socio, economic, and poverty dimensions. Thus, their presence necessitates strategic urban planning, consisting of long-term strategies in which different entities are involved to make informal settlements a part of the urban development plan (Fouly, 2017).
2.2. URBAN STRATEGIC PLANNING AND RESETTLEMENT POLICIES

Within the exponential growth of slums in the developing world, significant strides have been made to prioritize the ultimate goal of urban planning in designing urban areas and creating deliberative contexts to minimize urban inequalities and reform unsatisfactory living conditions (Singh, 2019). Furthermore, the new concept known as “strategic urban planning” has dominated the urban field. It was defined and viewed as a mechanism to enhance the quality of life of slum residences by improving the areas' performance and ensuring sustainability (Khalil, 2012). Therefore, this section focuses on the holistic approach to urban planning that states have turned to as a pathway to improving urban citizens’ lives.

From the local government perspective, urban planning impacts various life elements such as new and pre-existing lands, buildings, roads, commercial spaces, and infrastructure (Baftijari et al., 2007). It also includes designs and regulations that focus on the urban environment's physical form, economic functions, and social impacts (Khalil, 2016). However, strategic urban planning, as a higher level of planning, includes the socio-spatial process throughout a vision, coherent actions, and means for implementation are produced to identify the required areas of development for a particular city or a metropolitan area (De Graaf and DeWulf, 2010). Moreover, urban strategic planning is a dynamic, inclusive, and participatory process that encompasses a set of descriptions that aims to create better community conditions, improve the inhabitant's quality of life, and contribute to the overall development of the city conditions (Baftijari et al., 2007).

De Graaf and De Wulf (2010) identified three core characteristics of strategic urban planning that stress its relevance in the dynamic planning process. First, strategic urban planning recognizes that the environment is a crucial factor and constantly changing. To indulge in these changes, urban planners analyze the environment to determine which opportunities exist that can be capitalized on and which risks may appear that will prohibit the project from attaining its objectives. Second, urban strategic planning focuses on the importance of the stakeholder's participation in the local policy to reach a consensus on policies and create collaborations aimed at proposing, implementing, and assessing projects to develop and administer sustainable initiatives for the city (Baftijari et al., 2007). Finally, strategic urban planning attempts to bridge the gap between planning and implementation by including implementation considerations in all levels of planning.
It aims to balance desires, goals, and practical feasibility, and it emphasizes the necessity of commitment among key players for effective execution (De Graaf and De Wulf, 2010).

Strategic urban planning consists of specific stages; where the first stage is founded on a complete situation evaluation, known as an urban situation analysis. It entails an inclusive consultation process for developing a vision, purpose, and goals, identifying priorities and strategic orientations, and outlining action plans (De Graaf and De Wulf, 2010).

The procedures of sustainable urban development planning and action planning culminate in drafting the strategic urban development plan. The final phase in the strategic planning process is project management and execution, which focuses on translating action plans into tangible initiatives.

The urban strategic plan requires an urban data strategy to ensure the quality of completeness and updated data, which should include data on the social and economic profile, the behavior pattern of people, data on the built assets of the area, and data on environmental and natural resources (Stonor, 2008). Therefore, the urban strategies dealing with slums rely on the target population’s thorough research, including data about the problem’s size and the required analytical studies to discover the potential and the shortfalls needed to implement a comprehensive urban community (El-Fouly and El Aziz, 2017). However, to assure an effective implementation structure, particularly in slum development programs, setting up a specific management program through which duties, timelines, and adequate funding sources are crucial to ensure the project’s efficiency. Moreover, during the various stages of the urban strategic plan, follow-up and maintenance are necessary to ensure the projects’ sustainability and continuance (Ragheb and El Ashmawy, 2021). Nevertheless, Urban planning is no longer viewed as a dimensional process; however, it necessitates that the planning process for development should take place under multi-sectoral planning teams that plan for a comm future of an urban area (Baftijari et al., 2007). The phases and stages are summarized in the figure below to clarify the different responsibilities played in the urban strategic planning process.
2.2.1. Evaluating Urban Intervention Policies

Various strategic urban policies have been utilized to find the ultimate course of action pertaining to the rapidly formulated informal settlements. The criteria needed to develop the impoverished slum areas depend upon the housing situation, population density, demographic characteristics, the extent of infrastructure deterioration, the quality of the services provided, or the locational economic or historical value (Ragheb and El-Ashmawy, 2021). The pursuit of progress and advancement and the attempt to enhance one's living standards and conditions is a fundamental right for all living individuals. Therefore, it has been endorsed in the UN Millennium Development Goals to improve the lives of the World's vulnerable people. It focuses on improving the quality of life of people living in slums by implementing sustainable development goals and providing adequate housing. The term quality of life (QOL) mainly refers to the level of satisfaction with the possibilities of fulfilling the needs of the individuals occupying an urban area (Alvarez and Muller, 2017). The term quality of life also includes socio, economic and environmental determinants, whereas the social determinants frequently include factors like shelter, infrastructure, and access to services and resources. The environmental determinants mainly include the adequate utilization
of natural resources, while the economic determinants assess economic wellbeing, income

Despite the strategies and efforts used to eradicate informal settlements, they continue to arise
inevitably (Moniem et al., 2021). The below model is utilized for assessing resettlement initiatives
and provides remedies that must be implemented to produce positive and sustainable improved
mechanisms. This model is a technical assessment that obtains a set of metrics for improving the
neglected QOL of the unsafe slum in developing countries. The included metrics are particularly
intended to assess the standards of the QOL associated with urbanization and the social, economic,
and institutional requirements of the relocation policies of the unsafe-high risk slums (Moniem et
al., 2021).

**FIGURE 2 DEVELOPING QOL INDEX FOR RESETTLEMENT PROJECTS OF UNSAFE AREAS.**

![Diagram showing the divide of the urban environment into infrastructure, built, and natural categories.](https://example.com/diagram)

*Source: urban forum 32, 349-371 published on the 14th of April 2021. Adopted from developing QOL index for resettlement projects of unsafe areas in Cairo p 365. (Source:Abdel-Moniem et al.,2011)*

The diagram above divides the urban environment into three categories: infrastructure, built, and
natural. The diagram advocated for the principle of urban inclusion, where cities as social and
cultural development centers enable residents to grow socially and economically. As urban planners create cities for people, the proximity of the location and locational adeptness to the citizens must be given special consideration, particularly in the resettlement programs. Additionally, providing support for the small projects adds to the prosperity of the residents' public life, where it represents the genuine interest in combining local economic development with community development (Abd El-Moneim and Galal, 2017).

The social aspects are categorized into equality and social justice, recreation, and safety and security. This aspect stresses the importance of evaluating life satisfaction as an indicator of societal equality. That emphasized the significance of people's self-assessment of their life satisfaction, which reflected their genuine demands and needs. Therefore, paying close attention to social factors contributes to improved QOL by encouraging social cohesiveness and providing equitable chances for all to enable diversity (Moniem et al., 2021).

Poverty, living standard, wealth, and savings have been characterized as the variables of the quality of economic life (Gezahegn and Hesselberg, 2014). Accordingly, it is mentioned that unemployment is a common repercussion of the relocation projects, where viable resources needed to provide livelihoods are threatened by increased commuting expenses and lost economic networks, which were previously practiced as a major source of income at the original location (Moniem et al., 2021).

The institutional aspect was subdivided into four aspects: the right to the city, the right to housing, the right to participate, and efficient management. It has been emphasized "that the right to the city is "more than just giving individual freedom of access to urban resources, but the right to change; to change society through a change of the city" (Harvey, 2008, p.1). In particular, when relating these aspects to slum resettlement policies, prosperity, ensuring individuals' rights, and avoiding deprivation and inequality should be considered in drafting resettlement policies (Moniem et al., 2021). Although resettlement projects focus on providing housing units most efficiently, various governments have not mentioned the minimum standards to ensure adequate QOL and improved livability for dwellers in resettlement projects. Therefore, the comprehensiveness of the proposed index shows the multidimensional nature of resettlement projects and focuses on urban issues. However, to ensure comprehensiveness, the interdependence
of the indicators is crucial to maintaining an adequate standard of human well-being. Accordingly, the following figure depicts the quality-of-life indicators based upon Maslow's hierarchy of needs.

**FIGURE 3 QOL DIMENSIONS RANKED ACCORDING TO MASLOW’S HIERARCHY OF NEEDS**

![Diagram showing Maslow's hierarchy of needs with dimensions ranked from basic needs to higher demand]

*SOURCE: Article in sustainability and environment, May, 2017 “adopted from the physical quality of life benchmark for unsafe slums in Egypt p.3*  

The figure mentioned above reveals that the utilized dimensions are highly dependent on each other and that the quality of urban life encompasses all dynamics and interrelations that exist among the different dimensions where meeting the most fundamental safety, and security demands is a prerequisite for meeting higher needs (El-Fouly and El Aziz, 2017). Furthermore, the connection between the residential environment's physical components and its inhabitants' quality of life is evident, and this link is one of the fundamental foundations for every planning and design activity. Thus, exploring this relationship is a manifestation for urban practitioners and policy makers of a more comprehensive and holistic approach to constructing more sustainable urban settings (European Commission, 2017).

### 2.3. INTERNATIONAL EXPERIENCES OF SLUM RELOCATION AND UPGRADING

Over the last few decades, various determinants have imposed a significant burden on urban areas. As a result, requests for adequate housing have been developed as a global concern, prompting governments and organizations to create housing programs to improve the lives of slum inhabitants (Carvalho and Marques, 2010). Slum development has a long history in practically every city worldwide; consequently, various strategies and human settlement development policies have
been drafted to deal with the proliferation of informal settlements. Globally, interventions to resolve the issues connected with slum growth have emphasized various incremental approaches known as slum upgrading, resettlement, and clearance. In recent years, national responses to informal settlements have changed from negative policies such as eviction, benign neglect, and involuntary displacement to favorable policies such as self-help housing, on-site upgrading and enabling, and rights-based policies. However, as the following section will demonstrate, many countries continue with slum relocation and clearance policies.

2.3.1. **The Chennai Experience of Relocation and Clearance**

India is considered one of the fastest developing countries with several metropolitan cities, like Chennai, Mumbai, Pune, Bangalore, Hyderabad, and Delhi (Sahran et al., 2018). India is expected to surpass China as the largest nation globally in terms of population, where about one in six people on the planet are Indians (Nijman, 2014). According to the 2021 Indian census, 93 million of the Indian population live in slum areas (Das et al., 2021). The overall number of slum residents was 65 million in 2011, up from 52 million in 2001. This amounts to a 25% increase in India's slum population throughout the decade, whereas the total urban population increased by roughly 31% (Nijman, 2014, p.411).

There are mainly three approaches to housing and infrastructure provision for poor people in India: the land tenure regulation program to provide occupancy rights. The second one is the basic services provision program (BSUP), which aims to provide clean water, sewage connection, and electricity to improve the health and hygiene conditions of the environment. The third is the housing construction program, which aims to provide people with housing demands and construct low-cost houses for dwellers. Unfortunately, policies in India lack ground-level verification, which created problems during the implementation due to the failure of an ownership-based policy and the lack of a tenure-based policy. In addition to the failure of policies to supply housing to the poor and unaffordable housing scenarios that have roused due to the lack of policies to click real estate market and grown-up land prices (Prasad and Gupta, 2016).

Slums are a growing challenge in urban India's social, economic, and political fabric, where governmental involvement is required to address slums. Accordingly, the Indian government adopted a policy of relocating slum dwellers to the city's outskirts to create a slum-free city;
however, the adopted policy comprised critiques for not considering the socio-economic
considerations of dwellers and their livelihood and housing conditions (Mustafa, 2019).

In the case of Chennai, it is the provincial and the largest city of the Indian state Tamil Nadu
(Hemavathy, 2017). Due to increased urbanization, industrialization, and population mobility, the
slum population has risen significantly in Chennai and other major towns in Tamil Nadu. In
response, the Tamil Nadu government has adopted several steps to ameliorate the urban poor living
in slums by rehabilitating urban poor living along riverbanks and other undesirable areas. These
measures included the formation of Tamil Nadu state’s slum policy and the formation of the
Tamil Nadu Slum Clearance Board (TNSCB) to act as a nodal agency to implement various slum
rehabilitation and housing program to improve the living conditions of urban slum families
(Hemavathy, 2017). The Tamil Nadu slum clearance act was the first act to address slums in India.
Its initial socio-economic survey in 1971 defined slums as hutting areas with huts erected
haphazardly without proper access, adequate water supply, and drainage arrangements (Saharan et al., 2018). Nevertheless, the Tamil Nadu slum clearance act 1997 emphasized slum notifications
and in-situ rehabilitation allowing eviction as the last option after notification.

According to Tamil Nadu’s deputy chief minister of and the minister of housing and urban
development, a total of 38,000 households were evicted in 2019, making this the greatest eviction
and relocation in the state and the country in recent times (Gheeta and Narayanan, 2019). Surveys
of slum residents in Chennai recognized the importance of their livelihoods considering where
they lived and required that evicted slum dwellers be accommodated so that their livelihoods are
not affected (Kannaiyan et al., 2021). These issues, however, have been overlooked, with eviction
emerging as the dominant strategy during the last two decades. Accordingly, city dwellers have
lost their houses and have been rehoused in outlying resettlement with limited educational
possibilities and social networks. Additionally, dwellers were not officially notified before
 eviction, which led to losing their legal rights, affecting their ability to avail government benefits
and tenure security (Kalyanasundaram and Kosalram, 2021)

---

7 (in India) an official given responsibility for a specific project or task within an organization or
institution.
Nevertheless, the practiced policy has been criticized for lacking meaningful engagement. The decisions to evict were made only by government agencies without considering the stakeholders' perspectives affected by the relocation. The policy has also been criticized for contradicting the right to fair compensation and transparency in the land acquisition, rehabilitation, and resettlement Act, 2013, which stimulates the dissemination of eviction information to involve residents in the decision to evict. However, eviction notices are seldom sent to settlements, leaving people with little way to oppose the eviction promptly (Kannaiyan et al., 2021). Most notably, the policy only requires a social audit two years after relocation, as opposed to conventional international practice, which requires social effect evaluations before eviction (Kannaiyan et al., 2021)

Tamil Nadu vision 2023 further provided a policy of slum-free Chennai. It focused on catalyzing strategic investment in infrastructure to leverage the State's economic growth and secure the benefits of the people aiming to meet the legitimate expectations for ensuring an advanced level of quality-of-life determinants (Government of India, 2014). The focus of the vision was to implement physical and social infrastructural projects to ameliorate the economic situation and make Tamil Nadu the most progressive and prosperous state free from poverty, where all the people enjoy the basic services and live in harmony with the rest of the World (Government of India, 2014). In this perspective, the UN definition of slums differs from others by addressing dwellers rather than slums. The definition does not depend upon a specific population or designated areas, such as the 2001 and 2011 censuses. In fact, it focused on the physical and legal constructions of slums like tenure security and essential services (The Government of India, 2014). However, the magnitude of physical upgrading and advances in tenure security was not matched by an equally significant increase in household livelihood prospects (Minnery et al., 2013). There was no assurance or accountability to ensure that people obtained appropriate basic infrastructure at the resettlement site. There was no information on government norms for the public to consider, nor is there any guarantee that existing problems with resettlement tenements will not continue (Narayanan, 2019).

2.3.2. FAVELAS AND PACIFICATION IN BRAZIL

Since 1950, the urbanization rate in Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC) has continued to grow more rapidly than the capacity of the government tool to respond to the demand for urban services. Therefore, the region was left with high informality levels that led to the proliferation of
slums (Magalhães, 2016). The LAC region is the World's second most urbanized area; the urban population grew from 40% to 70% in forty years, where approximately more than 60% of the urban poor (including extreme poor) inhabit urban environments (Jaitman and Brakarz, 2013). Mass migration from rural to urban areas between 1950 and 1990 has led to a massive increase in the population living in urban centers from 40 to 70 percent, with forecasts projecting that the LAC's urbanization trend will reach 85% by 2030 (Magalhães, 2016). Forced to these challenges, the regional governments have tried several policy approaches; unfortunately, the enacted policies did not adequately respond to the rise of urban populations.

In the case of Brazil, at the beginning of the 20th century, the public policies ignored the tenements and favelas as they were taken as illegal alternatives. Eradication actions were intense in the year 1940, but by 1950, Brazil confronted a rapid urbanization process, which led to the expansion of favelas and irregular accommodations at the peripheries. Since 1960, public policies have contradicted the growth of squatter settlements. Slums were viewed as an urban problem that could be solved through "cleansing actions" of a purely physical kind; most of the slums were demolished, and the residences were relocated to new housing blocks along the peripheries. As a result of pressure caused by this problem, in 1970, the first slum upgrading urbanization policies emerged, bringing infrastructure solutions and other mechanisms corresponding to the traditional demand (Fernandes, 2011).

In late 1980, the return to democracy directed public policies to reconsider slums worthy of being integrated into the city development plan and widened the scope of interventions to include several perspectives and infrastructures. Several municipalities, like Rio-de Genero adopted this approach. In 1988, the "Estatuto da cidada" in the federal constitution allowed the municipalities to use instruments to achieve the social function of property by directly impacting slum policies. These instruments provided an opportunity of dealing with land titling. However, complex problems are still far from being resolved. During 1990, the slum problem accumulated with a limited public policy contribution. Recently, federal financing policies for slum upgrading had introduced the issue to the political agenda (Magalhães, 2016)

Despite the spread of different policies and approaches, severe housing deficits remain where people cannot afford the least expensive dwelling supplied by the market. Except for Brazil and Chile, governments in the region have not managed to scale up housing policies; consequently, the
existence of slums was obvious in how cities have been poorly planned and managed and how ineffectively the housing sector is performing (Ronderos, 2016).

The Brazilian experience has taken a path of direct government provision of social housing combined with slum clearance. Over time, the idea of "favelas" has experienced several conceptual shifts. Accordingly, slum clearance was the optimum solution to the housing crisis since "favelas" were viewed as a dilemma that should be eradicated in any metropolitan area. However, since the 1980s, the concept has taken hold that families should be kept in the regions where they reside wherever feasible, decreasing their already precarious circumstances and mitigating the anger accompanied by displacement. Although interventions were given precedence at times under the government's housing policy, the techniques of removal and retention coexisted for the most part. In other words, slum improvement and the eradication of shacks and families have characterized public social housing operations over the years (Cavalheiro and Abiko, 2015).

However, centralized social housing continued to be unaffordable for the poor, which ended with the collapse of the real estate credit system in the mid-1980. With the intense and rapid urbanization combined with the incapacity of the State and the market to meet the demand for urban services, the Brazilian cities became increasingly segregated into exclusive high households and vast areas of regular settlements and slums. Constrained by the economic crisis and limited fiscal and investment capacity, and despite the absence of a national strategy to upgrade slums before 1990, the government has adopted a cost recovery strategy and implemented pro-market approaches in social programs. However, by the turn of the signs of failures of such policies were noticed. It was apparent that without modifying the national framework policies and resources, most municipalities would not acquire the necessary financial, institutional, and technical capacity to mitigate the challenge of an urban slum (Cavalheiro and Abiko, 2015).

At least one out of three Brazilians lived in underserved urban slums with no security of tenure (Mastellaro, 2016). In Brazil, by 2000, the fiscal and economic foundation allowed the federal government to launch flagship programs designed to redistribute wealth and empower the consumer market. One of these programs was the accelerated growth program (PAC), which injected the resources into large infrastructure programs, followed by my house my life program. PAC- favela have primarily increased the resources and the scope of interventions in social housing and slum upgrading policies. PAC- Favela is based on over half a century of local, natural,
and multilateral expertise in slum upgrading and is compiled with initiatives promoted by social movements and civil society. This approach was implemented for the first time in the LAC region and tackled the qualitative and quantitative dimensions of the housing deficits that had engaged the private sector in developing the new housing. However, affordability for the low-income group remained a challenge (Mastellaro, 2016)

Moreover, the municipality's principal has enrolled municipalities to develop innovative urban policies and programs in parallel with efforts of the national government to encourage community participation increased in early 2000; consequently, it resulted in the development of key processes and structures, including the ministry of the cities in 2003 and the national council of the city in 2004 (Magalhes and Villarosa, 2012). These institutions were also in line with the principle of democratic management. A comprehensive participatory process contributed to the development of important policies, such as the national urban development policy of 2005. Representatives of slum dwellers were involved in the occasion of the national conference of the city, and for the first time in Brazil, the importance of slum upgrading was recognized and incorporated as access to a broader national policy (Mastellaro, 2016). Since 2007, pro-poor investment for slum upgrading was considered in line with national policies as it aimed to address county low-income housing people and support in-situ slum upgrading.

In general, the Brazilian housing experience showed how significant the achievement of the national legal and institutional framework is in ruling urban development and housing agenda, which has directly contributed to building a framework of the slum that has improved the lives of slum dwellers. These changes were attributed to the role played by the social movement summarized in the struggles within the national congress. The changes were also attributed to the political will of key decision-making; and the principle of the democratic management of the city. Consequently, all the citizens should be involved and consulted about all urban interventions that could impact the city and dwellers. Nevertheless, the initialization of urban policies was a significant milestone that must be persuaded and approved to continue by holding to political changes' policy and pragmatic gains.

This literature examined many slum improvement initiatives in order to pinpoint the most significant advantages and disadvantages of informal settlements. Viswanathan (2022) advocated that in India, there were several main goals for slum improvements to strengthen social cohesion and
the quality of life for the poor. However, it was discovered that there appeared to be a disconnect between the policy and the implementation's reality, which was marked by a number of issues: a lack of community input and choice in the decisions regarding slum upgrades. Viswanatahn added, the draw backs occurred during the relocation process ust be avoided. Resettelement should be at the last option and should be held in accordance to the indians human rights.

On the contrary, (Hanner er at.,2013) argued that the slum upgrading in Brazil was different than what happened in India. Hanner added that thinking of policies and proposals for a slum in Brazil, enhanced by the PNA approach, implied establishing a dialogue that integrally addressed social and urban problems. Similarly, the UN-Habitat (2015) announced that the Brazilian experience showed significant achievement in the country's national, legal and institutional framework of urban development and housing agenda. The changes were made possible due to the role played by social movements as well as the accelerated infrastructure programs in brazil (UN-Habitat, 2016).

In addition, Magalas (2016) argued that enabling the national legal framework housing policies in Brazil has helped in promoting a sustainable slum eradication strategy.

The international experiences have proved attempts to achieve sustainability in slum upgrading projects. However, the Egyptian situation of slum management has proved that it is an extremely complicated process to ensure proper replication of success stories even if it proved validity when applied in its context.

2.4. INFORMAL AREAS IN EGYPT

Across the past five decades, authorities in African countries have adopted several interventions to tackle the problems of informal settlements. As one of the African countries with high slum proliferation, Egypt has been at the forefront of slum upgrading and rehabilitation housing efforts.

Forced evictions and resettlement have commonly applied mechanisms to abolish risky slums across Egypt and in Cairo especially. Despite the efforts to provide adequate housing solutions for the urban population living in slums, a high level of reluctance is recognized among the relocated citizens, with a common urge to return to their old locations, the matter which questions the push and pull factors in the abided relocation mechanisms (Ebeed et al., 2018).

There are various morphological perceptions about the state's vision of creating an ideal society, which is currently implemented through the removal of hazardous neighborhoods. However, the stories of the evicted families have been a matter of concern. According to El Baradei (2022), it
is far from providing a decent shelter as a matter of financial compensation; however, it is more interdisciplinary aspects that go beyond what literature can determine (Baradie, 2022).

In recent years, the urban struggles of Maspiro triangle and Warak island citizens are among the prominent examples of resettlement actions happening all around Cairo (Wahba, 2020). Reflecting on the historic neighborhood of Maspiro triangle, it was among the area deemed unsafe with unsustainable living conditions. As narrated by Shimaa Magdi, the location has been a source of tension among government officials and citizens who demanded abandoning the location for development purposes (Magdi, 2021).

Maspiro triangle residences were given the opportunity to choose between financial compensation or being relocated to the Asmarat project (Fazza, 2020) However, the community rejected the proposed project to relocate the citizens against investment projects. Demonstrations of the proactive citizens have raised the slogan of "yes to development, no to forced evictions," and disservice forced evictions and relocations imposed by the government have been highlighted. Magdi(2021) added that the relocation decision negatively affects the considerable percentage of the citizens who live and work in the location, where the relocation decision involved no community involvement in the decision-making process.

Wahba (2020) reported that understanding the emotive attachments individuals had to the neighborhood presented one of the difficulties in researching Maspero. In the instance of Maspero, the neighborhood's residents formed emotive ties based on the neighborhood's materials, encroachment, and social networks, but the reasons are beyond what a new housing unit can offer (Wahba, 2020).

According to Abounaga, Badran and Barakat (2021), the complicated history of Maspero Triangle offers challenging concerns with significant policy ramifications. These include the probability that locals may oppose development initiatives and refuse to cooperate with government plans, as well as the possible effects of reversals of participation efforts on future attempts at inclusive urban planning and development. However, the Maspero situation the redevelopment project shows that practically all of its characteristics, with the exception of safety, have been disregarded (Abounaga et al.,2021)

In the same vein, the Warrak island has gained much fame over the past two weeks after the government’s efforts to evict the island's population to make way for a massive development
project that would turn the island into a posh premium enclave (Tabikha, 2022). Similar to Maspero Triangle, the residents of Warraq Island have organized demonstrations, outlining their positions on the heated arguments with security officers who were employing force to carry out the evictions on the island, attempting to promote the interests of the local people (whaba, 2020). In an official statement, the Egyptian housing minister denied allegations that security forces had used violence during eviction operations and said that the development plan was a crucial step in the fight against unsafe housing in Egypt.

On the other hand, the deputy head of Egypt's social democratic party announced that the island had been treated as a legal settlement in Cairo; however, its inhabitants are now forced to watch the legality of their homes revoked and their way of life altered (Tabikha, 2022). Nevertheless, urban analysts admitted that the requirements of capital gain in Egypt are prioritized over the needs of the vulnerable population (Michaelson, 2017).

In sum, the displacement of residents has proved its relevance in the current Egyptian political, social and economic realm. The evacuation of Manshait Nasser district and the allocation of its residences have been among the viral cases. Nonetheless, Magdi (2018) concluded that slum resettlement projects were a form of political propaganda that had nothing to do with enhancing its citizens' quality of life (Magdi, 2018). Through examining the opinions of the resettled families, it became clearer that the project achieved the highest values regarding the availability of playgrounds, accessibility to public transportation, safety, and security features, and walkability. However, both received low scores in terms of housing efficiency and socioeconomic situations.

The new projects missed the development dimension in relocation plan performance because they concentrated on urban morphology criteria while ignoring socio-economic factors. Since then, there have been no notable achievements in life (Magdi, 2018). Moreover, Abdel Moniem (2020) added that the success of rehabilitation policies for slum areas depends on four main aspects: the first one is the community participation aspect. The second is to provide housing opportunities according to inhabitants' requirements. The third one comprises the importance of the provision of socio-economic training programs for building capacities. The fourth one is related to the enhancement of governmental performances.
To conclude, no one can deny the government's efforts to ensure that slum residences are relocated into safer locations. However, a better balance should have been there between the urban safety on one side and the economic, social, and cultural dimensions on the other (Hafez, 2021)

2.5. **Literature Gap**

From the preceding literature review, it is clear that urban scholars have documented various empirical improvements arising from internationally implemented urban policies. In the case of relocation strategies, scholars have focused on the improvement in housing conditions and adequate infrastructure for resettled households. However, few studies highlight the extent of loss of livelihood resources induced by the resettlement policies and incurred by the relocated citizens. Likewise, an aggregate assessment of the situation has almost ignored the complex and interlinked socio-economic dimensions associated with resettlement in these areas and what it means to begin creating community bonds and a complex social fabric from scratch. Since resettlement and displacement projects seem unavoidable in today’s Egyptian context, concerns have been raised in terms of the repercussions of these policies on the marginalized urban community. Besides, despite the magnitude of the current resettlement policies in Egypt, limited case studies have been carried out to portray the impact of resettlement policies on the livelihoods of informal settlement dwellers. Therefore, the research attempts to fill the gap of previous studies that presented the situation from an urban perspective and address the socio-economic dimensions in determining an enhanced quality of life for marginalized citizens.
3. Chapter Three- Research Design

3.1. Conceptual Framework

This section will discuss the conceptual framework used for the study. The study aims to evaluate the implementation of relocation policies in Cairo and reflect on strategic urban planning regarding slums. Two sets of variables have been extracted from the literature review to construct the study's conceptual framework. The given diagram provides the conceptual framework that combines the theoretical reflections from the literature with the realities of the status quo from this research’s findings.

The first set of variables has been discussed in section 2.2 of the literature review, which details the updated requirements of urban planning policies that incorporate the main constituents of the Quality-of-Life theory. Three four main variables are: first, the urban environment, which includes infrastructure, built environment, and natural environment; second, the social aspects categorized into equality and social justice, recreation, and safety and security; third, economic aspects, including poverty, the standard of living, and wealth and savings; and finally, the institutional aspect was subdivided into four aspects: the right to the city, the right to housing, the right to participate, and efficient management (Moniem et al., 2021).

The second set of variables has been identified from the literature that specifically focuses on the Egyptian cases of relocation policies, despite the exerted efforts to maintain the growth of informal areas, which highlighted that the magnitude of informal urbanization proves that the outcomes of these exerted efforts are still far beyond achieving their targets.

Similarly, international experiences have pointed out that relocation policies are vital to building the capacities of households and communities rather than building houses. Silvia Habib (2017) added that the international practices showed that engaging the targeted community and improving their awareness is crucial for successful intervention. The problem of mistrust between the governments and the inhabitants should be considered, noting that social and capital networks are pivotal to avoiding the risk of social disintegration (Habib, 2017). In addition, it was suggested in various academic studies that social and cultural support is crucial to be provided throughout utilizing the governmental assistance to the inhabitants of the slum areas. In addition, it was found that sustainable approaches positively impact many aspects and contribute to integrating the
informal areas into the city as one entity. Community participation is considered to be one of the steps to meet the needs of inhabitants and ensure satisfaction (Saad et al., 2019).

Figure 4 (Source: Conceptual Framework adopted by the author)
3.2. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY RATIONALE

This research uses qualitative data analysis to provide an in-depth grounded analysis. This qualitative approach is used to comprehend human perspectives and evaluate human behaviors, which entails a deep understanding of the citizens' attitudes, beliefs, experiences, and impressions towards relocation policies. The qualitative approach opens a new dimension that enhances the involvement of the participants with whom they share their life experiences and highlights the encountered benefits and harms, particularly regarding the social and economic dimensions of policymaking. Therefore, it facilitates understanding the perspective of different stakeholders, which is crucial in comprehending how the policy is formulated and the impact of resettlement on citizens (Pathak et al., 2013).

In the same vein, the thesis presents the case study of relocating the citizens of Manshaiat Nasser to Asmarat neighborhood. According to Yin (2009, p.3), the case study is a "method that allows investigators to retain the holistic and meaningful characteristics of real-life events." It is also one of the insightful qualitative research methodologies that provides an in-depth empirical exploration that assists in identifying the crucial factors needed to build relationships and power dynamics (Rashid et al., 2019). Moreover, the use of this case study helps to provide an apparent synthesis of the embedded patterns of the site and assists in understanding why the relocation policy, in particular, failed to meet the required socio-economic goals (Goodrick, 2014).

The case study selection is based on the accessibility of visiting the required locations and observing the city dwellers' situation and quality of life. Also, the availability of resources and data collection were easier to provide measures according to the degree of satisfaction of city dwellers experienced living in new locations and how efficient government intervention was in tackling the root causes and solving citizens’ problems.

The key points for conducting this case study are based on two reasons: First of all, Manshaiat Nasser has been a policy priority of the government since the “El Deweika” rock slide, and it also incorporates the four levels of risk identified by the Informal Settlement Development Fund (ISDF) in one area. Secondly, the case study provides an insightful example of the area whose residents were relocated as a solution given by the government to eradicate unsafe areas. Consequently, it assists in considering the degree of governmental intervention in tackling hazardous slum situations, while it also helps to detect the degree of acceptance among the
relocated citizens and the others who remained in the same place. This provides the data with an added layer of complexity and overlapping experiences between the two research sites.

3.3. **RESEARCH DESIGN AND SAMPLING**

The thesis adopts two main methods: in-depth interviews and the content analysis of secondary data.

*In-depth Interviews*

First, the inductive qualitative approach includes in-depth interviews among research participants from different cohorts. In pursuit of conducting an in-depth exploration, the interviews were undertaken to get in touch with distinct participants' ideologies, individual experiences, and relationships pertaining to relocation (Creswell, 2013). The interviews allowed participants to thoroughly express their point of view, which is backed by their professional or personal experiences, to discover patterns that emerged after the thoughtful interpretation of empirical data. Additionally, it creates a broad understanding and identifies various untackled determinants aligned with resettlement which was not previously highlighted or reported in the official documentation (Rashid et al., 2019).

This study relied on a purposive sampling approach. The researcher grouped different participants according to pre-selected criteria relevant to the stated research question. This approach facilitates collecting qualitative replies, resulting in deeper insights and more precise research results (Seetharaman, 2016). Furthermore, when interviewing the city dwellers, the snowballing technique was used to add more volunteers to the residents’ sample. Yet, the dwellers' sample is kept small to eliminate redundancy as their perceptions regarding the encountered advantages and disadvantages were similar, resulting in an early saturation point.

The selected sample aimed at generating an in-depth idiographic situational analysis of the proposed research topic. Semi-structured interviews consist of 6-to-7 open-ended questions as part of interview guides that were previously prepared, and most interviews were held for a duration of 30-120 minutes (Appendix 1). Most of the interviews were held in person, and some were conducted over the telephone due to COVID restrictions. Most interviews were recorded on my telephone, but the names of participants were held anonymously, and records were maintained as per the participants' request to reflect ethical considerations. A total of 16 interviews were conducted among six top-tier governmental officials, one local administration representative, two
members currently enrolled in international organizations and one non-governmental organization (NGO), and three citizens in both Manshaiat Nasser and Asmarat city. Two field trips were conducted to the two research sites. All interviews were completed in one day for each trip.

**Officials and policymakers**

The conducted interviews utilized a semi-structured interview guide designed for three distinct categories of participants. The first set of interviews was conducted among government employees/experts with considerable experience in shaping informal upgrading policies of informal settlements. The first categorization includes: one unit head at the Informal Settlements Development Fund (ISDF), two representatives working at the General Organisation of Physical Planning (GOPP), one member of the Egyptian parliament, one employee working in the National Council for Women (NCW), one former academic and institutional design consultant at the Ministry of Planning, Monitoring and Administrative Reforms, one urban expert from UN-Habitat and one employee the Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit known as the German corporation for international cooperation (GIZ) were interviewed due to their practical experiences with international agencies. In addition at the local level, the researcher was able to interview the municipal head of El-Asmarat settlement, which gave insights into the local government development in the area.

A total of 9 interviews were conducted with these officials, experts and policymakers. These interviews were conducted to comprehend the strategic planning and policy design process behind the resettlement policies, as well as the role of the government and specialized institutions in dealing with slums in Egypt. In addition, international organizations with a long history of intervention in urban planning were included to highlight their roles in assisting the government in responding to the SDGs in eradicating unsafe informal areas and providing safer locations.

**Manshaiat Nasser and Al-Asmarat Residents and Civil Society**

In the second set of interviews, all the information were obtained while maintaining narrative walks and questioning local citizens living in Manshaiat Nasser, particularly for consecutive decades, and participants relocated to El-Asmarat city. Families filling the mentioned criteria were asked to assess the socio-economic demographic factors, the strengths and weaknesses in their locations, the government efforts in these locations, and their impression of these policies. The
rationale behind these interviews is twofold: first, to comprehend the governmental attempts in the relocation process and to conceptualize the degree of efficiency in addressing socio-economic factors. The second goal was to gather diversified data that analyze the level of intervention pertaining to the slum agenda that inevitably considers the socio-economic opportunities or constraints carried by real-life experiences. For each site, three interviews were conducted with local residents in each location, therefore a total of 6 interviews with citizens.

In the third interview set, one official working in an NGO in Manshait Nasser was interviewed as local philanthropic institutions geared toward slum dwellers' collective benefits. They provide tailored services that help to reduce urban poverty, improve service delivery, and assist the government in achieving its development strategy. This interview enabled the researcher to understand the local civil society's attempts to manage some of the issues emerging from slum development. The researcher interviewed a representative of one NGO in Manshait Nasser, but it was difficult to find an NGO working in El-Asmarat. However, the NCW representative provided information on the civil society in the new settlement.

**Secondary sources and content analysis**

The second research methodology adopted by this study is the use of content analysis to analyze secondary data obtained from the field, including reviewing previous studies, relevant publications, accredited documents, and internal reports of international and governmental institutions. The publications and official documents are introduced in order to comprehend the phenomena of informal settlements and analyze the various academic debates and government solutions to the challenge of informal urbanization.
3.4. DATA ANALYSIS

The data analysis for this research was based on "inductive content analysis," or "open coding," and is used to enhance the interpretation of the verbal-oral information given, where no predefined set of codes exists. In fact, major themes emerged as a result of the systematic categorization of the transcripts. Interview text segments were coded directly from the responses, allowing the creation of segments on a certain theme to occur organically (Thomas, 2003).

3.5. ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS AND LIMITATIONS

In this qualitative research, ethical questions were important to think through due to the direct contact and the investigation of vulnerable groups (Arifin, 2018). Maintaining ethical principles assures that the research is conducted without dishonesty or intent to hurt the study participants or any member of society (Shaw et al., 2019). Since the research is highly dependent on human participants, all conducted interviewees were held immediately after obtaining the Institutional Review Board (IRB) approval. In addition, all ethical considerations were maintained when conducting the interviews and generating the primary data. Research participants/interviewees were fully aware of the research topic and had the right not to respond to any interview question if found intimidating or threatening their safety. They also had the right to exit the interview when needed. More importantly, the participants' names were held anonymously, and all the information was audiotaped, transcribed, translated, and stored confidentially. After the designated data collection period, all the audio records were encrypted.

In order to maintain an advanced level of validity in the research, the manuscript's findings were presented throughout, disclosing the individuals' concerns and highlighting the governmental initiatives under scrutiny. Method and data triangulation were mainly used to maintain subjectivity and neutrality and ensure that the study was genuine and error-free with no unverified or plagiarized data. Method triangulation was involved while using diversified interviewing methods, including (face-to-face interviews, phone interviews, conference calls, and zoom meetings), and this has assisted in highlighting any biases that might occur throughout asking additional investigative questions. Data triangulation was mainly applied when examining data from different respondents, so this has helped highlight similar patterns and identify the contradicting areas. Yet, being unbiased when managing and articulating sensitive topics has assisted in gaining credibility.
that affects the positionality and builds trust among the participants that the study is conducted on their behalf, where neither conflict of interest nor financial gain was acquired.

While conducting the research, several limitations were encountered. First, safety issues were one of the obstacles faced when maintaining the field visit, particularly in Manshaiat Nasser. Manshaiat Nasser encompasses various risky areas with a high probability of an urban crisis. Areas above the Mokattan area were the hardest yet the riskiest part of the field visit. The roads were not accessible, and it was hard to use a vehicle there. In the least developed areas located above the mountain, the leaked sewage and accumulated garbage were one of the issues threatening safety standards during the pandemic.

Secondly, when conducting in-depth interviews with different sectors, certain discrepancies arise, especially when conducting interviews with governmental representatives and city inhabitants. The interviewees responded from their personal interpretations and defended their points of view; thus, certain biases were apparent. For example, governmental representatives were supporting their policies and strategies, and there were certain essential questions that they refused to answer, and consequently, it was substituted with other questions. Also, citizens' views were often very emotive when expressing their feelings regarding their living conditions with regard to the government's intervention or non-intervention. These emotional perspectives are essential for qualitative research, but the researcher also used triangulation methods (previously discussed) with other primary and secondary data to build a more comprehensive picture of the implemented policies.

Thirdly, this research is based on a relatively small sample that does not represent the whole community. Access to the community at the local level proved more difficult than was initially anticipated. Also, when conducting the interviews with city dwellers, the information provided was clearly repetitive after the first few interviews, and consequently, the citizens’ sample was minimized to reduce redundancy. However, these interviews represent the first look at community perspectives to counter the more in-depth interviews held with policymakers. Interviews with policymakers were extensive in the intricate details of urban policy making, and the grounded perspectives were employed to reveal what citizens genuinely think of the policies and their implementation. Although this type of citizen feedback is limited, residents were contacted randomly during local narrative walks, increasing their responses' validity.
Another limitation was faced when trying to contact the NGO operating in Asmarat project. This NGO was suggested by the head of the Asmarat administrative unit as one of the most effective entities working in the location. I was provided with their mobile numbers, but I faced difficulties in reaching them. After various trials, they never answered their phones and never responded to their emails. Accordingly, the NGO was substituted with a governmental entity, which was exerting a pivotal role in alleviating the living standards of the relocated inhabitants of Asmarat. However, I had the opportunity to interview an employee working in the NCW who was responsible for providing socio-economic awareness programs for the elderly, disabled, and female breadwinners in Asmarat.
According to Egypt's Central Agency for Mobilization and Statistics (CAPMAS), Cairo's inhabitants reached 25.36 million in March 2022, whereas Egypt's total population reached 103 million (CAPMAS, 2022). It is not simply its physical size or the number of inhabitants that adds toll on Cairo's status as Egypt's capital city (Howeidy et al., 2009). However, Cairo's economic and political life is also centralized. Egypt's governorates are administratively divided to 27 governorates (UNICEF, 2018). Nevertheless, around 65% of the population is concentrated in Cairo and Giza (Abdelkader et al., 2021). While according to the UN-Habitat report III of 2016, it was expected that over half of the city's residents will live in informal areas by 2030 with an accelerated human settlement growth contrary to the land development plans (UN-Habitat, Report III, 2016).

Cairo includes 100 informal housing communities, which house over 70% of the city's population and comprise about 44% of the area built in the city (Donnell, 2010). In addition, the UNDP and the GOPP declared that informal settlements occupy more than 60% of GC's area, reaching 40% of the total number of inhabitants in informal areas (Hegazy, 2016, p.3). Thus, it is clear that inhabitants’ profiles implicate a wide spectrum of socio-economic classes, reflecting the accessibility of various opportunities located in the capital (Hegazy, 2016, p.3).

Therefore, Egypt is viewed as a country of two speeds, with a gap between the fast-paced city and the slow pace of rural and pre-urban areas (Howeidy et al., 2009). The failure of the Egyptian government housing policy to offer affordable and adequate housing, a significant number of Cairenes has led to building homes either semi-legally or illegally on privately owned or public lands. The State, society, and many academics claimed Cairo as a dual city, including a planned one regulated by the state and another unplanned slum, and thus made Cairo a city of both formal and informal perspectives (El Mouelhi et al., 2015).

This chapter is divided into five main sections that discuss the historical development of Cairo’s urban spaces, the classification of slums in the city, an overview of policy initiatives to address slums, the agencies involved in urban development processes, and a contextual background to the main sites of the research’s case study.

4.1. THE HISTORICAL EVOLUTION OF INFORMAL SETTLEMENTS IN EGYPT

Informal settlements have been one of the most controversial aspects in the Egyptian context. In Egypt, the spontaneous and poor urban areas are known as "Ashwaeyat," which means randomly
constructed, chaotic buildings and illegal constructions. Accordingly, the term "Ashwaeyat" became an Egyptian synonym with interlinked historical, political, and economic connotations (Ali, 2020)

The progression of the informal settlement phenomenon started during the 1950\textsuperscript{th} of the last century (El Maabady, 2015). The incidence of the Ashwaeyat began just after World War 2, and it began to prevail during the 1960s. To better conceptualize this issue, the contribution of both the political and macroeconomic driving forces in the housing provision context is worth mentioning. Before the 1952 revolution, housing provision was supplied by both the formal and private sector, after 1952, the former president "Gamal Abdel Nasser" implemented rules to enforce social justice, and Egypt's urban growth expanded under the socialist government. The public sector played a crucial role in the housing provision process as the government considered itself the preface of development that had a significant effect on the urban expansion of Cairo in the last five decades. Moreover, the laws gave the residents more rights over their rents and limited the power of the property owners. These laws diverted the real estate market from rental housing to ownership housing. Owners stopped investing money in maintenance, and therefore middle-class, and low-income families were pushed to informal urbanization, which occurred on agricultural land (Kenawy, 2007). One more aspect contributing to the evolution of the informal settlement issue was the shift in the economy towards industrialization, as excessive industrialization during 1960 created employment opportunities, which increased rural-urban influx to greater Cairo and other urban cities (El-Rahman and khateeb, 2016). Additionally, the State's conversion from an agricultural-based to a service-based economy made greater Cairo an attractive location for rural migrants, the matter which in turn imposed an additional housing problem, especially because the housing policies at that time were inconvenient in supplying houses to address the exaggerated urban housing demand (Abouelmagd, 2014). In the same vein, difficulties in obtaining land registration fees and receiving construction permits, the absence of comprehensive urban planning, and the execution of construction violation laws were all housing predicaments that forced dwellers to rely on self-made housing solutions (Hussein, 2015).

From 1967 to 1973, public housing construction was restricted as financial resources were directed to fulfill the military requirements during the war against Israel. The private sector in this period provided only luxury units for upper-class segments with more options of direct purchase rather than rent. Consequently, the low and middle-income class found the informal sector the
ultimate shelter that fulfills their housing needs (Khalifa, 2015). After 1973, under the rule of former president ‘‘Anwar El Sadat’’, Egypt witnessed a new direction of the "open-door economic policy," which transformed the State from a state-controlled economy to a liberal market economy which in turn affected the housing policy and ended up by a share of responsibilities between the State and the private sector. However, the State maintained the rental control policy, which disengaged the private and public sectors from rental housing (Khalifa, 2015).

From another perspective, during the oil boom era, the Egyptian workers who returned from the Gulf states found that informal housing was the only way to invest their savings, where options provided by the public sector were neither sufficient nor affordable (Khalifa, 2015). Yet, the planned housing sector was not affordable, and only informal houses were left attainable. Hence, a huge gap existed between the supply and demand of houses, and accordingly, the informal sector became the only affordable solution for the low and middle-income classes (El-Rahman and Khateeb, 2016). Consequently, the informal urbanization started forming a new community with a relatively distinct socio-economic condition that later became predominant in the urban life inside the newly formulated informal settlements (Azouz, 2015)

During the era of the presidency of former president ‘‘Hosni Mubarak’’, particularly in the 1980s, informal areas became an urban norm ignored by the creation of formal regions and the development of new urban communities. However, at this time, the creation of new informal settlements was less prevalent. In fact, the growth of the existing slums has not slowed down despite the government's pervasive measures that seize illegal urbanization and forbids encroachment on agricultural lands (Azouz, 2015)

Between 1989 and 1996, an increase in population rate in informal areas reached 3.4% per year, compared to 0.3% for legal areas (Khalifa, 2015). Accordingly, the State began to pay attention to implementing a program to upgrade informal settlements and reform the national housing policy (Hegazy, 2016). However, the magnitude of the housing reforms in this era was diminishing on a large scale. Several pilot projects were conducted without creating a holistic urban strategy that properly addresses the newly formulated urban challenge or lessens the substantial housing supply and demand gap (Hegazy, 2016).

By 2011, the political unrest that had raised the slogan" better living conditions, freedom, and social justice" was a turn for urbanization and many other sectors in Egypt. However, informal
settlement residences succeeded in putting a burden on the State to recognize their rights. Nevertheless, like many other Arab spring countries, Egypt still faces economic, political, and security fluctuations that require concrete intervention to find feasible solutions. (Khalifa, 2011).

**FIGURE 5 MAPPING INFORMAL AREAS IN EGYPT BETWEEN THE PAST INTERVENTIONS AND THE NEXT URBAN REVOLUTION**

(Source: Abdel Rahman and Khateeb, 2016)

the government’s approach to informal areas for decades rejects the broad implications of Egypt’s future. Nonetheless, during the current rule of President Abdel Fattah Al-Sisi, the agenda of informal settlements Ashwa'yat has been given particular attention (Flahive, 2018). The current presidential initiation encompasses various programs, including *Decent housing* and *Hayah karimah* programs. The programs aim to establish housing units for slum inhabitants to guarantee safe and decent housing and to improve the citizens' quality of life through finding urban solutions complemented with social and economic dimensions to decrease multidimensional poverty and unemployment rates (NCW fact sheet, 2014-2021). Accordingly, in 2018, President El-Sisi announced the slogan "Egypt without slums"- Egypt will be free from" Ashwa'yat." Under the presidential decree 1252/2014, the Ministry of Urban Renewal and Informal Settlements (MURIS) became the institution responsible for implementing the constitutional article (Tadamun, 2019). Accordingly, housing article number 78 of the Egyptian constitution has been created, which states:
"The State guarantees citizens the right to adequate, safe, and healthy housing, in a manner that preserves human dignity and achieves social justice. The State is also committed to developing a comprehensive national plan to address the problem of slums, which includes re-planning, providing infrastructure and facilities, improving the quality of life and public health, and ensuring that the resources necessary for implementation are provided within a specified time period. All to achieve public interest, improve citizens' quality of life, and preserve future generations' rights." (Sim and Abdel-Fattah, 2020, p. 11).

Furthermore, the situation of Egyptian slums has called for the urgent need to formulate a universal slum definition to facilitate addressing the problem (Khalifa, 2011). Accordingly, informal settlements were defined as:

"These settlements are a hotbed for social ailments: poverty, alienation, crime, and urban dislocation. They are inhabited by rural immigrants, illiterates, the unemployed, and those who live on the margins of urban life. Residents of these settlements are categorized as urban marginalized since they geographically settle on the city's outskirts and are subsequently deprived of all public services. Their marginalization further exists on an economic and social level." (Abdel Rahman and Khateeb, 2016, p. 11).

Despite the governmental initiation to eradicate slums, the abided rehousing strategies, policies, and activities have been criticized for not properly implementing the "how to deal model" (Goussouns and Tayoun, 2020). Thus, the comprehensive definition necessitates the inclusion of the interlinked socio-economic forces; therefore, it widened the debate pertaining to the crucial policy instruments that should be directed to find comprehensive solutions to the problem of the slums.
4.2. TYPES OF INFORMAL SETTLEMENTS IN GREATER CAIRO

The Ashwaeyat first occurred on privately owned agricultural land, mainly in the west of Cairo's urban fringe. Those who could not afford the purchase of agricultural land moved to state-owned land as a form of land seizure. However, today’s informal areas follow many typologies and have been classified by the ISDF into four main categories, which is explained below:

“Type A” is defined as private residential buildings on agricultural land purchased from farmers in areas without subdivision plans and where building permits were not given. This typology contains over half of the population of greater Cairo and almost half the total residential area; as such, it cannot be considered a marginal phenomenon. This phenomenon had its roots in the 1960s when small agricultural areas on the fringes of formal Cairo began to be subdivided by farmers and intermediaries and sold to individual owner-buildings; this was dramatically accepted after 1974 (open-door policy). The authorities first ignored the subdivision of the agricultural land for building purposes. The process was completely informal because the land was bought, transferred, and built with no legal documents, relying only on personal trust. Later, the government began to look upon the phenomenon, mainly because of the scarce agricultural land eaten up by urban expansion (UN-Habitat, 2011). Within the start of 1978, serious laws and decrees became increasingly illegal to build on agricultural land. The latest law was formulated in 1996 and considered such buildings as criminal deeds that should be controlled by military law. Moreover, there is a widespread trend of increasing the identification of areas over time, and the parallel phenomenon of severe overcrowding has been observed as families grow up and it becomes more difficult to afford new units for new families (UN-Habitat, 2011).

“Type B” is defined as private residential buildings constructed on vacant state land by citizens under the process of “hand claim.” This typology is similar to the squatting and the invasion found in Latin America throughout the third world. The history of the phenomenon is particular to each location. For example, Manshaiat Nasser began as a site for relocated slum dwellers and garbage collection, Ezbet el Hagana began as a hamlet for the families of coast guard soldiers (Wahby, 2013). Gradually, the expansion of these communities became a phenomenon, reflecting the State's neglect of its properties. Like type A, the development process was completely informal with no legal documents and total reliance on personal trust; however, unlike type A, the State owned the land as there was no personal provision on the land type. There are no complicated transactions
like subdivisions or inheritance issues; however, the housing conditions in type B are generally worse than those in typology A (Denis, 1997)

“Type C” of informal areas is prevalent mainly in the historic city. Expansions are found in neighborhoods with a high percentage of old, crowded, and deteriorated structures within the medieval urban fabric, such as parts of Misr El Kadima, and Boulak Aboul Ella. The deteriorated buildings found in these areas result from confused ownership; due to the controlled rent, most of the inhabitants are extremely poor. However, it is complicated to classify the whole area as slums, as the population of these historic areas is declining, and consequently, the residential spaces are converted to commercial and workshop use (UN-Habitat, 2011).

“Type D” is prevalent in various inner areas of Cairo, especially those developed around the beginning of the 20th century, and are found in some small pockets of very dilapidated one to three-story structures, which accommodate relatively low-income families, such as the area around Misr EL Kadima, Hekr El Sakakiny and Teretet El Tawfekeya (Nemattala, 1998). In all the previously mentioned cases, the presence of these pockets is due to the very precarious land tenure, which puts in doubt the wisdom of serious housing investment, resulting in very precarious housing types, which attracted impoverished families seeking the cheapest possible housing solutions. Although there are no overall studies of these areas, they represent an insignificant portion of the city population, which does not exceed one percent of the total; most are slated for removal, and some have already been converted into parks with the inhabitants relocated in public housing states (Sims, 2010).

4.3. AGENCIES INVOLVED IN DEALING WITH INFORMAL SETTLEMENTS

Specific national administrative authorities responsible for urban development in Egypt are working under the Ministry of Housing, Utilities, and Urban Communities (MOHUUC), which is responsible for the infrastructure and construction of urban communities (Abouelmaged, 2020). It aims to achieve social and economic standards to ensure a decent life for all citizens by providing integrated urban and residential communities that include suitable housing units. The following institutions are also involved in the urban governance of the city, which demonstrates the overlapping mandates of government institutions (Mohamed, 2017)
The New Urban Communities Authority (NUCA)

The New Urban Communities Authority (NUCA) is an economic institution in Egypt in charge of the urban development of new communities founded in compliance with Law No. 59 of 1979. It is in charge of selecting new city locations and developing development strategies. It is responsible for implementing Egypt's social housing program unit to ensure the fair provision of adequate housing in terms of location and services (UN-Habitat, 2021), and it assures new cities' infrastructure and public facilities (Tadamun, 2015). It also offers subsidized housing projects for low-income citizens, such as the Mubarak Housing Project and the Future association housing Project.

The General Organization of Physical Planning (GOPP)

The General Organization of Physical Planning (GOPP) is the administrative authority mandated to prepare strategic urban plans for all cities in Egypt (GOPP website, 2022). It was established with residential decree #1093 of 1973; it is responsible for preparing plans and programs for urban development in Egypt and establishing the rules of public policy for urban planning. After the enforcement of law #119 of the year 2008, the role of the GOPP was to be the authority responsible for public policy planning and sustainable urban development.

Moreover, the GOPP is responsible for preparing plans and programs for the development process at the national and regional levels. Accordingly, the GOPP introduced three categories of interventions. The first one is "upgrading, which comprises the enhancement of the physical condition of the area, mainly the buildings. While the second classification necessitates a complete removal of the slum area, and the third one, called "containment”, includes project implementation in the city's peripheries to stop the informal crawl in the agricultural land (Saad et al., 2019). Furthermore, rehabilitation interventions include four main types as part of their upgrading strategies. The first one is named "the in-situ” approach, through which inhabitants are left in their places until the new housing project is built on the same land. The second type is named “permanent relocation and development,” where inhabitants are resettled in public houses, generally on the city's peripheries, but the inhabitants never get back to the old slum area. The third type is called temporary relocation" and returning to the original areas,” in which slum areas dwellers are transferred temporarily, most often to the peripheries of the city with fewer services,
the slum area is demolished after a particular time, and the inhabitants return to the original area, in new housing units.

*Informal Settlement Development Fund (ISDF)*

The Dweika, rockfall after mass, has been the core stone for establishing the Informal Settlement Development Fund (ISDF) (Tadamun, 2019). It was established in 2008 with presidential decree #305/2008 with a set of interventionist approaches to detect the existing slums, limit their spreading, and develop a strategic plan for slums. Since its creation in 2008, the ISDF has launched various projects to map out these areas, which counts for 404 communities and 212,201 homes, which requires demolition, resettlement, and upgrading policies to deal with slum residents (Shawkat, 2020, p.51). It is also responsible for the regulation followed by governmental and private sectors for dealing with slums and the financial support required for the development process. The ISDF provides the concerned ministries, agencies, and local government units with information, expertise, and assistance. Moreover, the ISDF changed the Egyptian vocabulary by replacing the terms slum and "Ashwayat" with distinct synonyms, namely, Unsafe and unplanned areas (Khalifa, 2011). Unsafe areas were considered those that were not established using the urban planning tools, detailed plans, allocation schemes, or the land-based building law. The two distinctive terms, "unsafe and unplanned," helped later to draw up strategies and policies for improving slum conditions and life of inhabitants (Khalifa, 2011).

According to ISDF, 2014, unsafe areas accounted for 1 percent of all urban areas in cities; unplanned areas were expected to account for 37.5 percent of entire cities in 2014 (Maabady, 2015 p 28). However, the unsafe areas have been given specific attention as unsafe areas have been categorized into four grades according to the severity and type of risk they pose to inhabitants and their living conditions (Ezz, 2018). According to the ISDF, risks have been categorized into four grades. Each grade has been provided with a tailored type of intervention and classified as follows:

- **Grade one areas:** are those life-threatening slums. For example, areas located under or above sliding geological formations, those existing in flood areas, or those found under threat of railway accident. Areas categorized as grade one requires compulsory displacement, including relocating citizens to a governmental housing program or providing dwellers with appropriate monetary compensation.
- **Grade two areas**: emphasize unsuitable shelter conditions as buildings are constructed through pre-used materials such as shacks and waste dump sites. Areas under this classification require in-situ housing replacement, with displacement to nearby state-owned land.

- **Grade three areas**: are those areas exposed to health risks such as lacking the accessibility of clean drinking water and good sanitation, and areas facing industrial pollution or those located under high cable voltage. The slum dwellers of this category are provided infrastructure facilities and infrastructure development, with the assistance of the designated authorities and ministers, such as transferring aerial power lines to cable lines, regularizing pollution factories, and implementing water supply sanitation facilities (Maabady, 2015).

- **Grade four areas**: are characterized by instability due to tenure insecurity. Thus, inhabitants of this grade are provided the legality of tenure or alternative housing options.

The ISDF prioritizes life-threatening places (Grade One), such as the Duweiqa informal community, over other slums. The priority in these situations is to relocate the population to safe regions (EZZ, 2018). The ISDF argues that people of informal settlements have the right to safe housing and improved living circumstances through relocating processes. Suitably, various strategies have been formulated, and housing projects were established across governorates and carried out by the State to provide affordable housing options, mainly through relocating inhabitants to properly established housing complexes (El-Mouelh et al., 2021). However, categorization has been considered inconsistent and contradictory, wherein in some instances, residents living with poor housing conditions are evacuated before those living in grade one unsafe areas. At the same time, others are evacuated without being provided adequate shelter, leaving them homeless, incapable of earning the minimum living standards, and subject to human rights violations (Tadamun, 2019).

### 4.4. **Overview of Egyptian Initiatives Addressing Informality**

There was a lack of government acknowledgment of the “Ashwaeyat” as informal dwellings built in contravention of planning and building rules (El-Rahman and Khateeb, 2016). Nevertheless, in the late 1970s, the government developed strategies to respond to the reality of the growth of informal settlements (Bohl et al., 2018). The strategy of developing new cities and towns in desert land was found as a solution to limit the informal growth of existing cities on agricultural land.
This program was meant to give alternatives to informal settlements in an attempt to relocate urban expansion inside existing cities through the construction of new settlements (Bohl et al., 2018). By the late 1970s, the Egyptian government and the World Bank had funded a number of pilot initiatives in terms of "site and services" and "informal settlements improvement." (Hegazy, 2016) These two projects were perceived as an extra mile of governmental intervention, attempting to lead to the inclusion of upgrading as part of national housing strategies. Although the sites and services' upgrading projects were the first in Egypt to acknowledge informal settlements explicitly, policy intervention was deemed to have failed to fundamentally change housing policies to embrace a comprehensive upgrading policy (El-Rahman and Khateeb, 2016).

In 1993, a national program addressing informal areas was launched, including the redevelopment of 20 slum areas (Habib, 2017). The second phase of this national program began by surveying various slums to identify areas that require upgrading or complete demolishing (Habib, 2017). The Egyptian government started adopting two policy approaches to deal with informal areas. The first is the "preventionist approach," which aims to limit the growth of informal settlements, while the second is the "interventionist approach," where the government either removes or upgrades the informal areas.

In the early 1990s, particularly in 1994, subsequent government interventions provided the informal areas with basic facilities and services. Accordingly, the government started to prepare plans for developing slums where the first stage in the developing program of informal areas was called the informal settlement program development" (1994-2004), which worked on providing basic urban facilities (water, sanitary drainage, electricity, and sewage) for about 325 unplanned areas. The second stage includes the informal settlement belting program and enforcing urban growth boundaries (UGB) (2004-2008), which focused on restricting the growth of the informal regions (Hegazy, 2016). UGB was used as regional limits to the city's future expansion by limiting the growth of informal areas in some regions, often inside the boundary, while prohibiting growth in others (Tadamun, 2014). Additionally, the preventive approaches include strict measures limiting the informal expansion of agricultural land; the government responded with more stringent laws, including law No.116 of 1983, which acted as the government's tool for protecting agricultural land (Tadamun, 2014). Nonetheless, preventive strategies have not proven effective in reducing the expansion of informal settlements. They have instead channeled informal growth
from one region to another, fostered informal growth, left communities vulnerable, and increased local corruption. As a result, the rules are violated, no minimum criteria for safety or security are maintained, and inhabitants' well-being ultimately suffers.

Recently, the Ministry of Local Development (MOLD) estimated that the number of slums in Egypt is exacerbating, including more than 10 million inhabitants (UN-Habitat, 2016). This estimation highlighted that slums in Egypt are a critical issue and not just an exceptional phenomenon. Consequently, it became a part of public policies described as the five-year plans of 2008-2012, followed by the legislation of the recent building and planning law #119/2008, including the presidential campaign consideration regarding slums and guaranteeing proper living conditions for their dwellers. In 2007, the government dedicated all efforts to prevent any expansions of slums by trying to design the border and edges of each city before it is eroded by informal growth. However, the third stage comprised a national fund established by a presidential decree (305/2008) to support local government finance in providing safe housing on a cost-recovery basis.

In addition, since the ISDF has become the major entity that deals with different types of slum areas, it has identified three strategies to deal with the slum agenda. The Short-term national plan 2012-2017 aims to ensure safe housing while providing effective development projects, technical assistance, and capacity building. In the medium-term strategy, ISDF considers socio-economic programs by empowering slum dwellers in this strategy. It provides economic local development programs, health care programs, and education (Maabady, 2015). However, there is a lack of information on the intervention level concerning the aforementioned socio-economic programs. The long-term strategy (2012-2047) deals with the urban development of service sectors, such as the industrial and agricultural sectors. In this strategy, the ISDF determines the Urban cities which need development and impacts domestic income (Maabady, 2015). However, the ISDF has been criticized for maintaining centralized funding decision-making and centralizing the duties in ISDF entities only (Tadamun, 2019).

In the case of resettlement policies, one case study has stood out in the literature. Ezbet Haridy inner-city slum was located in the district of El Wayly in Cairo. The number of families that lived there before the rehabilitation project was 195 families in the period between 2008 to 2010. Two types of interventions were combined while addressing the livelihood conditions of the inhabitants.
Some of the inhabitants were relocated temporarily to public houses in the Obour district, while the rest were relocated permanently to a closer area called Nahda city. The rehabilitation process has affected the livelihood capital of the inhabitants as most of them have lost their social ties, professions, and financial capital, and most of them have lost their savings and source of income (Abou El Magd, 2014).

On the other hand, the rehabilitation of Nahda city depended solely on providing physical shelters, but it did not maintain the livelihood capital, human, social, or financial capital in the original slum area. The case study confirmed that the rehabilitation projects must work in parallel with providing the minimal needs of the inhabitants and supporting them against what they face on a daily basis (Abou El Magd, 2014). The next section sheds light on a similar case study of Manshaiat Nasser and El-Asmarat, where relocation has affected citizens' lives and living standards.

4.5. **Contextual Background of Case Study Sites: Manshaiat Nasser and El Asmarat**

This section will detail the background to Manshaiat Nasser and El Asmarat as the case study sites. The case studies included provides a brief background about Manshaiat Nasser to conceptualize clearly the living standards of the citizens before relocation. Besides, the inclusion of the Asmarat background assists in understand the encountered aspects perceived by the citizens coincided by the forceful eviction, demolition of their areas, and the relocation to governmentally regulated housing unit.

4.5.1. **Background to Manshaiat Nasser**

Manshaiat Nasser is one of the largest informal settlements in Egypt. It is located in the Cairo governorate on a surface area of 7.934 km² and is currently home to more than a million inhabitants. The location was primarily developed by rural migrants seeking adequate job opportunities in the Cairo governorate (UN-Habitat, 2012). The location's history started during the second world war when Egypt was under British colonization; Egypt witnessed the migration of inhabitants from Upper Egypt. Those migrants were settled first in Gamalia area and later moved to Manshaiat Nasser according to a presidential decree to evacuate the Gamalia location (Isabelle, 2014). Later, the Egyptian government in the early 1960s granted the Gamalia residents the opportunity to live on governmental land near Mokkatam hill, recently known as Manshaiat Nasser (Tadamun, 2020). The area was provided with basic amenities, such as water and sewage, under
the rule of former president Gamal Abdel Nasser. However, the location became one of the largest unsafe informal areas and the hometown of more hundred thousand dwellers, who mainly lack access to minimal essential human services (Irin, 2014).

Within the rocky nature of the mountain, the territory lacked the suitability for decent living, such as infrastructure and security of tenure. Over time, the population inside the area has increased, fostering an urgent demand by citizens for the state institutions to supply the area with minimal facilities. However, within the salient ignorance of state institutions to address the situation of informal settlements, the area afterward became the shelter harboring outlaws. This has impacted boosting the horizontal expansion to live at the foot of the mountain, and it had another effect on forcing the residents to live in clusters and start creating their solutions in the absence of the state authority. The improper housing also expanded vertically towards the top of the Mokattam hill, and thus the residents started defining their neighborhood as influenced by their shared histories, social bonds, and practiced professions.

Moreover, the new community started imposing new rules, and the inhabitants started developing their ad-hoc individualistic approaches to cope with the location (Piffero, 2009). In fact, by addressing the factors that shaped the area, the area became the shelter of the Christian garbage collectors. The Anba saman church gave these new residents a sense of reassurance and belonging, allowing them to build their permanent houses (Marzouk, 2017). Besides, the Coptic Orthodox and social services provided the areas with services that created a solid foundation for community development and supported the garbage collection community to engage in the new community. Since then, Manshaiat Nasser has started to develop and expand, especially after adopting the open-door policy in the 1980s (Mohamed, 2017). In fact, the Dweika area has expanded, and new areas such as the Razaz and, Masaken el Herafeeyyen areas have been built with inadequate infrastructure and impoverished amenities. However, despite the poor services provided, the site has established a solid social cluster working to create its working opportunities. Besides, it has established a dynamic urban quarter with high employment rates and income-generating projects generated from recycling activities and traditional handicrafts professions that shaped human, social and economic wealth (Tadamun, 2020).

The situation of Manshaiat Nasser has changed, as much attention has been given to the area, after the Dweika crisis. Afterward, the national authority for remote sensing and space services
(NARSS) and the geological survey authority published maps of the riskiest areas. Accordingly, local authorities classified the top of the mountain as the area that encompasses the highest level of risk. However, these attempts were deemed not successful in prioritizing the needy people, and they gave insights into the lack of governmental professionalism in mitigating risks and securing the lives of slum dwellers (Matton, 2014).

In general, in dealing with the Dweika area, Egypt has adopted two approaches, the temporary rehabilitation of dwellers into a parallel district or the relocation of the inhabitants into distinct locations. When the precise analysis was made to compare the accessibility of the livelihood resources in the different locations, it was apparent that the Egyptian government deals with slums agenda solely based on the degree of safety rather than emphasizing the socioeconomic determinants of their inhabitants (Elmouelh, et al., 2015)

4.5.2. **BACKGROUND TO EL ASMARAT CITY**

Within Egypt's commitment to globally agreed sustainability goals, which include making cities safer and more resilient by 2030, the Egyptian government demolished unsafe settlements and built convenient homes by relocating residences to safer areas (Sonia, 2019).

Under the slogan of "Egypt without slums," the Asmarat project was introduced to be one of the housing projects established by the Egyptian government, offering affordable and convenient housing to the low-income groups, particularly those living in the Egyptian unsafe squatter areas. The housing scheme is a part of a five-year governmental project that started in 2016, particularly to demolish and relocate slum residents (Reuters, 2020)

The Asmarat project is located in the southeastern Cairo neighborhood in the Mokattam district on an estimated total area of 196 feddan (Asmarat administrative council-Cairo governorate, 2021). The project aimed to accommodate a population of more than 240 thousand individuals who previously lived in life-threatening areas, mostly in Dewika, Manshaiat Nasser, Maspiro triangle, Estabe Anatar, and other risky slum areas scattered along the governorate.

The project's first stage was launched year 2016, occupied an area of 71 feddan, and compromised 5944 housing units, where 3744 housing units had been occupied by Manshaiat Nasser relocated residents. The project's second stage occupied 59 feddan with 3480 total housing units, whereas the relocated Manshaiat Nasser residents occupied 529 units. The project's last stage occupied 56
feddan and consisted of 7230 units, where 1499 units were occupied by Manshaiat Nasser residents (Asmarat administrative council-Cairo governorate, 2021).

According to the head of Asmarat municipal authority, the project was considered a quantum leap in dealing with slums considering the magnitude and the scale of the allocated funds. Similarly, the Egyptian prime minister declared that the Asmarat project is one of the most successful sustainable rehousing projects that will be replicated in various governorates to fulfill Egypt's vision and objectives (Abd El Hafez, 2020).

Many arguments concerning the relocation issue had highlighted some socio-economic aspects, and they underlined the downside of the evacuations, especially to distinct areas such as the compound of Asmarat, as many residents were socially and economically affected (Farid, 2019). In the same vein, the relocation process was viewed among many urban planners as a form of social engineering in which residents are uprooted and deprived of their social capital (Shawkat, 2020). Other arguments declared that whoever criticizes the state, which is providing families a safe and dignified life is an attempt to undermine the state’s efforts in resolving the slum problem. However, it is apparent that the initiation requires an alternation from its urban physical intervention to conceptualize the relocated individuals' socio-economic dimensions. The following chapter will explain how the resettlement to Asmarat has impacted citizens in both sites.

5. CHAPTER FIVE: FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS

This chapter aims to identify the vision of slum eradication policies in parallel to the inhabitants' experiences and obstacles incurred by the new location versus their old one. Additionally, the chapter examines the extent of relocation/resettlement policies in addressing citizens’ quality of life standards.

The interviews' main themes have been clustered into three main data sets: the macro, meso, and micro levels. The macro-level includes the governmental level and policymakers' role in formulating urban restatement policies. This section discusses the government's perspectives on the slum problem and the current slum policies that target the socio-economic dimensions, particularly the resettlement policy, which is the most commonly practiced policy (Bagheri, 2013). The meso level includes international organizations that assisted in finding solutions to slum areas, and the micro-level includes the perspectives of the citizens who remained in Manshaiat Nasser.
versus those who have been relocated. The micro-level or the bottom-up perspective is adopted to assess the degree of quality-of-life improvement encountered by the resettlement policies.

5.1. **POLICYMAKERS’ PERSPECTIVES OF URBAN PLANNING IN EGYPT**

5.1.1. **National Urban Planning**

Over the past several decades, informality has transformed the form and nature of Egyptian cities, and it is expected to continue if no definitive action is taken. Following the "Dweika" rock slide, the governmental scope alternates towards addressing the severity of the situation that has been witnessed. However, the policy has been enacted haphazardly without specifying the optimum policy that suits the targeted location and community. Nevertheless, the Egyptian government represented in the Ministry of Housing and Urban Communities (MOHUC) started to articulate national strategies to achieve the new urban objectives, which strives to design an inclusive plan for an urban policy that prioritizes adequate, safe, and healthy housing. Accordingly, the Egyptian government has declared its aim toward a national plan that requires formulating a detailed strategy to address the situation of slums.

Similarly, the governmental attempt to address the informal settlement agenda was apparent when article 78 of 2014 was reinforced in the Egyptian Constitution, formulating concrete policies and different levels of intervention (Tadamun, 2017). Likewise, in accordance with the 2030 Agenda, Egypt's government has established a working plan known as Egypt's Vision 2030, also known as the Sustainable Development Strategy (SDS). The SDS advocates economic flourishing that is founded on fairness, social integrity, and participation. All development plans in Egypt are included in the SDS while also being substantially directed by the SDGs. The majority of policymakers, and governmental representatives, have pointed out the abidance of the Egyptian government in an attempt to achieve the SDGs guidelines by figuring out how to address informality issues; as the following participants explained,

"It is worth mentioning that Egypt has committed itself towards achieving the sustainable development strategies (SDS) that require properly enacting the strategy to achieve inclusive development. Also, the Egyptian government is trying to meet the requirements of the United Nations' sustainable development general goal: to end poverty and ensure prosperity by the end of 2030. Since Egypt has committed itself to achieving sustainable development goals, Egypt began developing its mission to provide a better future for the Egyptians. Yet, the strategy abided by the Egyptian government did not fail to meet these requirements".
(Policymaker 1, 9 September 2021)
"By holding the fact that the situation of informal settlements grabbed the global concern, the Egyptian government is doing its best to respond to these goals, especially goal # 11, which targets the marginalized and disadvantaged groups". (Government representative 2, 22 September 2021)

Before adopting the SDGs, the Government of Egypt announced that it should develop a national housing plan that respects the environment and facilitates the participation of personal and collaborative efforts in its execution. The Government also announced that it should govern the use of State lands and provide basic amenities on them within the context of comprehensive urban planning that serves cities, villages, and a population distribution strategy. This is to be used to assist the public interest, improve residents' quality of life, and protect the rights of future generations, and the representative from the ISDF has mentioned this:

"In an attempt to abide by article number 78 of the Egyptian constitution, we are trying to offer decent housing for vulnerable people while improving the economic and social conditions, and these are accomplished throughout the given list of policies: developing an integrated plan that works on developing slum areas within the assistance of the governorates, improving the physical and living conditions of the people living in slum areas". (Government representative 1, 12th of September 2021)

This matter represents that the inclusion of the informal areas in the Egyptian Constitution was a paradigm shift in the government's approach toward slums over the past decades. At that point, the right to housing was perceived as a crucial factor of the individual right approved by the international convention, as it became one of the basics of protection and inclusion that the State shall provide to its citizens and one of the main pillars of security in any society (Abdul Salam, 2021). However, the exacerbation of slums in Cairo has been the product of neglect for more than thirty years. Even the previously enacted slum policies have been limited in achieving their desired objectives and, hence, failed to formulate the ad hoc slum development strategy. The situation was ignored entirely, hoping that it would dissolve over time. However, under the current status quo, as slum areas increased aggressively, the government accepted informality, and it became part of its urban fabric whereby designed institutions were established particularly for informal settlements, to find a solution to this problem. One policymaker explains:

"During Mubarak's era, the enacted policies related to informal settlements were drafted without concern about risk precautions. Moreover, no exact time frame was given, and even the percentages of the achieved projects were not disclosed to the public. Moreover, various strategies were drafted and archived in Mubarak's era without even checking the project's feasibility. Recently, the agenda of upgrading slum areas have been given a paramount concern. Previously, the agenda was not
prioritized, which may be backed by various interconnected reasons, such as the funding sources, the opposition encountered by the citizens, the scarcity of finding adequate locations." (Government representative 2, 22nd of September 2021)

This gradual alteration from completely ignoring to prioritizing the agenda of slums has been backed by several interlinked factors such as the eclipsing scale of informality, the political expediency, and the ongoing civil discourse that requests a more human approach that should consider the quality of life and living standards of the people living in these areas. Additionally, the Egyptian housing sector has witnessed severe fluctuations in changing its procedures and laws required to regulate the housing sector. Therefore, there was a crucial need to have a clear policy that reflects the country's vision of better addressing the slum challenges to achieve a progressive social, economic, and urban goal. Likewise, to better formulate the adequate housing strategy as requested by the SDGs, Egypt has developed a clear vision, and it was disclosed to the public to conceptualize the attempts made and the policies enacted that aim to achieve this mission.

"According to the center of the Egyptian cabinet, Egypt works on a plan with a clear vision that states that Egypt will be free from the hazardous settlements similar to those located Dweika, and Manshait Nasser by the end of 2021 and entirely release informality from the Egyptian context by 2030. However, eradicating the so-called hazardous slums are still taking place, but being honest, as working in this governmental institution, the State has extended, let us assume that the agenda of informal settlements will be totally resolved by 2030."(international organization representative 2, 24th of October 2021)

To that end, the Egyptian government has developed a prolonged strategy to address this agenda. The strategy has defined clear and consistent objectives. The first objective was to eliminate the informal settlements with a high probability of danger to their citizens by 2019. It requires moving the citizens living in risky locations to other areas closer to their previous location. The second objective involves developing the areas deemed improperly planned to avoid being unsafe for their inhabitants, and this is intended to be achieved by the end of 2030. Accordingly, the strategy targeted 22 million citizens, or nearly 5 million families, including 240,000 families living in risky locations and 500,000 families residing in unplanned ones. This means that the Egyptian government has developed 80% of slum areas in the past four years, while the remaining percentage is planned to be developed by the end of 2021-2022. This rate of slum development has been backed by specified development plans and precise time intervals and spans to detect the level of progress achieved (Mahmoud, 2019). One policymaker emphasized the phases of these strategies:
"All the slum upgrading strategies have been drawn and will be included in Egypt 2030 national plan. In practice, Egypt has developed three plans that include three-time intervals ranging from short-term, medium-term, and long-term. The phase of the short plan was from 2016 to 2018, and this required upgrading 351 unsafe areas and improving the lives of 850 thousand of residents. The medium plan phase covers 2016 and the end of 2021, and it requires developing the infrastructure and providing maintenance for the unplanned areas. The long-term plan phase 2016-2026 aims to reduce the emergence of slum areas and ensure their continuous development". (Policymaker, 19th of September 2021)

With respect to this, the Tahya Misr Fund, established by President El-Sisi, has been working on a three-phase strategy to remove Egypt's slums and re-house slum residents, including those residing in Dweika, Establ Antar and Ezbet KhairAllah. The project contains 15,000 housing units that will rehouse 60,000 slum dwellers scattered along with different districts of Cairo, Giza, and other governorates (Abdul Salam, 2021). This falls in line with the planning of development projects mentioned by another government representative from the ISDF and the GOPP:

"The minister of housing and planning and the prime minister announced that since 2015, the rate of provided adequate housing for slum area dwellers has reached 225 thousand units annually, and they are currently working to increase this rate. These figures were presented according to the number of dwellers living in risky areas with more than one million citizens and distributed among 25 governorates. They also disclosed the executive position of development projects held in the slum areas from 2015 till 2021, where the percentages of the housing units available have reached 100% where 90% of the beneficiaries have been provided decent housing options, and they are currently working on the plan to rescue the remaining percentage". (Policymaker, 9th of September 2021)

All the previously mentioned governmental attempts show that Egypt is exerting an effort to incorporate its stated vision into the development of a slum-free strategy, including the development objectives, while developing national goals with Egypt's Vision for Sustainable Development 2030. The Egyptian Ministry of Housing has also made the first step - underlined by the Global Housing Strategy toward achieving an integrated and authentic understanding of the housing sector with the publication of the "Egyptian Housing Profile" in 2016. The housing profile featured an examination of Egypt's housing industry, emphasizing policies and initiatives relating to affordable housing developments. Based on these assessments, the Egyptian Housing Strategy was developed to establish an enabling environment that enhances the availability of affordable housing in Egypt and Sustainable Urban Development 2030.
5.1.2. **DESIGNING THE HOUSING STRATEGY**

Based on a presidential decree, the ISDF became the main institution that reflects how Egypt deals with informal areas. Since its establishment, it has launched several projects that scanned the slum areas and planned related intervention policies. The fund aims to achieve social justice, ensure adequate housing, and improve the economic situation of the inhabitants. Accordingly, the ISDF started differentiating between the existing informal areas in terms of their risk severity, and thus, the fund classified informal areas into two main terminologies known as unplanned and unsafe. Within the priority given to the unsafe areas, these were classified according to four main categories, with each category specified risk considerations, which require a specific level of intervention.

"Since the establishment of the ISDF in 2008, the agenda of the informal settlements have been proliferated, and distinct classifications have been highlighted, that assisted in formulating the strategy that became now a national plan" (Policymaker1, the 9th of September 2021)

"The ISDF has dealt with the agenda of informal areas extensively as it has formed a distinctive classification that highlights the difference between the so-called" unplanned, and unsafe areas"; it also identified certain criteria for each category to determine intervention strategies." (Governmental representative 1, 12th, of September 2021)

Before establishing the ISDF, the agenda of the slum areas was entirely neglected. The percentages of the unsafe areas versus the unplanned ones were ambiguous. Even the figures for the demographics and the total population were obscure. However, since its establishment, new statistics have been disclosed pertaining to each category of risk that assisted in providing a clear understanding of the problem and identifying the efforts exerted.

"Generally, there are 357 unsafe informal settlements in Egypt, among which 296 areas were redeveloped, and this is only during the period of 2014- till 2020. These areas were distributed among 25 different governorates with roughly 200 thousand housing units, distributed as follows (24 areas of the 1st-degree areas with 21,133 housing units - 236 areas of 2nd-degree risk with 95,653 housing units - 20 of the 3rd-degree risk areas with 32,400 housing units - 21 of the 4th risk areas with 26,711 housing units)." (Governmental representative 2, 22nd of September 2021).

The stated projects have had clear strategic goals and objectives, which assisted in reaching this progressed level of achievement. However, it cannot be achieved without the collaboration between different economic sectors and defining roles and responsibilities needed to achieve these
objectives. Moreover, facilitating the procedures of all the parties involved to develop a clear long-term plan that supports the national strategy and works for the betterment of the people living below poverty lines, particularly in slum communities (UN-Habitat, 2020), and this was reinforced through the participants’ reflection indicating:

"The ISDF is the designated institution that formulates the basic vision that deals with slum areas. Enclosed in the vision are certain tasks that should be accomplished with the assistance of certain ministries, such as the ministry of electricity and renewable energy, the ministry of housing utilities and urban communities, the ministry of endowments, and the ministry of land reclamation. In this regard, the adopted strategies of slum eradication depend highly on the interlinked vision of various related parties, and they are not formulated based on a single entity or individual view." (Government representative 2, 22\textsuperscript{nd} of September 2021)

However, coordination among all the designated institutions requires proper planning, which entails setting a process concerned with establishing a set of collective decisions to achieve specific goals and form a clear strategy. Geared to that end, the proper planning of the strategy formulation is a crucial aspect of achieving these collective decisions to reach the comprehensive goals and thus formulate a comprehensive strategy. One representative describes this process:

"According to the design of the policy, it is similar to the physician's prescription. Similarly, in the preliminary stages, we survey, classify and categorize the areas that require assistance. Within the categorization given, there are policy-driven attempts geared toward the severity of the situation, and within each policy, certain mechanisms should be abided. For example, the" Dweika area" has been dealt with as being a risky area with a high probability of mountain rockfall. To find a solution, we referred to a group of geologists with a high level of expertise, and they diagnosed and analyzed the current situation of the rock." (Government representative 1, 12\textsuperscript{th} of September 2021)

To that end, the economic dimension and root causes of slums must be incorporated when designing the intervention strategy. Accordingly, the designated institutions and ministers might collaborate to find the ultimate course of action and formulate the ad hoc strategy. This dimension was stressed by government officials:

"Before designing any policy that deals with slum areas, we should first understand the reason for their existence. First of all, slums are formulated without having access to the land and without being adequately planned like any other well-designed community. Their existence is purely economic. Then, certain ministries’ role, such as the GOPP, is to analyze the situation of these slum areas, particularly from an urban perspective, such as the location, the State of the land, the population
concentration, etc. Afterward, it tries to search for another alternative solution that addresses the severity of the situation". (Policymaker 2, 24th of September 2021)

The matter does not end at that point; the strategy of dealing with slums also requires a precise framework, which requires complete data about the problem's size and severity. Accordingly, the State can develop the necessary mechanisms to determine the level of intervention. Different policymakers have views on how this would work:

"There is a framework for intervening in real situations concerning this strategy's prioritization, policies, and implementation mechanisms. For example, the governorate should start by collecting data and maps indicating urban mass development and urban sprawl indicators. Secondly, it should review the population growth rates experienced in the informal areas, determine the priority of intervention, and survey the territories requiring immediate intervention." (International organization representative 2, 28th of August 2021)

"Our role is to survey and identify the aforementioned areas, completely understand the situation, and install the ad-hoc policies and mechanisms that deal with slums….as this survey has included the location of the informal settlement, its degree of risk, and the population density to plan for the required stage of intervention". (Policymaker 1, 9th of September 2021).

There has been an alternative shift of the State's focus toward slum-enacted policies as the discussion with the member of parliament exposed. These policies are subject to a high level of scrutiny to detect their proper implementation and execution. All the policy drafts are currently proposed to the parliament, and the executed projects are subject to question to analyze their degree of effectiveness and achievement. Since urban issues became the mandate of the parliament, it has the complete right to pass any legislation, and it also enacts the policies related to slum development, including the social, economic, and development plans. While it also questions members assigned to formulate the policy and hold them accountable. As mentioned by one parliamentarian interviewed:

"This detailed plan has to be presented to the Egyptian cabinet, including the Egyptian prime minister, as this has provided a clear and general vision of the case of slum areas. This enables the parliament to monitor the implementation of the strategy's targets, objectives, and time frame against key performance indicators. Thus, the strategy and its draft should be presented and then ratified by the parliament with an absolute majority, and since then, the strategy has to be approved." (Policymaker 1, 9th of September, 2021).

This means that parliament usually questions the government and highlights specific concerns regarding any proposed project's execution, funding, and eligibility, by holding the virtue that the parliament's fundamental role is to scrutinize the projects that satisfy the needs of the Egyptians.
The parliament has a higher level, and it usually examines and criticizes the government if it fails to achieve the specified agenda or if the plan was improperly implemented.

5.1.3. IMPLEMENTING UPGRADING AND RELOCATION POLICIES

Egypt has a long history of slums; however, negligence was the most salient policy abided. Although the slum agenda has been ignored for several decades, the Dweika after mass has been the rock stone that forced the State to initialize national programs directed to solve the slum problems. The State first initialized several slum upgrading projects targeting all the impoverished areas located in Cairo governorate, but these upgrading projects had a very minimal effect on the aggregate level, and sometimes several policies were drafted without actual on-ground implementation. However, since the categorization provided by the ISDF, various apparent upgrading and relocation attempts have been exerted to address this situation.

"For decades, the Egyptian governments have used a variety of strategies to deal with informal settlements, including denying their existence, providing in situ assistance, evicting residents, and dismantling settlements entirely. More recently, it has become clear that eviction and demolition are the most practiced mechanism in Egypt. However, relocation is the mostly abided policy for the unsafe slums where in-situ upgrading is more directed to the slum areas which are not properly planned". (International representative 2, 24th of October 2021)

Nevertheless, the priority is given to the unsafe-risky slum areas, despite representing a small percentage of the urban cluster compared to the unplanned areas.

"Unsafe slums represent only one percent (1%) of the cities, while unplanned areas represent seventy percent (70%) of cities and regions, which is more than half of the urban fabric. Then, the strategy primarily focused on unsafe slums to provide safer shelters for dwellers while also providing suitable housing conditions with all the satisfying entailing criteria" (International representative 1, 28th of August 2021)

This current reality means that Egypt has two methods to deal with the agenda of slums. The first path, known as the in-situ rehabilitation project, aims to renovate the area by improving the infrastructure and housing quality in accordance with improving the inhabitants' quality of life. The second path includes the relocation process, which is meant to improve the quality of life by establishing an integrated society with all the needed services, facilities, and proper infrastructure to leverage the living standards of the slum dwellers. These are further detailed below.
Upgrading Policies

Upgrading is the process by which the situation of informal settlements is improved gradually. It is known as the progressive development of the existing structures and infrastructure within an informal settlement to an acceptable quality over time without removing the urban fabric or transferring inhabitants to another location. Its goal is to revitalize an existing community while causing the least physical and social damage. Upgrading encompasses a wide range of potential operations, including improved street lighting, leveling roadway surfaces, extending the sanitation network to every house, and providing health facilities, schools, or other important public services. It entails giving slum residents access to the same economic, social, institutional, and communal services as other people. Legal (land tenure), physical (infrastructure), social (crime or education), and economic services are among them. However, it requires the involvement of residents, community groups, and national authorities in upgrading efforts to achieve coherence in finding solutions to the citizens' needs (Tadamun, 2014).

The role of international organizations is undeniable in slum upgrading projects conducted in Egypt. Organizations such as the UN-Habitat, the European Union, and the GIZ have played a prominent role in supporting the Egyptian government in reconstructing projects and providing community infrastructure facilities and other related projects related to demographic development and the empowerment of vulnerable people living in slums areas. It also helped provide technical support and introduce new approaches to align spatial socio-economic plans (UN-Habitat, 2016).

One interviewee summed up their role as follows:

"International institutions like the European Union and the GIZ are concerned with the in situ upgrading, providing accessible utilities, and upgrading the infrastructure rather than relocating the citizens. In addition, these international organizations are more concerned with alleviating the living standards and injecting more projects that provide a progressed quality of life. The GIZ's projects were concerned with accelerating the services and upgrading the sewage networks and infrastructure in the affected areas. It also provides and facilitates services related to youth and gender, such as establishing youth centers and women-tailored projects to guarantee their empowerment. All these international organizations are avoiding the relocation attempts and leaving it to the government mandates because relocating citizens is highly associated with various channels of public discontent, which might add a predicament to the international organizations' slum development agenda." (International organization representative 2,24th of October 2021)
Generally, international organizations ameliorate slum conditions through various interventions, including infrastructure renovations, housing upgrades, income creation initiatives, and assisting informal sectors. Some of these previously mentioned programs abide by the participatory approach, which was established in response to the Egyptian government's request that Germany assists in finding a long-term solution for Egypt's informal settlements and developing the standard of living of the people living in poor urban areas communities.

"The participatory needs assessment (PNA) was a relatively new tool to be applied in Egypt as it entails conducting a distinctive analysis to develop critical data that can guide program design and execution. Applying this approach is crucial in all slum redevelopment projects as it addresses the challenges faced by the citizens. Consequently, it facilitates understanding the location dynamics and all it entails in urban-physical, socio-economic, and environmental perspectives." (International organization representative 224th of October 2021)

This means that the PNA is the most reliable method for determining community members' perceptions of their collective needs as it is generally the initial stage in any slum upgrading program, as mentioned. In particular, the interviewee stressed that:

"The PNA assesses the economic environments in the targeted location, which includes determining the percentages of the employed versus unemployed individuals, the market structure, and the commonly practiced profession of the citizens; it also addresses the provision of services to the marginalized groups of the society including elderly persons, individuals with disability and female breadwinners." (International organization representative 224th of October 2021)

The German government has always assisted Egypt in its urban development projects. This assistance is presented by setting the development plans needed by the Egyptian government to determine the level of technical consultation provided by the German government. Accordingly, the GIZ collaborates with Egyptian stakeholders to guarantee the optimum level of technical assistance. This technical assistance is apparent in injecting projects to improve poor urban populations' livelihoods.

In particular, there was a push toward adopting international best practices in slum upgrading. However, replication is not the best solution, while each context requires a different approach that might not be applicable to the other. Accordingly, it might not be the optimum solution when trying to replicate the Indian or Brazilian experience in the Egyptian context. However, international organizations did make use of policies elsewhere, as the participant explained:
"We analyze any successful international experience, try to make the best use of it, and assess its feasibility when applied to the Egyptian context. However, copying any international experience without fully comprehending its applicability is not always the best solution. I believe that each country has distinct criteria that require a specific level of intervention. However, the abided policies can be successfully applied in a particular context, while it can be inconvenient when applied to the other context. We can best use the previously held international experiences by understanding their know-how and modifying the applied model if it is found applicable." (International organization representative 1, 28th of August 2021)

There is a specified criterion related to determining the type of intervention. For example, the housing situation, the population density, its characteristics, the extent of infrastructure deterioration, the extent of the existence of basic services in the region, and other factors all play a role in the decision to remove or develop the area. It also depends on the slum area's location in the city (on the outskirts—in the city center), the slum area's importance and economic value in the event of its clearance and re-planning on architectural and urban grounds, the need to open new traffic axes, and alternative development solutions available through the slum upgrading policy.

In particular, the case of Zerzarra in Port Said was one of the prominent upgrading projects. The project gives a great example of how the government handles informal buildings and re-housing inhabitants in their original locations; it also represents the way government agencies and civil society think about urban development and reconstruction, as well as the acceptance of key ideas such as relative community engagement, development activities, and re-housing people in the same area. This concept is seen to be effective because it preserves local residents' social networks and is interested in re-housing locals near their businesses and schools after the development process, which is uncommon when dealing with the problem of decaying housing.

"The old Zerzarra area is the best example, as there was no relocation. In fact, the area was built in situ, and People were provided new houses, and all the impoverished houses were changed into social housing apartments in the exact location. The matter here is dealing with the provision of housing and infrastructure, and the citizens' living standards have been changed, and they got revived"(International organization representative1, 28th of August 2021)

Despite the fact that the socio-economic advantages of the upgrading policy were followed in this case, the project's curve was deteriorating, and the problem existed within the lack of proper management. Then, by assuming that the location is the same and all the activities and social bonds
are preserved, the new location will return to its old phase without the required frequent maintenance.

"When the citizens were asked, we realized that the only comment which was highlighted was the lack of providing frequent maintenance." (Policymaker 1, 9th of September 2021)

There has been a recent interest in identifying the slum intervention programs deemed beneficial in improving the living conditions of slum dwellers. By holding the virtue of the fact that level of intervention is made in the first best setting, the assessment of the interventions that affect the housing and the quality-of-life outcomes indicated that in-situ slum upgrading has an acceptable effect in developing the slum areas and preserving the socio-economic dimensions of the city dwellers. The embedded logic behind this type of intervention is that it involves providing a package of basic services in the same location without changing the community or forcing them to accept the change. Besides, it makes shelter improvements without incurring the citizens' cost of moving, which might affect society's community cohesion, social networking, or economic and financial opportunities.

In the case mentioned above, the neighborhood and housing characteristics were determined. Similarly, the social cohesion of city dwellers was also preserved while providing the necessary upgrading programs (Perlman, 2003, p.40). However, the upgrading policy has succeeded in fixing the urban distortions, but the project lacked the follow-up and maintenance required to guarantee continuity and sustainability. Besides, awareness programs should have been given to the citizens to utilize the newly instilled services and react to the new options provided within their locations. Thus, the performance of the in-situ slum upgrading policy depends on the quality of services provided to citizens in their locations and how complementary and integral policy initiatives are implemented to correct any deviation or another problem that might occur (Dasgupta and Lall, 2009).

**Relocation Policies**

In terms of relocation, as previously explained, it is the process that entails moving slum residences from their current location to an alternative habitable site. In this process, residents are either obliged or given a choice to vacate their homes to accommodate new public houses offered at subsidized rental fees. At a global level, relocation-resettlement is believed to be a common way that reserves the citizens' rights and the State's urban prosperity. As per human rights law, many
countries also believe that relocating citizens to a new location with proper infrastructure and basic services that meet their basic needs is beneficial. However, the associated degree of satisfaction in terms of improving the quality of life and the living conditions of the urban poor is relatively low due to various interlinked factors that have not been taken into consideration while making the relocation decision (Kaspe et al., 2012).

Similarly, resettlement policies became the only type of intervention in Egypt's poor urban communities. Recently, there has been a great initiation towards eradicating unsafe slums and removing its citizens to a more organized community. The government believes that resettlement positively impacts citizens' lives, where they are settled in higher quality housing units in modern communities away from environmental hazards and tenure problems. Such on-ground interventions have been reported to negatively affect people's social and economic conditions in these unsafe areas. These decisions have had a determinant impact on deteriorating the situation of the poor urban living in slums by simply making the poor poorer. Resettlement has helped destroy the stated communities' socio-economic foundation (Eissa et al., 2016).

Simply, citizens have been socially disintegrated and economically worse off. These interventions mainly end with relocating them to new houses instead of effectively guaranteeing the rights of inhabitants and helping them maintain their work and livelihood.

Nevertheless, the Egyptian authorities have started relocating residents, particularly those living in the hazardous and life-threatening slums, to new housing communities, drawing a lot of criticism and giving insight into the ongoing upgrade of one of the most important sites in Egypt.

"An example of that will be people living in life-threatening areas, so whatever you do is to move people to the closest place possible because their life-threatening areas, for example, beneath the Mokattam mountain, is an uninhabitable area, which means that rocks might fall at any time, and kill people. Thus, this matter is given the highest priority since this case satisfies the first category of risk identified by the ISDF and discussed previously. Of course, you can come up with the human rights charter, as it identified that "as the last option, especially in life-threatening areas, people should be located in other new places." (international organization representative1, 28th of August 2021)

Government representatives claimed that the state is relocating the citizens living under health and life-risk conditions. In some rare cases, the citizens are relocated for investment purposes, especially if the land value is treasured and can generate national income. Urban policymakers usually compromise between the area's development plan and its economic value within any urban
development policy. Then, if the economic value of the location is important, demolition practices are found to be the optimum solution. The Maspero Triangle is a prominent example that satisfies the investment goal, as the next section will explain. The State worked on a project to develop and maximize its added value and transform the territory into a touristic and commercial destination to utilize its strategic location.

"In the case of the historical neighborhood of Maspero triangle, many historical buildings go back to the Mamluk era. Accordingly, the government started to announce the evacuation of many families because of their unsafe housing conditions. Then, the government began to relocate around 4500 families to the Asmarat project in the Mokattan neighborhood. Aligned with this initiation is to upgrade the Maspiro triangle and maximize the place value and function as a tourist and economic hub in the heart of Cairo". (Policymaker 1, 9th of September, 2021)

However, demolishing areas for investment purposes is not always the only motivation behind the relocation strategies in Egypt. The purpose of relocating people living in life-threatening areas is completely the opposite. Here the government was trying to find a real solution for unsafe areas and save the lives of the urban poor living in disaster-prone areas.

"The abided policies succeeded in eradicating the unsafe slum areas, and there are various valuable examples like that of "Tell el akareb, and Dweika." Here I mean that the policies were perfectly directed to address the situation and were influential in providing a better community for the urbanely marginalized groups. This is obvious when comparing the community's situation pre and post the intervention."(Governmental representative, 2,22nd of September 2021)

Nevertheless, relocation is meant to be the last option utilized by the Egyptian government. Interviewees reported that they first try to find a solution that does not remove the citizens; however, if the situation is severe enough to incur a human loss, relocating citizens might be seen as the only solution.

"Relocating citizens is not always the optimal solution unless the situation requires evicting the location. For example, in areas highly exposed to floods, we usually seek the assistance of the designated authority to analyze the situation and provide a concrete solution, such as building dams, allocating places for water collection, etc. However, if the study fails to achieve the required level of maintenance, then we should follow another mechanism to rescue the citizens, and at that point, we relocate the citizens to a new adaptive location." (Governmental representative, 1, 12th of September 2021)

Despite being the safer solution that succeeded in providing housing facilities for disadvantaged dwellers, the relocation policy is still highly criticized for being initiated solely from the safety
and urban perspectives while ignoring the relocated citizens' socio-economic perspectives and quality-of-life standards. One policymaker explains:

"If you refer to all the previously executed projects in this field, you will find that the socio-economic perspectives have been neglected. Although they are crucial pillars in any strategic plan, in Egypt, that matter is pure urban. Let us apply this in reality; when relocating the citizens living in Manshaiat Nasser, the concern was to rescue the citizens living in disaster-prone areas. Fortunately, the citizens were moved into a more developed and properly planned community. Still, we can ask a simple question: Does the relocation process address requirements of the needy citizens? The answer is kind of skeptical’’. (Policymaker 2, 24th of September 2021)

In general, relocating citizens is a good option; however, the socio-economic perspectives should be ideally addressed while drawing the strategy. Yet, looking into the situation from an urban point of view is not always the best solution. Then, we should reduce urban problems by creating coherent and viable social policies that focus more on human needs and well-being.

**The Advantages of the Asmarat housing project**

The state's concern towards providing habitable shelters to hazardous slum dwellers is recognized in two different scenes acknowledged in the pre and post-relocation eras. The first scene incepts the trajectory of living conditions of Manshaiat Nasser settlement. The Inhabitants of Manshaiat Nasser have been battling marginalization and inferiority aligned with their impoverished living conditions that lacked the essential security and safety considerations. From shakes built from decaying materials portrayed with leaked sewage networks and accumulated garbage in deteriorating quality streets and infrastructure that impedes the proper movement, Manshays residents have been suffering the impoverished housing status, with a high incidence of informality that is threatening their safe habilitation.

On the other hand, inside the "Asmartat complex," a complete alteration has been identified in the quality of urban living. The new housing project aimed to improve people's lives by providing them with a comprehensive housing complex with an adequately planned architectural style accompanied by sewage networks, clean water connections, and all the facilities needed to ameliorate the living conditions. The housing units were provided to the citizens in a properly structured manner, fully furnished, and equipped with all appliances needed. The allotted spaces for each apartment were of average size for a family of more than three members to live. Indeed, the new housing program tried to provide the citizens with all the amenities they were deprived of in their old locations. in addition, the citizens were provided with service buildings attached to the
residential units, such as schools, medical and sports centers, formalized markets, open spaces, green areas, and playgrounds.

The new housing option has provided a high-security location, where control measures and laws assure safety and security. Contrary to the condition of Manshaiaat Nasser, the locations, particularly near the mountain cliff, were areas harboring lawbreakers and other criminal acts such as smuggling, drug dealing, and many other illegal practices that describe unsafe slum lives. As one citizen mentioned

‘Finally, I am living in an apartment, securing the lives of the rest of my children. If I had been granted this apartment 9 years earlier, I wouldn't have lost my poor child, who had been killed fighting the lawbreakers who invaded our room (Asmarat citizen 3, 8th of November 2021)

The existence of the Asmarat project represents the Egyptian government’s intensive efforts to provide decent shelter for citizens in risky areas. It clarifies the alternation on the governmental agenda in offering alternative decent and habitable housing options. However, the project’s implementation was viewed with a high level of paradox. In all, the paradox was not about prioritizing risky slums in the government agenda but was about the degree of success in implementing the project within the criteria that guarantee people's satisfaction and an accelerated quality of life (Sayed, 2020).

Relocation went wrong

Indeed, the Egyptian government seeks to provide apartments for new citizens and maintains decent life animates to ensure a better future. However, the relocated citizens of Manshaiaat Nasser, Dweika, and Maspiro triangle have shared many grievances about life in Asmarat, which assures that certain determinants in relocation policies have gone wrong. The complaints were grouped into three categories: lack of services, torn social ties, and unemployment. They stated that the location lacks comprehensive service and security networks, including (hospitals, schools, markets, transportation, and police stations). They also suffered from dismantling their social ties, where some of the neighbors were relocated in Masaken Osman building on the 6th of October, others were financially compensated, and others remained in their old locations. Besides, the eviction process affected employment rates, stating that most markets were demolished, and the people were not compensated to resume their work. The relocation policies have missed the crucial pillars that provide social and economic prosperity for its dwellers
"One should highlight that in all the previously stated examples, all the concern was to develop the physical buildings, including the infrastructure and the roads; however, the socio-economic dimensions of the citizens were not properly addressed" (Policymaker 1,9th of September 2021)

Another commented that:

"Generally, the practiced policies are efficiently and effectively adopted. However, other interlinked dimensions are required to achieve sustainability while drawing the strategies. For example, all the designated institutions should be working on a cross-sectional level rather than focusing solely on the urban perspective". (Government representative 2, 22nd of September,2021)

Although relocating citizens was the only solution to guarantee safer settlements, it seems not the best option for the relocated citizens. Compared to the upgrading example of the Zerrzara area, the situation is totally the opposite. Zerzarra has been upgraded, with all the other variables being constant. All that has been missing is frequent maintenance and awareness programs. However, in the relocation process, these variables have been altered within the provision of the new housing settlements. This gives insights into the governmental failure to introduce a clear vision or an integrated strategy that aims at developing slum areas with respect to sustainable development goals and dimensions. However, the effort has been directed to solve the problems associated with high-risk areas, ignoring relocated citizens' economic and social dimensions. Thus, the strategy entails an alternation in the scope of the executed projects to become more broadly addressed. It requires dealing with the case of the unsafe informal settlements in Egypt from an urban, socio, economic and environmental perspective rather than dealing with this agenda solely from an urban security and real estate investment perspective. Thereafter, the stories of Mashaiat Nasser’s families and the responses of the evacuated citizens are delineated in the coming sections.

5.2. CASE STUDY RESULTS: RELOCATING MANSHAIAT NASSER TO ASMARAT

5.2.1. MANSHAIAT NASSER: RESIDENTS REMAINING ON SITE

Mansheya’s Unique Physical Location

Manshiaiat Nasser, or Cairo garbage city, located in east Cairo on the outskirts of the Mokattam hills, is one of the largest informal areas and the most populated informal settlements in Africa (Tadamun, 2020). The location's features have made up an important part of its urban fabric which imposes various opportunities and threats to its inhabitants. Furthermore, it has clearly defined administrative boundaries, mainly including several areas: the first area is located below the
Mokkatam hill, which includes Ezbet Bekeet, El Deweka, Wadi el Froun, and Suzan Mubarak buildings. In contrast, the other area is located above the Mokattam hill and is known as El Zarayeb area, the Wahayed, Etnenat, and El Tatatat area. These administrative boundaries often have little impact on reality, where residents define their boundaries as influenced by shared circumstances, histories, and social bonds (Tadamun, 2020). However, since the continual injection of new population inhibiting Manshaiat Nasser, the area's demographics and features have been changing over decades, as stated below:

"Since I have been living here for almost 50 years, the place has differed entirely. In the late 70s, the site was not crowded; the area included only a few families who had immigrated searching for decent job opportunities. We had the option to build buildings and create our community. Since years passed, the location has become crowded and overpopulated." (Manshaiat Nasser citizen 2, 7th of November 2021)

The settlement's site has been one of its major strengths that adds attractiveness and popularity to the territory. Although the location describes the settlement's situation and relation to the physical urban environment around it and other settlements. However, the situation of Manshaiat Nasser has been prone to a continual alternation of its human and physical features, as mentioned below:

"According to Manshaiat Nasser, I have lived approximately all my life here, our location is strategic along the Autostrad road, and we are easily connected to all the other districts. In fact, our strategic location is one of the preferable aspects that makes us love the place. However, the demographics have changed entirely. In the last thirty years, the location has become very populated, the streets are overcrowded and noisy, but we got used to it." (Manshaiat Nasser citizen 2, 7th of November 2021)

Besides the area's locational description, the area encompasses various urban landmarks that increase its location's value. The area includes a variety of historical and Islamic mosques such as Quitbay mosque, sultan Barkouk mosque, and Mohamed Ali family's tombs, and there are other religious Christian buildings and churches such as amba Simon monastery (Isabelle, 2014).

"Manshaiat Nasser has its own history; there are some historical monuments, like the church of amba samaan and other historical tombs. We sometimes find students, geologists, and foreigners doing studies and maintaining field studies in these historical areas." (Manshaiat Nasser citizen 2, 7th of November 2021)

---

8 Suzan Mubarak housing project is a state owned housing project offered to the rescuers of the Dweika rock crisis that happened on 2008. It is a part of a larger slum neigbourhood of Dweika, and it was renovated by the former first lady Mrs Suzzane Mubarak, the widow of the previous Egyptian president Mr Hosni Mubarak.
At this point, the locations' area, boundaries, and history were comprehended, and the aim when asking this question was to clearly describe the area's location and the alternation that might have been perceived. Meanwhile, after interviewing the dwellers, it was clear that the location of Manshait Nasser encompasses various strategic opportunities and strengths that make it one of the most historic and important informal areas in Cairo. However, it also encompasses various threats and weaknesses which impose potential risks to its inhabitants.

**Services and basic amenities**

One main concern of the research was to understand the provision of services and facilities in the location and how this contributes to the quality-of-life determinants. By holding the virtue that the provision of locational facilities determines the degree of satisfaction with the physical and socio-economic conditions of an individual occupying an urban space (Alvarez and Eie, 2017). This means that urban amenities and neighborhood characteristics directly affect the level of satisfaction incurred. Therefore, using the life satisfaction approach, where individuals assess their perception of services and facilities provided, is a prerequisite in determining the quality of urban life (Jaitman and Barkaz, 2013). According to Maslow’s hierarchy of needs discussed in chapter 1, maintaining a considerable level of satisfaction or connection to the location impacts the quality of life and is considered a prerequisite in the hierarchal human needs. Thus, fulfilling the needs of the individuals living in the same area is a precondition of urban sustainability and a prerequisite for the dwellers' well-being for achieving a progressed quality of life.

The individuals living in Manshait Nasser have pointed out various strengths in the neighborhood facilities and services that make their location preferable for the neighborhood's daily demands and activities. Such facilities include accessibility to neighborhood facilities, access to daily amenities, social activities, and open spaces, which are considered crucial in the urban community, besides having access to other services such as health services, education, and other social services which contribute to urban qualities and affect Manshait Nasser inhabitant's quality of life.

"Manshait Nasser is a location where you can find whatever you want. We rarely go out to finalize any issue or buy anything; fortunately, we are not missing any service here. All the services exist here. Whenever we want to buy anything, we will buy it spontaneously in no time." (Manshait Nasser citizen 2, 7th of November 2021)

In addition, another interviewee agreed that Manshait Nasser includes a variety of comprehensive services
"Manshaiat Nasser does not lack the necessary services, such as governmental schools, health centers, hospitals, markets selling subsidized products, youth centers, police, fire stations, postal offices, mosques, and churches. In terms of transportation, we have more than one transportation facility, a bus station, a minibus station (micro-bus), and lots of Toktoks, which can be easily found everywhere. Besides, various public and private transportation connects city dwellers to other locations and vice versa, so it is reachable anyone can visit us, and we can move freely without feeling remotely located and without facing a proximity problem." (Manshaiat Nasser citizen 1, 7th of November 2021)

Despite the strengths of the location processes, the citizens encounter various problems that require immediate intervention to ameliorate the living standards and develop the quality-of-life determinants for each dweller. Accordingly, it is noticeable that Manshaiat Nasser dwellers complain about the quality and quantity of amenities provided. Although all the services are provided, the inhabitants perceived low satisfaction regarding the poor public services provided. For example, the residents complained about the inadequate health services provided in their location. They also suffer from low educational quality and unresponsiveness to the civil protection services. One resident elaborated:

"Although there are schools and hospitals, we rarely find the service we are always seeking. One of the major problems encountered is related to poor educational and health services. Although there are four governmental schools, there is still a deficiency in the number of teaching staff compared to the number of students. There is no secondary school for girls, which makes the majority of the females not obtain a progressed level of education. Also, most of the school's buildings are deteriorated and are prone to be entirely devastated. Additionally, El Shiek Zayed hospital is one of the biggest hospitals in the area, and there is still a problem with the number of skilled staff and the absence of medical supplies and utilities, which makes it very hard to rescue any individual. The area also lacks civil protection services, such as police, ambulance,), mainly the streets are not paved, and they are very narrow matter which impedes the emergency vehicle from reaching its destination." (Manshaiat Nasser citizen 3, 7th of November 2021)

Citizens are facing problems related to overpopulation and other issues related to poorly constructed and congested streets, which act as a predicament towards the ease of mobility inside the location. This caused further pressure on the already scarce resources as one interviewee explained:

"Another problem we face is overpopulation, and the streets are always overcrowded with children playing in the streets and people selling and buying stuff. The demographics increase daily, streets are condensed, and areas are overpopulated. The demand for the services is high, and the service is rarely provided." (Manshaiat Nasser citizen 2, 7th of November 2021)
Also, while Manshaiat Nasser citizens have a long history of informal garbage collection, and it is noticeable that the area has no efficient garbage disposal system that adequately reduces the level of waste. Due to this unorganized process of sorting trash, the area is haphazardly covered with garbage, including streets and rooftops of the settlements leading to an unhygienic environment, which makes the living situation unhealthy and conditions are below acceptable standards.

"Our location is the most polluted area in Egypt, the garbage is accumulated everywhere, and there is no opportunity to have green places. The situation is ignored, and many of the city dwellers are prone to health problems due to the haphazard accumulation of garbage and the lack of a proper disposal network."
(Manshaiat Nasser citizen 3, 7th of November 2021)

Within the lack of the proper supply of basic facilities that respond to the populational demand, the citizens are striving to receive the basic services and are complaining of not receiving the basic assistance when required. As a result, the quality of urban life may be viewed as an essential component of a holistic urban sustainability framework. The recent focus on the quality of life and livability is a symptom of a more holistic approach to creating more sustainable and livable urban environments; it is apparent that it is an extension of social sustainability, social justice, and equity within sustainable development.

**Infrastructure**

Since one of the key characteristics that distinguish a region as "informal" or "ashwaiat" is its lack of infrastructure, here infrastructure is a crucial aspect that constitutes the daily lives of inhabitants, and this includes the proper installation of water, sewerage, and electricity networks, which provides the inhabitants with the minimum quality of living (Wahby, 2013). However, most of the areas in Manshaiat Nasser lack the proper infrastructure, making certain areas less developed and more impoverished in terms of basic facilities provided compared with other locations in the same area. Nevertheless, Manshaiat Nasser is perceived as an illegitimate settlement since it lacked state-provided facilities. It is also regarded as a site where the state could not afford to create such infrastructures due to its informal nature. The tin homes where the residences resided were one of the most visible instances of their temporality and fragility. These constructions were created by the inhabitants themselves, using recycled materials. This adversely affected the area's level of services and required immediate intervention to provide proper infrastructure and maintenance (Klein, 2020).
"Waadi Freoun is one of the least developed areas in Manshaiat Nasser, where basic utilities such as water and electricity are not adequately provided. Even the houses there are built from tins, woods, nests, and other improvised materials. Also, the "wahayed, etnenat,and talatat area" areas are usually condensed even the inner streets lack the proper infrastructure, and rarely does it reach an adequate water supply." (Manshaiat Nasser citizen 1, 7\textsuperscript{th} of November 2021)

This means that certain areas mainly located above the mountain cliff lack the basic infrastructure; however, even if it exists, it is either lacks the proper installation and maintenance needed for the living community,

"The places with water connections need continuous maintenance as some of the pipelines were stolen, and others need frequent maintenance. Besides, we are constantly facing problems with sewage, as there are no designed spaces to collect sewage, and even when found, they are not properly installed. Also, there are uncovered electric cables, which require consciousness not to get any electric shots". (Manshaiat Nasser citizen 1, 7\textsuperscript{th} of November 2021)

Although it is noted that certain areas inside the location lack infrastructure, it is apparent that the entire population suffers from the poor quality of infrastructure. It is noted that the areas are not adequately equipped to address the daily needs of the dwellers, and even when provided, it is very problematic, provided in low quality and rarely maintained. The families also suffered from poor sanitation and unreliable water sources contaminated and mixed with sewage water, leading to chorionic health problems.

"We barely can find water, drainage, or sewage networks. If you conduct a health survey, you will find that most suffer from hepatitis c and kidney problems due to unclean networks. Also, electricity is unstable, and people steal it from public networks. Even The streets are rarely paved, hindering the ease of mobility and transportation inside the location. We rarely see any governmental intervention and are trying to find solutions ourselves." (Manshaiat Nasser citizen 3, 7\textsuperscript{th} of November 2021)

It is evident that the area lacks the basic amenities, infrastructure, and services; this provides a more explicit connotation of the level of informality. Moreover, it is evident that infrastructure is a factor influencing what people value in their location as it shows the actual situation of the daily life indicators of slum dwellers. Indeed, the proper infrastructure is evidence of a legitimate state. It is considered a prerequisite of the quality-of-life indicator; improving the infrastructure considerably impacts the overall quality of life and the living standard of any neighborhood.
International organizations and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) in Manshaiat Nasser

The GIZ, as an international organization, has proved to have an advanced level of involvement in Manshaiat Nasser. It became the only known international organization with a significant presence in the area and the pioneer of development programs (Elmouelhi et al., 2015). Their work in Manshaiat Nasser arose in reaction to the city's rising poverty, a lack of physical infrastructure, a lack of social services and jobs, and deteriorating environmental conditions. The organization's mandate in Manshaiat Nasser was to provide technical assistance to government agencies and civil society organizations to help them perform and deliver improved and more coordinated services to meet the poor's basic needs. Priorities were given, enhancing service delivery and updating water, sewerage, power networks, and infrastructure networks (Abdel Azim, 2011).

"With the assistance of the development projects undertaken by the German agency for international cooperation GIZ, certain territories in Manshaiat Nasser have been provided with adequate infrastructure, including paved routes and sewage networks, especially in" Ezbet Bekiet "area. However, the "Zarayeb area," with the assistance of Mrs. Leila Iskander and MR"Ibrahim Mehleb" has been provided with an adequate water supply, which was not provided earlier." (Manshaiat Nasser citizen 1, 7th of November, 2021)

Despite the organization's initiation in achieving tangible long-term projects in Manshaiat Nasser, the project has been criticized for not adequately implementing the programs related to enhancing the economic conditions of its dwellers.

"Despite the positive impact in the location, we were blamed for not concentrating on tackling the crucial needs, mainly concerned with the economic environment and employment creation. Yet, we were facing predicaments related to financing, sustainability from one side, and lack of awareness and incoherent governmental penetration strategies from the other side. This is why we mainly focused on urban upgrading" (International organization representative, 24th of October, 2021)

Since the GIZ fell short to achieve the socio-economic considerations of slum dwellers, the implementation of social policies is complemented by philanthropic institutions. In Manshaiat Nasser's context, various non-governmental organizations (NGOs) intervention has filled its history (Klein, 2020). These interventions include training youth rehabilitation programs, vocational skills development, and developing poor areas by providing the required infrastructure, all of which are highly interactive with city dwellers as it assists in alleviating their living standards and financial situations. However, since the enforcement of NGOs law 70 of 2017, few national
NGOs have been permitted to engage in civil society activities (Natil, et al., 2019). Likewise, inside Manshaiat Nasser, few domestic NGOs had introduced a suitable development approach to enhance the livelihood conditions of the city dwellers. However, these national NGOs are striving to alleviate the living conditions of Manshaiat Nasser as follows:

"Manshaiat Nasser youth association exerted effort in various socio-economic dimensions. The scope of the association includes education: illiteracy programs, health and hygiene, special needs rehabilitation programs and activities, training courses, and child care." (NGO 1, 7th of November 2021)

"The youth association of Manshaiat Nasser targets three main aspects: awareness, building capacity of the inhabitance, education, and community empowerment. First of all, building capacity is our first step, aiming to achieve an accelerated level of the inhabitants' standard of living. Increasing awareness among citizens was a prerequisite for all the citizens, especially female breadwinners, youth, and people with disabilities. In addition, the association provides illiteracy courses and encourages females to complete their education, especially in schools. Manshaiat Nasser's youth are provided training courses that assist in providing licenses, which facilitates being enrolled and having an employment opportunity." (NGO 1, 7th of November 2021)

However, the Egyptian NGO faced various constraints that impeded its progress and achievements in reality. Mainly, the state remains short of ignoring the improvement of dwellers' livelihood conditions. Furthermore, it was mentioned that the government was not supporting the NGO's activities inside the location, and it was clear that the governmental decisions were taken solely from the urban perspective, leaving other perspectives unaddressed (Catherine, 2016).

"Our NGOs face various constraints related to the issue of financing, and thus the association's role in problem-solving was limited. The Ministry of social solidarity role is nearly absent regarding the required support for the vulnerable people of the slum area. Inhabitants request the adoption of the in-situ development approach without being relocated to other distinct areas to preserve social bonds and economic activities." (NGO 1, 7th of November 2021)

The members of the Manshaiat Nasser association are themselves the citizens of Manshaiat Nasser slum areas, so they are fully aware of the actual size of the problems they face. It was mentioned that the association's proactive decisions prevent further complications. Despite the efforts, Manshaiat Nasser's community is still deprived of its essential services and utilities as Manshaiat Nasser, as a growing community, is still confronting difficulties related to the necessary services and support. The association calls for the contribution of the government to provide more help and support. The association requests collaboration with the Ministry of social solidarity and the Ministry of social affairs to offer more assistance to the needy people of Manshaiat Nasser.
Social fabric

In general, urban space and society are inextricably linked; it is impossible to imagine a place without social substance or a society without a spatial component. Individuals within a community collaborate and interact with society. Thus, since social relationships and social cohesiveness need solid social interactions, the idea of community is essential to people's overall quality of life and sense of belonging. Built settings that allow social activities and human contact strengthen social bonds and cultural groups and contribute to social quality (Alvarez and Ele, 2017).

According to the situation of Manshaiat Nasser, its residents are derived from the same hometown, creating strong social bonds that extended throughout all the Manshaiat Nasser neighborhood districts and helped formulate a sense of cohesiveness and safety.

"Many citizens settled here and created powerful social ties that extended throughout the neighborhood and made the residents feel safe. The people here adhere to the same traditions and customs and share the same beliefs. Besides, the community accepts the differences; there is no religious segregation or discrimination among Muslims and Christians; we are all one family, sharing the same ethnic beliefs." (Manshaiat Nasser citizen 3, 7th of November 2021)

Another resident added:

"One of the major strengths in the location is its social bonds among different families. We have very strong social networking and solid social fabrics. We know each other, share the same events, and abide by the same cultural roles and traditions. Our culture is homogeneous; we used to speak the same language and share the same concerns. I have neighbors who are more than families. We used to support and help each other in every situation. we are all one hand, and we all know each other and celebrate the same happy and heartbreaking occasions." (Manshaiat Nasser citizen 1, 7th of November 2021)

The citizens admitted that they had created an unbreakable social cohesion in Manshaiat Nasser. These strong social ties are one of the major strengths of the location and are also among the favorable aspects that create more sense of belonging to the place. Yet, the interviewed citizens were among those who have lived in the location for not less than three decades. Thus, they have created a great number of acquaintances in their community and established a strong neighborhood created of extended families, relatives, and neighbors. In the informal settlement of Manshaiat Nasser, neighbors are frequently portrayed as a source of support. Their involvement includes assistance in emergencies, financial hardship, and emotional strains. These social networks helped to create a sense of belongingness among citizens that helped them overcome the sense of urban
marginalization and inferiority. These social ties are expected to be extensively fragmented and segregated when relocation policies are enacted due to the potential breakage in the social and lively hood networks.

**Economic inclusion and job opportunities**

Having a decent job opportunity and acquiring a minimum income improves the prosperity of urban areas and, as a result, improves the quality of life in cities. Some essential determinants of life quality include the citizens' capacity to acquire products and services. Economic security is a notion relating to individuals and is critical to citizens' functioning. However, the situation of slum dwellers living in slum areas might be the opposite since they live below the international poverty rates and live in the most deplorable and improvised living standards, which lack the basic necessities of human life. According to Manshaiat Nasser, many practiced professions constitute their inhabitants' economic well-being and flourishment. Still, its demographics include a diversity of employed citizens mainly working in handcraft positions, garbage-related activities, and other vocations. Inside the location, many practiced professions constitute the economic well-being of their inhabitants.

"The location inhibits the same characteristics of any society. It consists of families, breadwinners, youngsters, and older people who thrive on having decent living standards and are looking forward to fulfilling their daily basic needs." (Manshaiat Nasser citizen 3,7th of November 2021)

Manshaiat Nasser is distinguished from any other slum area as it is known for the emergence of artisanal crafts and small industries. It is also known for its commonly practiced profession and the creation of community groups that adequately utilize its skills. Most of the citizens who left their home towns and settled in Manshaiat Nasser brought their trades and crafts with them, where a considerable percentage of the community succeeded in creating their own handicrafts workshops the matter which can be described as an organized informal settlement with a high level of professionalism and low level of unemployment.

"In our closed community, most of us work and live here, and this adds value to our location by making it a comprehensive place where you can live and work. We have the top carpenters and car maintenance workshops, and we usually see outsiders from Maadi and Giza who are consulting the mechanical workshops. We also have highly expertized citizens in aluminum manufacturing as there are various operating workshops in this field. Generally, we as a community possess a high level of employment rates. Although we are not working in any governmental
institution, we work hard in our area of interest and establish our reputation in our diversified field.” (Manshiaat Nasser citizen 2,7th of November 2021)

Garbage collection has played a pivotal role in determining the main profession practiced by the individuals in Manshiaat Nasser. In fact, the garbage collection activity was transformed from a rural community into a new urban community with a specific economic activity within newly established economic and social tiles. As the garbage accumulated, the garbage collectors' community thrived in Manshiet Nasser, creating one of the world's greatest systems for recycling solid waste with conventional equipment. To maximize revenues, members of this society recycle practically everything. Using cheap, locally built machinery, they experiment with numerous techniques to recycle any type of material and occasionally refurbish the leftovers into new goods (Tadamun, 2020)

"Manshiaat Nasser is a well-known community that deals with trash collections. It established a strong reputation in solid waste management and recycling the solid waste in traditional ways. Various workshops deal with recycling and producing small handcrafts. Yet, the youth are talented and quick learners and more efficient than any machine. Also, most people working in garbage collection, mainly females, collect plastic and paper, which are later recycled in well-known factories." (Manshiaat Nasser citizen 3,7th of November 2021)

Accordingly, inside Manshiaat Nasser, the economic activities and social networks are essential advantages that add more value to the location. During the field visit maintained, and while holding the interviews, one could conclude that the location means a lot to its inhabitants. However, specific points require further development, and this development does not require abolishing the location or forcing the inhabitants to evict the location and settle in another. The community members admitted that the government is making the situation more difficult by relocating them. It is noteworthy that the government has never viewed these crafts and industries as a potential source of development and progress, nor has it worked to create policies and regulations that assist the owners or improve working conditions. Instead, the government concentrated on the urban problems and decided to relocate the citizens to an area they perceived as convenient to gather 'unwanted' citizens, hoping they would fade from the city's official image.

Lived Experiences and Abandoning Manshiaat Nasser

Although the residents complained about the poor services and deplorable living standards, moving the citizens to safer houses is facing huge opposition from the inhabitants. Residences expressed their fear of evicting the place where they lived for decades. In addition, breaking the
social ties of the communities and terminating their practices in the location is also not welcomed; in fact, leaving Manshaiat Nasser was expressed with shared grievance among its inhabitants. However, the citizens call for more upgrading interventions tailored based on an adequate survey held to the location, community participation, and response to their demands.

"I will never think of leaving my place. I know everyone here; all the services are near me, and even my sons work here in Mansheya. I need nothing except the government to leave us alone. We don't want to leave our place. We are rooted here; we will probably die if we leave Mansheya. I hope my grandchildren will have the opportunity to live here and not be located in any remote or different area where no one knows the name of their neighbors. I hope we will never get scattered". (Manshaiat Nasser citizen 3,7th of November 2021)

Regarding this issue, the government anticipated that ignoring the community’s needs will lead to their disappearance over time. It also expects that the relocated communities, by default, will discover alternate economic and social determinants and cope with the new community. The government is more oriented toward the idea of how to rescue these communities while leaving them to address their issues without assistance. Thus, many policies were not based on the vision that these communities possess certain problems that should be addressed, and the citizens' considerations should be prioritized.

"The location is perfect; what is inside the place needs more attention. We need government representatives to listen to our requests, and we must be indulged in decision-making. If they consider our concerns, they will find it easier to reach the optimum solutions." (Manshaiat Nasser citizen 2,7th of November 2021)

The current policies have been criticized for being completely obscure, enacted without a clear plan, and left haphazardly with no predefined vision. It was highlighted that resettlement is not the best policy that works on behalf of the citizens. Some citizens have relatives living in Asmarat complex, and they pointed out that the removed citizens are suffering social and economic deprivation, and their living standards have been harshly affected by the relocation decision.

“"The governmental practices are awkward nowadays; there are no clear plans pertaining to the role played by the government. We don't understand the role of the government regarding this agenda. We don't know what is happening, what will happen, or what should be happening.'’’ (Manshaiat Nasser citizen 3,7th of November 2021)

Also, the citizens shared their thoughts pertaining to the complete abolishment of the site and the relocation to the Asmarat complex. They criticized the forced eviction and relocation policies for
violating their rights. They also shared their discontent regarding forcing them to abandon their location without being previously notified or financially compensated.

“We heard many stories about the living standard of the citizens living in Asmarat city. One of the major problems was broken social networks, low productivity, and limited job opportunities. The factors that contribute to living standards and human rights are not considered. We know that finding an adequate shelter is one of the human rights, but the unforeseen factors behind the adequate shelter should also be considered.’’ (Manshiaiat Nasser citizen 1,7th of November 2021)

At this point, the citizens expressed their opposition towards forced eviction and relocation. Three main aspects supported this opposition. The first issue refers to ineffective governmental decisions and a lack of transparency and professionalism. The second is related to the degree of attachment to the location where the citizens have established strong social bonds and managed to have a stable source of income. The third aspect refers to the relocation lace itself. Here, the citizens are afraid to lose their job opportunities and bear any additional expenses imposed by the government to regulate and manage the new community. All the citizens agreed that they need to be provided the minimum quality of living on Manshiaiat Nasser, which will be facilitated by upgrading the area and providing better services to alleviate their living standards. However, the opinions of the relocated citizens pertaining to these issues will be extensively analyzed in the coming section.

5.2.2. EL ASMARAT CITY: RELOCATED RESIDENTS’ LIVED EXPERIENCES

Geography and Built Environment

The urban environment of the relocated inhabitants has changed dramatically since their existence in Asmarat neighborhood. There is an apparent alternation in the surrounding urbanity, including the quality of buildings, streets, and open spaces. The resettled inhabitants used to live inadequately constructed rooms made from tins and wooden bricks. However, they are now granted well-constructed housing units with all the required facilities.

The granted residential buildings consist of nine-floor apartments with six units in each stage that have been fully furnished and equipped. The apartments are located in an urban planned area, which includes service areas, surrounded by paved roads and green areas. The Asmarat complex includes health units and governmentally regulated markets (regulated by the Egyptian armed forces). Besides, the location contains several allotted spaces for the inhabitants to practice their daily activities. This includes sports playgrounds, mosques, churches, schools, kinder gardens, and parking lots.
"I cannot deny that the place is better structured and planned, streets are paved, and buildings are colorfully painted. It is a part of the governmental initiation (Tahya Misr) to develop the situation of unsafe informal houses in Egypt. We have been notified that the project will be established across three phases and will attract almost 15 thousand families living in unsafe areas across the whole governorate. The project promised to grand us sanitized houses in properly planned and organized buildings, with green areas to play and youth centers to practice desirable activities." (Asmarat citizen 1, the 8th of November 2021)

Another citizen agreed that the location is properly constructed and well planned, especially compared to the physical urban environment they used to live in their old location.

"The Asmarat is appropriately planned, and the houses are adequately established. The streets are paved, and there are sewage and water networks. Also, there are green spaces and yards for children to play in, a church and a mosque, the location is adequately designed with the safety standards, and we are less prone to any other rock slide or another natural disaster." (Asmarat citizen 2, 8 November, 2021)

However, after experiencing the relocation process, the citizens admitted they regretted it. They added that they suffered from isolation, marginalization, disintegration, and deprivation from accessing the basic services, maintaining the same social relations, and commissioning their commonly practiced jobs. Therefore, with the new location and its eligibility to improve the quality-of-life standards of slum dwellers, the aim of receiving a sustainable and comprehensive public project became questionable. Yet, the reasons that support this idea will be presented in the coming section.

**Residents’ Relocation Experiences**

After 14 years of the Dweika rock slide accident, the agenda of informal settlements has been given priority. Accordingly, the houses above and below the mountain cliff were categorized as risky and required immediate intervention. Afterward, a group of archeologists and geologists interfered to secure any leakages in the mountain cliff. However, the rocks decayed entirely due to the lack of a proper sewage network, particularly those located above the cliff. When plan A failed to achieve its target, the government started to work on plan B, which entails eradicating the unsafe areas and relocating the citizens to other locations. Meanwhile, families living above and below the mountain cliff were given the opportunity to be moved to different locations.

The process of relocating citizens has been narrated differently by governmental representatives and city dwellers. When interviewing the top-tier governmental representatives and policymakers, they mentioned that the relocation process had been perfectly handled. The process included
maintaining frequent surveys and field visits to properly identify and categorize the risk-prone areas and the percentage of the families subject to relocation. The survey included the community members, who have been aware of all the required levels of intervention. Additionally, the representatives admitted that the evacuation process had been held according to the citizens' consent, and dwellers had received various notifications and were given a prohibition period to leave the location.

On the contrary, the citizens admitted that the decisions were not transparent. They were not notified that they would leave their homes. They kept hearing the news regarding upgrading projects held by the ministry of planning and other international organizations. However, the case was different; there was a lack of transparency and openness, and the decisions were taken from the higher level and implemented without telling or even notifying them. Accordingly, the representatives kept bulldozing the houses in a very inhuman process.

“In the beginning, we were brainwashed. They told us that the project is financed by 'Tahya Misr fund', which aims at alleviating the situation of inhabitants living in informal areas. They said that as per the presidential initiation, the area will be upgraded in an attempt to provide better living standards in terms of renovating houses and providing accessible water and electricity facilities and other facilities. Afterward, some governmental representatives announced that certain areas will be completely demolished as they are more prone to rock slides.” (Asmarat citizen 3, 8th of November 2021)

The third inhabitant expressed his feelings towards the relocation process by adding

"We found some of the representatives from the governorate gathering people and telling them that they will start evicting us to the new projects starting today. How come to eradicate my house and did not allow me even to gather my belongings? They said that the area where I live will be totally abolished within 2 hours, which is insufficient time to collect our items. Unfortunately, these couple of hours were not enough to manage our situation, and there was no room for an extension. Our homes were totally abolished, the government started the bulldozing process, and some people refused to leave their places. However, the government invaded their rooms, insulted and treated them badly, and kept threatening them. We were trapped and forced to leave the place we were not allowed to say goodbye to our neighbors.” (Asmarat citizen 2, the 8th of November 2021)

The distinction between voluntary and forced eviction is apparent in this part. Similar to the international relocation practices mentioned in the literature review, where the inhabitants were not a part of the relocation decision and have not been given the opportunity to either refuse or agree, the presented case here is not different. The inhabitants have no say, their houses are
demolished, and they are evicted by force. This attempt violates the international human rights law, which states that evictions should only be carried out as the last resort after all feasible options have been investigated in consultation with those concerned. The process also does not go in line with article #63 of the Egyptian constitution, which states that all forms and types of arbitrary forced displacement of citizens shall be prohibited. It also contradicts the Un habitat's criteria, highlighting that participation of the population and the assistance granted are the main pillars contributing to the success of relocation projects (Elsheekh et al., 2021).

This gives insight that forced eviction, the most commonly practiced urban resettlement policy in Egypt, violates human rights and reflects the state's arbitrary enforcement of the rule of law. This situation has forced Egypt to rank 77 out of 128 countries on the global property rights index (which ranks performance based on the rule of law, political instability, and control of corruption). In particular, Egypt's ranked 110 out of 113 countries in the rule of law. This rank comes close to the bottom compared to the counties sated in the list (Shawkat, 2020, p 176).

**Governmental assistance to citizens**

The discrepancy between the citizens and government representatives was recognizable when the assistance level was addressed in the relocation process. Public officials announced that all the designated institutions were keen on assisting citizens until they reached their new destination. It was reported that facilitating all the logistical means to reach the location and aiding the citizens to collect their belongings and evict their homes. Moreover, governmental officials admitted that house registration was perfectly managed, and those who were evicted were provided their housing units in no time. However, the citizens declared they were subject to brutal eviction forces and faced bureaucracy and complexity of procedures. The citizens also criticized the government for complicating the registration procedures and prohibiting other affected families from receiving their housing units.

"The registration process was heartbreaking, and it took a long time. The representatives requested obtaining Identification cards as a prerequisite for registering. In fact, most of us have been living here for decades, and most of us do not obtain an identification card. Accordingly, it took us weeks to apply for ID to guarantee eligibility for the new apparent.” (Asmarat citizen 2, 8 November 2021)

The process of receiving housing units was also troublesome, as stated below

"It is worth mentioning that the process of receiving the apartments was a complete mess. Some families were left in the streets for days. Other low-income families
did not have identification cards, so obtaining an apartment was delayed until receiving an ID card. Some people protested in front of the governorate's buildings, and it took weeks to help the people to have just a shelter." (Asmarat citizen 3, 8 November 2021)

A third interviewee added that process was managed chaotically, and she criticized the government for ineffectively managing their crisis and improperly planning the whole process.

"It took more than ten days to prepare the documents. We were allowed to stay in the red crescent tents till obtaining the documents. Also, this point was not correctly calculated, simply because the number of tents was less than the number of families left homeless.'’(Asmarat citizen 3, 8 November 2021)

The interviewees added that the government deceived them and gave promises that had never been fulfilled. They stated that the government promised complete ownership of the new apartments subject to signing the documents. However, they blame the government for deceiving them, as they are illiterate and were forced to sign documents without being able to acknowledge what these documents include. Afterward, they realized they had signed an allocation form, which states that the unit is allocated for a specific individual who has the right to use the unit only, without selling, renting, or inheriting it.

"We were obliged to sign documents we do not know what it entails. The government stated that it works on our behalf, and we are signing documents of ownership. However, this was not true; we were not granted ownership of these apartments. We were completely deceived. We are illiterate. The majority cannot read or write. They used our stamps and signatures just to kick us out of place. They said that these documents ensure our ownership, but it was just a legal document that stated that we are using the apartments and have no right to sell them in the future.'’ (Asmarat citizen 1, 8 November 2021)

However, governmental officials justified this process by stating that the citizens were taking advantage of the situation. At the early stages of the eradication process, people started collaborating, aiming at receiving extra residential units. The citizens started notifying their extended family members, even those who were living in different governorates, to benefit from the situation. They added that certain families provided fake documents to guarantee their ownership, and thus they asked for extra apartments. Officials added that outsiders claimed to own apartments in Manshaiat Nasser and claimed their right to own new apartments in the Asmarat complex.

Moreover, the government was blamed for not providing the proper assistance for the relocated inhabitants. Contradictory to what has been announced in the media showing the level of assistance
provided during the relocation, Citizens struggled to manage their belonging and find proper means of transportation to let them reach the new location. People struggled to reach the new location, and the representatives guided them with their apartments and housing blocks.

"In terms of assistance, minimal help was provided to reach the location. They stated in the news that the government provided us with specialized vehicles to collect our belongings and reach the new destination. However, few families were assisted. After hearing the unpleasant stories of our neighbors whose items were lost and stolen, I personally rented a large vehicle to move my belongings." (Asmarat citizen 1, 8th November 2021)

This feeling of vulnerability has been linked to their loss of assets and houses without having the proper compensation. The citizens mentioned that they were not sufficiently compensated for the loss of their places. The compensation itself has been described as either impractical, insufficient, or does not exist at all.

"There was no government assistance at all. They imposed various predicaments to make the situation more complicated. According to the financial reward, in the beginning, they promised to receive 100 thousand pounds as compensation for losing our units that incur additional revenues. In reality, we haven't received anything as compensation. They claimed that having a fully furnished apartment is the reward. I heard lots of rumors regarding this issue. For example, I have some close relatives who used to live in the Maspiro triangle, they were given a choice either to be financially rewarded or to be relocated, but in our case, we were not given this opportunity." (Asmarat citizen 1, 8th November 2021)

This means that the owners faced the risk of losing their properties without being adequately compensated. The provision of financial assistance was not clear; as stated above, granting financial assistance differed according to different contexts. This fact has affected the owners seeking status improvement by obtaining an asset that might incur additional revenues in the future. On the contrary, the renters might have been given a better housing option that did not impose any potential financial loss or a threat of losing their fixed assets.

**Infrastructure**

Infrastructure is one of the main aspects that the citizens perceive regarding the new housing standards. In Manshiaat Nasser, water, sanitation, and electricity were among the major weaknesses that required frequent upgrades and maintenance. Nonetheless, at the early stages of the Asmarat project implementation, it was noted that infrastructure was not properly installed, and consequently, the individuals were encountering frequent problems having stable electricity and water connection.
"At the project's early implementation, the flow of water and electricity was very weak. We might stay for days without having a drop of water. We cannot prepare food or even wash our hands. Now, as the fazes of the project were finalized, the situation is much better. There is frequent electricity and water flow. There is a sewage network allotted places to collect drainage and rainwater. The infrastructure here is much better. We wish we could have been provided with the same quality of infrastructure in our old locations." (Asmarat citizen 1, 8th November 2021)

All the respondents agreed that the infrastructure is a huge improvement, especially when compared with the old location, as noted

"The only advantage of the place is that the apartments are not prone to any natural disasters. Besides, there is a frequent water supply and properly established sewage networks, which were a major challenge in our previous location." (Asmarat citizen 2, 8th of November 2021)

It is visible from our walks in the neighborhood during the field visit that the infrastructure of the new building, including water pipes and electricity networks, are frequently maintained. No wall cracks exist, which means that no water leakage occurs, and frequent maintenance is provided. Meanwhile, citizens did not complain about any ongoing electricity network problems. However, the only complaint was pertaining to the weak mobile network coverage, which is planned to be fostered by one of the well-known operating mobile network companies. Likewise, it was attempted to detect the relocated dwellers' perception of flat size vis-a-vis family members. The majority of the dwellers shared their discontent regarding the flat size. It was noted that the citizens complained about the inadequacy and misappropriation of the residential unit, which was smaller than the previous rooms or apartments they lived in before eviction.

"I was living in a 65-meter apartment. Although the size was not that big, it was sufficient. in fact, the apartments in el Asmarat are only 45 meters sized, which is considered too small for a family consisting of 7 members to live in." (Asmarat citizen 1, 8th of November 2021)

Here, it is obvious that the urban planners aimed to provide a safe shelter without considering family sizes. In the old location, residents considered the open spaces in front of their houses as an extension to their rooms where they can practice their daily activities and communicate with neighbors.
At the same time, the citizens shared their concerns regarding the quality of furniture and equipment. The citizens added that the furniture quality is very low, and the electric equipment requires continuous maintenance, which requires an additional expense.

"The furniture quality is too low, there are lots of cracks in the furniture, and the electric equipment is not properly working. Even other utilities need frequent maintenance that requires additional costs." (Asmarat citizen 3, 8th of November 2021)

Here, all respondents admitted that the infrastructure is much better, especially compared to their old locations. However, the size and quality of the units granted in the new location were the areas of their concern. Although the size of their old rooms or apartments was not bigger, the furniture quality was not in at higher quality. However, the open spaces in front of the rooms were perceived as extra spaces for inhabitants. Besides, they announced that the quality and performance of their housing facilities and electric equipment were better in Manshaiat Nasser. Nevertheless, this might be backed by the fact that the citizens were not adequately aware of how to use the new appliances in the new location, which might be the reason for their frequent damage, which requires regular maintenance.

**Formalised ‘Informal’ Markets**

Informal markets were one of the major features that described the old location. Since 2011 political unrest, the number of informal markets started to grow haphazardly, and despite the informality of the markets, they were addressing all the citizens' demands. Conversely, the government properly regulates and manages markets in the new location to reduce informality's momentum. However, according to the citizens, governmental interference has negatively affected the operating markets, the quantity of the soled commodities, and the availability of these products.

"We are facing a huge problem finding proper markets selling products at low prices. For example, here in Asmarat, only one supermarket sells products that monopolize the market and impose high commodity prices. Additionally, only one place sells bread, and usually, the amount supplied is less than our demand." (Asmarat citizen 3, the 8th of November 2021)

In addition, the respondents clarified that they faced various problems in having an adequate service at a low price and are obliged to purchase the products at higher prices than the commodities in our old locations.

"The majority of the women got used to growing poultry in their homes, and it was either used or sold, but this practice is completely banned in the new location."
Likewise, various women were selling vegetables at a very low price. However, in Asmarat, we are obliged to buy them from specialized markets, which impose a very high price.’ (Asmarat citizen 1, 8th of November 2021)

The interviewees mentioned that they are facing a problem regarding the scarcity of food products. They also complained about the operating hours of the markets, which operate only for a couple of hours each day and close early.

"The services are scarce and operate at a specific time. For example, the only market closes at 4. Therefore, anyone who needs to buy anything should be there before 4. Not all the products exist in the markets, no places to sell subsidized products. We have to visit our old location to receive our share of the subsidized products." (Asmarat citizen 2, 8th of November 2021)

The citizens kept comparing the availability of markets in Manshaiat Nasser, versus their new location.

"Conversely, this was not the situation in Manshaiat Nasser, there are a variety of markets selling commodities, and the process there is attainable. You will find various alternatives in your location whenever you run out of any item." (Asmarat citizen 1, 8th of November 2021)

In conclusion, all the interviewed persons agreed that the food prices increased following the relocation, and the number of reachable markets decreased. This means that the inhabitants suffered from food scarcity and a remarkable increase in prices, which affected their livelihood conditions. It is a common symptom associated with forced relocation, where maintaining the same quantity of reachable markets requires further investments that might take years.

**Transportation and Mobility**

The absence of frequent public transportation is another added predicament the relocated citizens face. Despite the provision of public transportation, it is poorly connected to other suburbs and regions, and the inhabitants face difficulties getting outside the new location. Additionally, the project banned any other means of transportation from entering the location, which imposes additional transportation expenses on the individuals. Compared to their old location, the touktouk, and mini busses were affordable and convenient means of transportation. However, this transportation means never enters the Asmarat as the government controls transportation to decrease the level of chaos and informality, aiming to provide an organized community with advanced quality of living.
"Only public transportation exists here, and there are no other means of transportation. We are facing a severe problem in finding the optimum transportation facilities; the public transportation does not exist, and the other sources of transportation such as touktouk and mini vans are banned from entering the site, so we have to walk for miles to reach the nearest bus station, which is very hard for the older people. Usually, I cannot find any public transportation last time. I paid 30 EGP to meet one of my families in Manshiet Nasser." (Asmarat citizen 1, 8th of November 2021)

Similar to the operating timing of the markets, the bus station operates till a certain time in the afternoon, and the operating timings are not sufficient for working individuals, especially those working outside the location.

"The bus stations are located far away, and the last round for public transpiration ends at 10 pm, so any worker having a night shift might face a problem finding the proper transportation. Accordingly, he should incur an additional expense to find a private means of transportation". (Asmarat citizen 1, 8 November, 2021)

Dwellers raised concerns about the restricted means of transportation, which increased their sense of isolation. The residents were deprived of accessible transportation to connect the Asmarat neighborhood with the external environment. However, this control is a part of a governmental initiative to mitigate any informality in the new housing project.

Health Infrastructure

Inside the location, a medical service is designed to address the citizens' health concerns. The medical centers target the needs of the citizens. It usually provides daily health assistance such as medications, prescriptions, and vaccinations at no cost. However, the respondents said that the medical center is not fully equipped and always lacks professional doctors. Thus, they call for more fully equipped medical centers and government hospitals to provide more assistance to its inhabitants.

"Even the medical center is not properly operating, and there are always facing deficiencies in the materials and the doctors there. For example, during the pandemic, one of the neighbors here was severely affected by covid-19, and the medical center was not capable of providing her with medical assistance. We also faced a problem having an ambulance to send her to the approximate hospital. However, due to the lack of medical care, she was sent to one of the governmental hospitals located on the 6th of October." (Asmarat citizen 3, 8th of November 2021)
Education Services

The new location includes newly established schools to address the educational needs of the inhabitants’ children and alleviate their living standards by receiving a better education. The government inaugurated three governmental schools in Asmarat. However, the schools lacked professional cadres, and the citizens were obliged to provide additional private lessons as no other option was available for their children. Some residents cannot afford this for their youngsters, and consequently, their children opt out of school and decide to discontinue their education due to costs that the government schools incur.

"Similarly, is the situation of the government schools here. They are newly inaugurated; however, the students do not receive the proper educational assistance due to the lack of teachers in the schools. During the pandemic, the students have been left without education for months, affecting their quality of education. "(Asmarat citizen 1, 8th of November 2021)

"My three children used to go to the schools in Manshaiat Nasser. They were facing a problem acquiring knowledge due to the number of pupils in the same classroom. Also, the schools need to be upgraded. Conversely, here in Asmarat, the schools are newly inaugurated with better facilities. However, the government hasn't provided sufficient teachers, and students must take private lessons. Honestly, we cannot afford that, so some children prefer to support their families by finding job opportunities instead. "(Asmarat citizen 2, 8th of November 2021)

One might say that the level of education remains stagnant in both locations. Despite the newly established schools and the adequate allocation of the student's number in schools, the educational system is not adequately operating due to the high number of students compared to the number of teachers hired by the ministry of education. Therefore, an urgent request is to appoint more teachers in the Asmarat schools to leverage the educational standards of the children living in the new project.

Lived Experiences of Relocation: Safety and security

Families who were relocated early complained about their new location's lack of security and safety. They recognized minimal governmental control over the lawbreakers and the other terroristic activities practiced by the Arab tribes living in this sphere of Mokattam hill.

"Our early relocation experience was not good. We experienced some illicit practices from some tribes living near the area. They requested 300 EGP from each family to keep us living safely, and we rarely found a police station to file a lawsuit against them. "(Asmarat citizen 1, 8th of November 2021)
Other citizens declared that the new location was much safer now when compared to Manshaiat Nasser. They stated that the government strictly controls the Asmarart; consequently, no low breakers exist. They stated that they felt insecure during the early project implementation; however, now they feel more secure. They also added that the situation was different in Manshaiat Nasser, as there were certain unreachable places habitable by low breakers, terrorists, smugglers, and drug dealers.

“Here, the government intervention has lessened these illicit practices of the drug dealers and terrorists. The citizen's feeling of insecurity is diminishing day after day. The Asmarat administrative council played a significant role in settling disputes and mitigating any unlawful act when witnessed.” (Asmarat citizen 2, 8th of November 2021)

Despite feeling safe and secure, the relocated inhabitants felt betrayed and deceived. They said they were settled in an organized community but are financially deprived and worse off. The citizens wish they could return to their old sites to lessen their additional financial obligations in Asmarat.

According to their first year of relocation, they were not required to pay any expenses, and later after, they received eviction warnings for not paying their monthly rental fees. The citizens have to pay a monthly rental fee amounting to 300 EGP, not including maintenance fees. Besides, they were requested to pay an amount of 4000 EGP as a subscription fee to receive the new apartment. In 2018 they found that they had to pay an accumulated lump sum as a late rental fee or they will be sent to jail. Accordingly, they protested to decrease the amount or pay in installments, announcing that the only source of income comes from the cash transfers of "Takaful and karama" which amounts range from 325 to 450 EGP.

"The government claimed that we will be granted complete ownership; afterward, they requested paying 300 EGP as monthly rental fees. In 2018, I received an invoice amounting to 2100 Egypt as a late payment, and we were obliged to pay them instead of being replaced or sent to prison. It demands 300 EGP per month from each apartment, with subscription fees that amount to 4000 EGP and 1800 EGP insurance. "(Asmarat citizen 1, 8th of November 2021)

The citizens argued that the perceived alternation of becoming legalized affected their impression of their location. The regulations of the new location put their livelihood conditions at risk. They suddenly have to abide by the new rules, bear certain duties and pay for the services they used to have without paying money in their old locations. This matter inevitably pushed the citizens to
find it difficult, less convenient, and more expensive than before, making them more eager to return to their old locations and live in the shakes again (Ndunui, 2013, p 10).

**Job opportunities and economic status**

In general, the live hoods of slum dwellers are highly dependent on their jobs, which generate daily incomes. Therefore, displacement and relocation were the major reasons for losing jobs and causing economic deterioration. This fact is not only linked to the loss of the practiced profession inside the location but also is liked to proximity problems incurred by citizens to reach their job location if it is practiced outside the location. On the contrary, the situation is much more problematic for those working in the demolished areas, where it requires finding another job opportunity to maintain and rebuild the affected livelihood capital.

"We are left jobless in the new locations. We are relocated from where we used to work and where our informal markets and workshops exist. I used to own a car mechanic workshop. However, the workshop was abolished, and I have no other source of income. Honestly, my workshop was my primary source of income. I used to receive from 3000 to 7000 EGP per month and even more, but now the situation is worse, as I became jobless." (Asmarat citizen 1, 8th of November 2021)

Most relocated inhabitants used to work in workshops, minimarkets, garbage collection, or used to sell simple commodities in the street. However, when their place was demolished, they were negatively affected by losing the place where they lived and worked. Even after being relocated, they found themselves incapable of commissioning their jobs as the government was trying to control informality as it banned any practice without receiving permission and obtaining licenses. Therefore, the relocated inhabitants found themselves trapped in extreme poverty and unemployment without having any opportunity to maintain their previous economic situation.

"We are very talented. We have carpenters and expertized car mechanics, we are also experienced in all the handicraft projects, and the government can make use of us and help us either resume our professions or assist us in finding a fixed source of income. The situation is getting worse; the only income comes from the cash transfers we receive every month." (Asmarat citizen 1, 8th of November 2021)

"The government regulates everything, and accordingly, everything is banned. For example, my female family members were not working at workshops; however, there was an allotted place on the 1st floor of my apartment where we rented sewing machines and made clothes. After relocation, they cannot resume their project. Accordingly, we requested a place to resume our job, but the government rejected performing any profession, stating that this is an informal job and everything in Asmarat, should be regulated and formalized; they promised to help us find other
job opportunities, but still, nothing has happened. "(Asmarat citizen 3, 8th of November, 2021)

This means that the percentage of unemployed citizens has increased preceding the displacement. Therefore, creating and finding new jobs was difficult and required governmental approval, documents, and investments to operate formally in the new community.

"I was earning around 4000 EGP each month. I have zero income left in this new place, with no money and no opportunity to be employed. Still, we aim that the government will provide us at least with a decent job opportunity that can leverage our living standards or maintain the living standards that we were used to having in our old location." (Asmarat citizen 3, 8th of November 2021)

Fixed assets play an important role in securing the livelihood of dwellers, particularly those living in slums. It is almost perceived as a concurrent source of income that generates financial security in times of financial crisis and despair. Owners of houses, shops, and warehouses planned to secure their lives while having a fixed monthly income generated from rent. When houses were demolished, residents were left poorer since they not only lost their possessions, prospective investments, and places where they generated revenue, but they also lost a reliable source of income. When houses were demolished, their owners were forced to lower their living standards to pay for the new buildings' expenditures or become impoverished if they had no other source of income.

"How come I owned an apartment in my old location, and now I am paying rent? How come to own an asset, which used to generate income, and now I become financially deprived? How come to be well off in my old location, and now I am striving to live? Indeed, I lost my financial potential and became worse off." (Asmarat citizen 2, 8th of November 2021)

To conclude, the citizens admitted that relocation has negatively affected their working opportunities and economic status. This means a direct relationship exists between the impoverished financial situation and the loss of capital in the demolished houses used as a source of investment. At the same time, this direct relationship also exists in the loss of economic power in eliminating working spaces, which provided daily income for the workers.

Social cohesion and social bonds

People living in slums tend to create significant social networks and bonds, which have been created through decades and are fostered by deeply rooted cultural and spatial determinants. Since the spatial segregation, the social ties were torn, and the social fabric was aggressively devastated.
"The social ties and fabrics are entirely destroyed in the new location. Here, we did not know each other, we were apart, and each acted solely in this community. However, the matter was not similar to our days in our old locations." (Asmarat citizen 2, 8th of November 2021)

When the relocation took place, it did not consider the strong social ties established among individuals living in the same areas. Accordingly, the people had to deal with their new neighbors, who were perceived as strangers from different slum areas and shared certain beliefs that might be awkward to others. This has led to social dismantling and disarticulation, especially when the reciprocal relations between neighbors have been limited compared to their closed relations in the old location.

"In the new locations, there are a diversity of dwellers from Estable Aantar, Maspiro triangle, Ezbet el Haganna, and other informal areas in Cairo. All these locations possess their tradition and unique culture, which imposes various risks regarding collaborating and establishing new networks." (Asmarat citizen 1, 8th of November, 2021)

In the Asmarat project, the financial and social determinants were deeply affected as the citizens depended on their reciprocal relationships to create mutual self-help activities. Yet, the relocation process has scattered the citizens, and their relationships with neighbors are torn and completely messed up. Most of the dwellers were collaborating with their neighbors in certain informal businesses that generated adequate fixed income. Besides, their neighbors shared similar day-to-day activities in Manshait Nasser until it became a norm. On the contrary, this collaboration has been minimized, and their shared activities have been terminated as each individual indulged in the new environment and is trying to cope with the new determinants imposed by the new location. Therefore, they shared a strong feeling of detachment and grievances which was not perceived earlier in their old location.

"In our old location, we collaborated in our day-to-day activities, going to the merchants and buying our stuff together every day. Similarly, my wife was collaborating with one of our neighbors in sewing handmade clothes; they used to tailor and sell these clothes to the other neighbors. This rarely happens here in Asmarat. People are trying to establish new social networks to rebuild these fragmented networks, but it takes a very long time to get accustomed to the new neighbors." (Asmarat citizen 1, 8th of November 2021)

Also, a high level of collaboration exists among the neighbors of the old community. It has built a mutual trust which assists in creating flexibility and ease. This was apparent in the reciprocal favors
and care they shared, but when they were relocated, they felt social deprivation in finding support that helped them cope with challenging living conditions.

"In Manshaiat Nasser, we were supporting each other on all the occasions. For example, the house owner waived the rental fees for three months when my neighbor's husband passed away. We can buy items and pay later if we run out of money. Yet we were not neighbors. We were more than families. Here you cannot trust people, as you don't know their backgrounds, you have nothing in common, we did not share anything, there is no credit to depend on each other." (Asmarat citizen 3, 8th of November 2021)

Social fragmentation and lack of mutual trust have also created high-level social struggles rarely perceived in old locations. As a result, the citizens felt they had a negative perception of their new places and wished they had never abandoned their old places. Accordingly, the citizens are looking forward to living in a more social and collaborative environment, and they prefer returning to their old locations to regain their strong social bonds.

"Now, we always have trouble with the people in the new community. The people always fight together, and children usually do the same. People sometimes hire gangs to threaten each other. This rarely happened in Manshaiat Nasser." (Asmarat citizen 3, 8th of November 2021)

In conclusion, residents approved that the social aspect is an important part of their lives and as it is intertwined with their everyday activities. People get isolated when disconnected from their networks, and their livelihood gets affected, even if their physical conditions improve.

**Extra State-led Support in Asmarat**

In an attempt to address the complexities, the relocated citizens face, the government represented in the NCW has paid special attention to addressing the untacked socio-economic dimensions, especially among women and children. Certain apparent efforts included providing educational, health, and social assistance to narrow the perceived gap between the expected and the actual quality of living perceived by the relocated citizens.

"As a response to the deficiency of the educational cadres, the NCW started providing training courses for teachers. Teachers are provided training courses to be well equipped with the scientific methodologies needed to improve the student's skills and capabilities. Also, students are provided summer camps to increase their creativity and innovation" (NCW representative, the 29th of November 2021).

According to the health issues, the NCW representative added,
"The NCW is assisting at the health and medical level. We started to launch medical campaigns to detect breast cancer and support people with chronic diseases." (NCW representative, the 29th of November 2021).

According to the social support, the representative admitted

"We are trying to provide awareness programs for the citizens on how to interact in the new society community effectively. We provided them with special campaigns to abide by hygienic procedures to achieve sustainability. We also helped the citizens to obtain their ID to have an actual representation in elections and have an actual identity in society. We also launched certain campaigns to foster the relationship between the children and their family members to raise children with a high level of commitment and belonging to their family members and increase responsibility among parents." (NCW representative, the 29 of November 2021).

To this end, the government has exerted an effort to address the unmet requirements; however, the citizens claimed that these attempts have nothing to deal with the core problems they are experiencing in the new location. The situation was more complicated for most male breadwinners who were working in their old locations and striving to find another job opportunity in the new location. Accordingly, they demanded being considered when drafting relocation strategies. They also demanded waiving the incurred expenses and having a job opportunity to maintain better living standards.
6. CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSION AND POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1. CONCLUDING REMARKS

The significance of this paper lies in highlighting the gap between the commonly practiced relocation policies and the extent of alleviating the living standards while determining the socio-economic considerations of the evacuated families. It was found that legislating inclusive housing policies and improving the quality of life of slum dwellers have been one of the significant challenges governments in developing countries face. Being considered as misery traps governed by social disorder, dealing with slums has been a problem that has been subject to continual neglect, misappropriation, and denial from governmental officials. Nevertheless, exerted efforts across the past decades rested on abolishing and completely eradicating unsafe informal areas rather than deeply comprehending the main drivers that led to the growth of these haphazardly formulated settlements. However, since the eradication method proved to have negative repercussions on disrupting social life and fragmenting slum communities, it is still commonly practiced in most poor urban communities.

Developing countries, whose experiences were presented in the literature review, revealed that applying a one size fits all solutions approach is not ideal, as each case study has its embedded course of action that might differ when transferred to different contexts (Arimah, 2001). Even when successful practices occur, they cannot be adequately replicated as each case tends to be deeply rooted in its unique context (Satterthwaite, 2019). Nevertheless, presented experiences agreed that nothing should be made by force and that targeted communities have faced severe deterioration in their livelihood capitals when relocated. Moreover, global practices unleashed the fact that slum formulation is not an urban problem but a socio-economic problem that affects urban areas and is backed by improper policy formulation, discrepant policy design, and lack of communal participation (Ooi and Phua, 2007).

Meanwhile, by presenting and exploring the different practices across different continents, it was concluded that Egypt, with no exception, is facing intractable challenges that influence the sustainability of the abided slum rehousing projects. It has been mentioned that the Egyptian resettlement policies incorporate several drawbacks and pitfalls that became more obvious after the dweller's resettlement. The practiced policies demonstrate how slum issues are conceptualized as the result of an underlying socio-economic issue that has to be reframed and addressed in Egypt.
in an attempt to answer the proposed research question, it was discovered that police focused on morphological dimensions while ignoring social, environmental, and economic aspects. This demonstrated that relocation that the state policy has not introduced the required minimum standards to ensure the QOL and improve the livelihood conditions of the relocated inhabitants. However, it proved that certain indicators must be considered while implementing a resettlement project to maintain an adequate standard of human well-being (Arimah, 2010)

The case study of relocating citizens from Manshiaiat Nasser to Asmarat has proved the Government’s failure in dealing with the slum problem. The Government focuses only on informality’s shortcomings while failing to anticipate various interrelated considerations that represent the community’s actual needs. Moreover, it has been proven that instead of ameliorating their living conditions, the relocation increased poverty by ignoring the socio-economic background of its neighborhoods (Sabry, 2010). In fact, the governmental neglect of such aspects deprives the citizens of maintaining their previous economic and social status (Saad, 2020). Therefore, it was suggested that relocation should be held as the last option, and the citizens should be consulted and aware of the relocation process. The new locations should provide sustainable public services that meet the need of the residents, including affordable and proximate markets and means of transportation, better educational standards, including teacher coaching and mentoring, and better health standards, including equipped clinics, medical centers, and hospitals, with specialized personnel, and more importantly job opportunities that increase income generation. Therefore, it has been concluded that informal settlements in Egypt are tackled from the urban perspective, and there is a need for a holistic strategy to achieve comprehensiveness and sustainability (Sayed, 2020).

6.2. POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS

Monitoring the currently executed programs reveals complexities in determining the intervention tactics. Simultaneously, personal views of tenants and the practical experiences of end-users uncovered a wide range of ineffective development mechanisms that add tools to governmental accomplishments. Therefore, creating and managing a national slum rehabilitation project requires implementing an action plan that identifies programs, creates knowledge, and determines the potential costs and losses. Moreover, a comprehensive strategy is recommended to adequately address this situation and perfectly meet the previously ignored dimensions (Faramawy, 2013).
Therefore, creating a holistic strategy for unsafe slum areas should include some of the following elements.

6.2.1. **INSTITUTIONAL DIMENSION**

**A strategy for institutional and legal reform**

Without an affirming policy and legal framework and an enabling institutional setup, slum development efforts would fail. Therefore, to formulate a comprehensive national strategy that deals with slums, the projects should be endorsed by political and institutional support from the Government to all the involved parties (Habib, 2017, p82).

Egypt requires maintaining the political will and institutional support that makes the intervention more consistent and capable of achieving the required outcomes. Interventions are required not only at the project level but also at the local government level, where slum upgrading projects are coordinated and administered, and at the central government level, where budgets are allocated, and policies are formulated (Egypt's strategy in dealing with slums, 2014).

Furthermore, it is recommended that the role of local urban authorities should be altered to include guidance that depends upon the needs of urban people and respond to the new challenges they face. In this context, it is suggested to update the current planning framework to incorporate informal settlements and enable the dwellers to influence the decision-making process to have accurate and representative data to be utilized in adequate resource allocation and service distribution (Hegazy, 2016).

**Strategy for the decentralization of the decision-making process**

The strategy is concerned with the implementation of the national program of decentralization, which refers to an effective local authority and leadership capable of upgrading its technical capacities and able to manage resources to achieve sustainable development. Thus, upgrading informal areas necessitates local government empowerment so that decisions can be made closer to the affected individuals (HU, et.al, 2017). Decentralizing decision-making and resources from central to local governments allows policies to be more tailored to local demands resulting in more efficient and cost-effective development initiatives. Moreover, it is recommended that activities must be held in a degree of complementary among various levels in order to function as one strategic framework of action and provide the best outcomes (Abdel Halim, 2010).
Strategy for enhancing governance

Governance will encourage local Governments not just to abide by the rule of law that prevents informal establishments, but it will be supported by less bureaucratic management that will enable the process of establishing a responsive mechanism that records the requests of the marginalized groups. Consequently, this will lead to an apparent limitation of the slum development while it will tailor to the needs of the needy slum dwellers. (Habib, 2017).

Slum upgrading should also include the collaboration of the three segments of the society: the Government, private sector, and civil society sector. Besides, governmental stakeholders responsible for providing public services and promoting employment should collaborate in the formulation of the strategy. This collaboration should maintain accountability, transparency, and responsiveness to achieve the required sustainability governing slum upgrading projects. (Habib, 2017). It is also crucial to combat the previously achieved corrupt practices by enforcing the rule of law to guarantee fair practices and transparent responsiveness to the people's demands (Habib, 2017).

6.2.2. REGULATORY DIMENSION

Strategy for affordable housing

The inadequate human settlement planning has led to the exacerbated patterns of informal settlements. The major problem is that housing development has been left to market forces, which do not favor large-scale investments in affordable housing. Therefore, it has been argued that policies should be developed to provide affordable, legal, and appropriate housing to the poorest and the most vulnerable communities. Accordingly, the strategy should include a sustainable housing policy to offer a wider variety of housing options to match the diverse demands of marginalized and poor groups. Social housing projects should also consider the development of sustainable communities by enabling household individuals to generate income and access various housing solutions that suit the dwellers' needs (Egypt's strategy in dealing with slums, 2014).

Strategy for the provision of urban infrastructures and basic amenities

Slum rehabilitation projects entail bettering slum dwellers' living circumstances and providing convenient and accessible public services. Housing infrastructure needs are a crucial component of a sustainable community (Aziz and shawket, 2011). Therefore, community- and demand-led
approaches should be used to weigh on standards and service options to ensure acceptability and enhanced demand responsiveness. Besides, Government and urban authorities should support initiatives of slum organizations by adopting a more enabling approach to delivering basic services accessible to the poor through effective mobilization of community resources.

There are also special requirements that should be taken into consideration, including

- Urban planners and architects must adopt an ethnographic approach before their work. It should include documenting the dwellers' usage of physical spaces. It also should conceptualize how the social order is scaled up to form spatial patterns.
- Urban planners should conceptualize the underlying reason for creating informal settlements. Thus, they should comprehend the demographics of the informal settlements and anticipate their basic needs (Vahapoğlu, 2019).

This necessitates a well-coordinated effort to integrate multi-sector interventions into slum upgrading or redevelopment, eventually leading to sustainability due to the complementarities of social, economic, and environmental improvements.

**Strategy for economic inclusion and finding job opportunities**

An effective strategy has to address urban poverty, the lack of accelerated economic growth, and income inequality. It is also detrimental to tackle the geographical poverty distribution and how it is associated with different substandard and impoverished housing conditions. It is suggested to provide a new shelter accompanied by a decent source of income that will assist in maintaining upscaled living standards. It is also important to acknowledge the relationship between the dependent and independent variables, which depicts the relation between finding job opportunities and living in a new location, and how each variable can affect the other. Thus, different governmental agencies (such as the ministry of social solidarity, the ministry of the labor force, the ministry of economics, the ministry of investment, and other designated institutions and ministries) should collaborate to either provide an opportunity to commence their old practices in an organized and formal manner or assist them in finding an alternative job opportunity (Assaad and Rouchdy, 1999).

6.2.3. **FINANCIAL DIMENSION**

**The strategy of finding finance schemes for informal settlements upgrading**

(108)
The current slum development financing model is that the central Government, through ISDF, supports the governorates with loans that are supposed to be returned by slum development revenue. While this approach may work in some situations, alternative financial models are required, particularly if slum inhabitants become integral to the development process.

External and internal resources should be integrated into a strategic approach to dealing with slums, and treatments should be proposed in which both resource inputs complement each other. This necessitates mediation to bridge the trust gap between slum inhabitants and outsiders, as well as finding means for governmental and nonprofit groups to pool resources and collaborate in the implementation of slum development projects (Egypt's strategy in dealing with slums, 2014)

6.2.4. PARTICIPATORY DIMENSION

Strategy for using streets as drivers of slum development and upgrading

It claims that a street-led approach to slum upgrading offers a feasible solution for achieving the citywide slum upgrading target by gradually integrating slum settlements into the urban fabric. Streets have been used as natural conduits for providing services and enabling the movement of people, products, and services in slum improvement operations worldwide. However, their critical role as a public good, where social and economic activities are identified, supported, and facilitated, has not been well included in programs. Neither have streets been effectively used to integrate slums with the city in terms of social, economic, or geographical integration (Ali, 2020). Accordingly, Streets in this strategy are used not only as a physical entity for mobility and accessibility but also as a public good and a public realm where social, cultural, and economic activities are defined, reinforced, and facilitated (Acioly, 2012).

Strategy for enhancing community participation

Wide-ranging improvement in the livelihood conditions of the informal settlement's dwellers cannot be fully comprehended without their active participation. Therefore, enhancing participation, establishing mutual dialogues, and negotiating different options among citizens in the decision-making process should be highly prioritized to generate fruitful outcomes. Similarly, enabling slum dwellers to share their experiences and participate in the slum upgrading strategies is essential to reaching on-ground solutions that comprehensively tackle their conditions. In addition, introducing the "people-centric approach" should work in parallel with the consultancy
of the designated institutions, professional expertise, and local communities. Moreover, it should be held in a level of transparency and openness from both the people's and the Government's side.

Bottom-up decision-making is another effective slum-upgrading practice that takes place at the level of the individual community. Decentralized, bottom-up techniques may be small-scale at first, but if effective, they may significantly impact government policy. Implementing participatory rural appraisal techniques that empower local communities has demonstrated the success of 'bottom-up' projects. Such community-based approaches may be more participatory, have strong local networks, and understand the real needs of the poor, so they can also result in a sustainable upgrading project (Cronin and Guthrie, 2011).

The inclusion of the rights-based approach (people-centric approach)

Slum redevelopment strategies should be tailored according to the dweller's needs and aspirations. Then, a developing country like Egypt should prioritize the rights of the citizens living in informal settlements by advancing the 'rights-based approach, and it should include the following:

- The right to access decent housing and ensure the rights of receiving adequate, safe, and affordable housing with basic services to slum dwellers (as endorsed in the Egyptian constitution article #68, millennium development goal # 7, and the sustainable development goal #11) (Habib 2017)
- Preserving the right of securing tenure and upgrading its basic infrastructure while maintaining access to government services.
- Granting the citizens, the right not to be remotely displaced. This guarantees the application of the necessary measures in integrating the citizens' socio-economic practices
- The right to receive public services according to the national standards
- The right to integrate slum dwellers into the city's society and economy, ensuring their inclusion and connection to livelihood sources
- Ensuring their rights to maintain their livelihood conditions thought preserving productive activities (Egypt's Strategy for Dealing with Slums, 2014)
REFERENCES


Abdel-Irahman, A. S., and El-khateeb, SamahM. (2016,). Article_89852_1c2a895bdd17ad0a93ff6665b4f72670.pdf. Retrieved October 27, 2021, from https://jur.journals.ekb.eg/article_89852_1c2a895bdd17ad0a93ff6665b4f72670.pdf


Abouelmagd, D., and Abouelmagd, S. (2014). Accessibility to livelihood resources in the Egyptian housing upgrading program, the rehabilitation approach verses the eviction approach, The Case studies of Suzan Mubarak Public Housing project in Manshiet Nasser and Nahda City in Cairo. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/309148570_Accessibility_to_livelihood_resources_in_the_Egyptian_housing_upgrading_program


Boukhari, J. (2022). In Egypt, ambitious redevelopment projects are forcing thousands of residents from their homes. Equal Times. https://www.equaltimes.org/thousands-of-egyptians-are-being


(114)


Gamal el dine, A. (2016). Model of sustainable development in corporate social responsibility in Egypt, 118. from https://fount.aucegypt.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1312andcontext=etds


Klein, M. E. (2020). Discarding the “Garbage City”: Infrastructures of Waste in Cairo, Egypt, 96. From https://digitalcommons.bard.edu/senproj_s2020/206


Narayanan, V. (2019,). For resettled residents of Chennai, distance and poor quality of homes continue to be issues. The Hindu. Chennai., 2022, from https://www.thehindu.com/news/cities/chennai/for-
resettled-residents-of-chennai-distance-and-poor-quality-of-homes-continue-to-be-issues/article30394617.ece


(120)


(121)


Seetharaman, B. (2016). Sampling and methods of data collection in qualitative research. *Indian Journal of Continuing Nursing Education, 17*(2), 41. From https://www.ijcne.org/article.asp?issn=2230-7354;year=2016;volume=17;issue=2;spage=41;epage=47;aulast=Seetharaman;type=0


Tadamun. The New Urban Communities Authority—Tadamun., from http://www.tadamun.co/?post_type=gov-entityandp=10150andamp;lang=enandlang=en#.Ylksu5HMLIU


(124)


(126)
APPENDICES

APPENDIX 1: INTERVIEW GUIDES FOR PARTICIPANTS

Urban Policymakers

Q1-Since you are working in a considerable institution that works with informal settlements, please let me know your position and role in this institution, and what is the role of your institution in dealing with informal settlements in Egypt, and what does it entail in the policymaking process?

Q2-what are the types of policies that exist and abided by your institution in dealing with informal areas experienced in greater Cairo?

Q3- How are policies that deal with managing informal settlements are designed, and who is the designated person or institution that makes the final decisions; is there a disconnect between national and local, why and how?

Q4- How has the implementation been done on real-life experiences (what succeeded what failed)? Is there any further room for improvement?

Q5-How your institution helped ameliorate the living standards of slum dwellers living in greater Cairo and particularly those living in Manshiaiat Nasser?

Q6-what is the feedback on these policies from the citizens and the bureaucracy, and how is this feedback incorporated (or not)?

Q7-How do you see the policies that deal with the informal settlements and slum areas going on? What are your reflections and opinions at the end?
Interview Guide for Citizens Manshaiat Nasser and Asmarat

Manshaiat Nasser

Q1- Since you have been living in Manshaiat Nasser for consecutive decades till now, let me know your feeling towards the place in terms of (location, demographics, environment, social networking, and services) and have you ever planned to abandon the location, and search for a more privileged one?

Q2- what are the strengths or opportunities of Manshaiat Nasser that make it a desired location for its citizens?

Q3- From your point of view, what are the threats or weaknesses of the location that requires further improvement?

Q4- what are the apparent governmental attempts practiced in Manshaiat Nasser since the Dweika crisis? Do these practices seem fruitful? Please let me know why.

Q5- From your perspective, let me know the most disadvantaged places in the area that require government assistance and the reasons that make it the least privileged areas in your location?

Q6 -Some people have been relocated to Asmarat city, why have you decided to stay here? I mean, what are the factors or the conditions that determine your decisions to leave or stay in your location in the future?

Q7- How many people do you know that moved to Asmarat? Why? What are the general feelings toward the government policy of relocation?

Asmarat Residents

Q1 -please let me know about yourself and the experience of relocation to el ‘’Asmarat city’’

Q2- Can you share with us how you were notified about the resettlement process? And the process you went through while being relocated.

Q3-Did you agree on the eviction and settlement decisions? Were you part of the decision-making?

Q4-Did you receive any governmental assistance throughout the relocation process? Have you been financially rewarded for leaving your old location? Does the government impose any financial burden?
Q5- from your point of view, what is the major advantage- disadvantage perceived by the relocated inhabitants in El Asmarat project in terms of (family needs, quality of services, and job opportunities)?

Q6-Are there any new challenges you are facing in the new location in terms of the social fabric in particular? For example, did you have neighbors who moved with you to the new location? Who are your new neighbors, do they collaborate and cooperate? Is there any collective action in place if they have demanded from the government?

Q7-From your point of view, what do you suggest for the new location to be a comprehensive project and ameliorate any deficiencies experienced?

Interview Guide for Civil Society Organizations

Q1- please let me know more about the background and the scope of your NGO. How can you categorize the work in informal areas, and what are you aiming to achieve?

Q2-what policies by the government had affected the work in the area, and how? How do you perceive the policies related to slum upgrading in general and resettlement in particular? How do you see the role of the government, is it complementary or filling the gaps?

Q3- what are the community development goals achieved or planned to be achieved by your NGO in Manshaiat Nasser. Do you collaborate with other NGOs to achieve the targeted goals?

Q4-How can the NGO support the vulnerable (unemployed, uneducated females, and female breadwinners) in Manshaiat Nasser? And how can the NGO provide the city dwellers with the required basic services (education, health, etc.) How do you impact people's lives?

Q5- what is the degree of success or failure perceived in providing the services needed to the city dwellers, and do the projects provided meet the actual objectives and needs?

Q6-what are the constraints faced by dwellers in providing or securing their job opportunities and or practicing their professions in the location? Do any administrative, legislative, educational, or transportation constraints occur?
APPENDIX 2: STATE APPROACH TO DEVELOP MANSHEYET NASSER

Source: A satellite image generated by scale for communities’ design in a collaboration with the Ministry of Urban Planning and the Informal Settlement Development Fund (ISDF), in an attempt of preparing a holistic strategy that addresses the best approach to develop “Mansheyt Nasser as a slum area”.

(130)
APPENDIX 3: FIELDWORK MATERIAL

Source: Taken by the author during the field visit in Manshaiat Nasser. The areas in the first picture show the riskiest areas in Manshiat Nasser, with a high probability of collapse. At the same time, the areas in the second picture showed the location of the Dweika rock fall, which took place in 2008 and was subject to complete eradication.

Source: Taken by the author during the field visit held in Asmarat. The pictures above show the quality of buildings and infrastructure (neat and safe homes and wide paved streets for riding bicycles). The second picture shows an organized market that operates within fixed working hours inside the new location.
APPENDIX 4: COMMUNITY PERSPECTIVES ON RELOCATION

Taken from the Arab Reform Initiative (ARI) article on community relocation in the Maspero Triangle.

No for eviction yes for upgrade

Source: Urban Rights and Local Politics in Egypt: The Case of the Maspero Triangle – Arab Reform Initiative (arab-reform.net). The picture reveals an artistic protest of Maspiro triangle dwellers stating ‘’NO for resettlement and eviction ‘’Yes for Insitu upgrade. This reflects that resettlement policies are not welcomed by dwellers living in all informal settlements across Cairo.
Appendix 5: comparison between Manshiaiat Nasser and the Asmarat project in achieving sustainability:

(×) means does not exist (✔) exists (◙) inapplicable to the context

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sustainability of the project</th>
<th>Manshiaiat Nasser</th>
<th>Asmarat</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Economic pillar</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improvement of services</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proximity to markets</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutual help and support</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access to cheap food products</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stability and commitment</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic conditions</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source of income</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial loss</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban pillar</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of Residential buildings</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanitation networks</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of life</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
<td>☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒ ☒</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: a checklist created by the author to compare between Manshiaiat Nasser and Asmarat project in achieving substantiality.